

Black Men of the Classroom:

An Exploration of how the Organizational Conditions, Characteristics, and Dynamics in
Schools Affect Black Male Teachers'
Pathways into the Profession, Experiences, and Retention

Travis J. Bristol

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the
requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy
under the Executive Committee
in the Graduate School of Arts and Sciences

COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY

2014

ABSTRACT

Black Men of the Classroom:
An Exploration of how the Organizational Conditions, Characteristics, and Dynamics in
Schools Affect Black Male Teachers'
Pathways into the Profession, Experiences, and Retention

Travis J. Bristol

This is a study of teachers' experiences in organizations. In particular, this study explores the experiences that prompted Black male teachers to consider a career in teaching, the organizational conditions that influenced their workplace experiences, and the organizational dynamics that affected these teachers' decisions to stay or leave their current schools or the profession. Drawing on interviews from 27 Black male teachers across fourteen schools in Boston Public Schools, this study found that an early experience teaching influenced participants' decisions to enter the teaching profession. Findings from this study also suggest that the number of Black men on a school's faculty influenced participants' workplace experiences. Participants who were the only Black men on the faculty, or whom I describe as "Loners," faced greater challenges in navigating the organization when compared to participants in schools with many more Black male teachers, or "Groupers." Moreover, there was a relationship between the reasons participants cited for leaving, participants' actual decisions to stay or leave, and organizational characteristics. Loners stayed. Groupers moved to other schools and some left teaching altogether. Loners cited the school's overall working conditions as their reason for staying, while Groupers described administrative leadership as their reason for leaving. This dissertation builds on the nascent literature that explores how organizational conditions, characteristics, and dynamics in schools affect the pathways into the profession, experiences, and retention of Black male teachers.

Table of Contents

List of Tables...v

Acknowledgements...vii

Dedication...ix

I. Introduction...1

- A. Calling Black Men to the Blackboard...1
- B. Reimagining The Culture of Schooling...2
- C. Recruiting Black Men to Teach...5
- D. Outline for Dissertation...9

II. Two Data Sets: The In School Experiences of Black Male Teachers...14

- A. Middle School Teacher Turnover Project...14
- B. Black Male Teacher Environment Survey (BMTES)...16
 - 1. Teacher Characteristics...17
 - 2. Relationship with the Organization...18
 - 3. Intentions to Stay/Leave...20

III. Review of the Literature...22

- A. Black Male Teachers: An Historical Narrative...22
- B. Empirical Claims for Increasing Black Male Teachers...24
- C. Challenges to a Black Male Teacher Recruitment Campaign...26
- D. Social and School Based Outcomes for Black Males...28
- E. Black Male Teachers and Social Distance...36
- F. Black Male Teacher Retention...40
- G. Workers and the Organization...42

- H. A Theory of Numbers and Group Composition ...42
- I. Expanding on Kanter's Conception of Tokenism...49
- J. Black Male Teachers: In the Classroom...66
- K. Research Questions...73

IV Research Methodology and Study Design...74

- A. Research Strategy...74
- B. Setting & Sample...77
- C. Method for Data Collection: Interviews and Observations...86
- D. Data Analysis...89
- E. Validity Threats...91
- F. Researcher Subjectivity...92

V Pathways into the Profession...94

- A. Early Experiences in Teaching...96
- B. Substitute Teaching...104
- C. Male Role Models of Color...107
- D. College Course...112
- E. Service Obligation...114
- F. An Ineffective K – 12 Teacher...115
- G. Societal Pressure...116
- H. State Teacher Examinations: A Constraint to Entering the Profession...116
- I. Summary: Influences and Barriers into Teaching...123

VI Within Skewed Groups: Loners and Groupers...125

- A. Toward a Theory of Social Isolation in Organizations...127

B. Groupers' Social Integration...	131
C. Loners' Social Isolation...	135
D. Summary: Social Isolations in Organizations...	142
VII Performance Expectations, Role Encapsulation, and Boundary Heightening...	145
A. Performance Pressure...	145
B. Job Crafting as a Response to Performance Pressures...	146
C. Boundary Heightening...	161
D. Content Knowledge...	162
E. Developing Coping Strategies....	165
F. Role Encapsulation...	171
G. Embracing Role of Behavior Manager...	172
H. Resisting Role of Behavior Manager...	173
I. Responses to Performance Pressures, Role Encapsulation, and Boundary Heightening...	181
VIII Reasons for Loners Staying and Groupers Leaving...	185
A. Why Loners Stay...	188
B. Status Quo Bias...	189
C. Why Groupers Leave...	193
D. Summary: On Staying and Leaving...	203
IX Significance and Implications...	205
A. Summary of Findings...	205
B. Limitations...	213
C. Implications...	216
References...	220

Appendix A: Teacher Recruitment Letter...233

Appendix B: Teacher Interview Protocol #1...234

Appendix C: Teacher Interview Protocol #2...238

Appendix D: Contact Summary Form...244

Appendix E: Cross-Walk Table...245

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1: Type of Teacher Certification Program...18
Table 2.2: A Student in Boston Public Schools...18
Table 2.3 Attempts needed to pass the MTEL...18
Table 2.4: Experience Teaching in a BPS Turnaround School...18
Table 2.5: Improved Instruction by Learning from and Analyzing Practice...19
Table 2.6: Teachers of Color Have Opportunities to Influence School Policy...19
Table 2.7: White Teachers Have Opportunities to Influence School Policy...19
Table 2.8: Being Black Causes People to Fear Me...20
Table 2.9: Desire to Remain in School Despite Opportunity to Find Another Job...20
Table 4.1: 2011 - 2012 Distribution of Black Male Teachers Across Grade Spans by Percentage...80
Table 4.2: 2013 BPS Schools that have 0, 1, or 3 or more Black Teachers Disaggregated by the Percentage of the Principal's Race...81
Table 4.3: 2012 -2013 Percentage of BPS Schools that have 0, 1, 2 or 3 or more Black Teachers Distributed Across Grade Spans...82
Table: 4.4: 2012 – 2013 School Demographic Data for Sample Schools...85
Table 5.1: Participants' School, School Type, and Grade Level, and Content Area...94
Table 5.2: Influences for why Participants Decided to Enter the Teaching Profession...97
Table: 5.3: Participants' Success and Failure on Massachusetts Tests for Educator Licensure (MTEL)...117
Table 6.1: 2012-2013School Demographic Characteristics for Sample Schools...127
Table 6.2: Participants' Beliefs Around the Challenge or Ease of Being Around Colleagues...131
Table 6.3: Participants' School Name, School Composition and Descriptions of Social Integration...133

Table 6.4: Table 6.4: Participants' School Name, School Composition and Descriptions of Social Isolation...136

Table 8.1: Participant's Name, School Type, School Composition, Organizational Conditions Influencing Decisions to Stay/Leave, Choice to Engage in Job Search and Return to School the Following Academic Year...186

Table 8.2: Loners' Name, School Type, Factors Influencing Decisions to Leave and Reasons for Staying...191

Table 8.3: Grouper Movers and Leavers by School, School Type and Reported Reasons for Moving Schools and Leaving the Profession ...195

Acknowledgements

My grandfather, who had the equivalent of a sixth grade education, once said to me that if he had access to the kinds of schools that I had he would have earned his Ph.D. He transitioned on March 27th, 2014; this piece - this dissertation - is a testament to the fact that I continue to stand on the shoulders of my ancestors who sacrificed much, so that I could arrive to this point: Dr. Travis J. Bristol.

As a student at Teachers College, Columbia University, I have been blessed to come in contact with professors, specifically those on my dissertation committee, who have shaped my identity as a scholar. To my academic and dissertation advisor Carolyn Riehl - who provided important mentorship leading up to my dissertation and crucial feedback that challenged many working assumptions I had as I analyzed my data - thank you. To Yolanda Ruiz - who offered endless support in helping me articulate more clearly my research agenda and has modeled for me the kind of researcher I should become - thank you. To Aaron Pallas - whose tough questions encouraged me to think more deeply about the conclusions I've drawn from my data - thank you. To Carla Shedd - who pushed me to design a robust study that included many Black male teachers - thank you. And, to Luis Huerta - whose assistance in thinking about the policy implications for my work was vital to my broadening the influence of this dissertation - thank you.

Outside of Teachers College, Columbia University there were several professors at Harvard University who pushed my conceptual framework and analysis over the course of this project. To Ron Ferguson - whose monthly meetings started with "that does not make any sense" and ended with a roadmap of how to make sense of my

burgeoning theories— thank you. To Susan Moore Johnson – who welcomed me into her seminar class, introduced me to Kanter, and provided feedback on my interview protocols – thank you. To Ebony Birdwell-Mitchell – whose diagramming of my scattered ideas focused my analysis – thank you. And, to John Diamond – whose insightful questions pushed me to consider how this project could improve the lives of marginalized youth - thank you.

To each of the 27 participants in this study, I am honored that you shared your experiences, both joyful and painful, about being Black male teachers.

I am grateful to the National Academy of Education/Spencer Foundation, the Albert Shanker Institute, and both the Offices of the Provost and Diversity and Community Affairs at Teachers College, Columbia University for funding this dissertation.

Like my grandfather’s sacrifice, I am who I am because of the countless sacrifices my mother - a single-mother - made raising me and my two siblings: God heard and answered your prayers.

At my side through my tenure in graduate school was my life partner, wife, mentor, and friend, Tolani Britton. I am grateful, beyond words, for your constant support, particularly over the last academic year by providing me with time to write and revising what I wrote. #teamwork #makesthedreamwork.

And, finally, to my son, Peter Adjayi and daughter, Amelie Sybil, I trust that, one day, you will say you are who you are because of my countless sacrifices: It is to both of you that I dedicate the pages that follow.

#Hebrews 11:6

To: Peter Adjayi & Amelie Sybil

Chapter I

Introduction: Calling Black¹ Men to the Blackboard

At a college commencement ceremony in December, 2011, U.S. Secretary of Education Arne Duncan asserted: “Less than 15 percent of our teachers are Black or Latino. It is especially troubling that less than two percent of our nation's teachers are African-American males. Less than one in 50! It's unacceptable” (Duncan, 2011). Earlier that year, at Morehouse College, the nation’s only all-male historically Black institution, Secretary Duncan launched his Department’s Black male teacher recruitment campaign, “Black men to the Blackboard” (Graham, 2011).

One possible impetus for a recruitment campaign to increase the number of Black male teachers may be an attempt to redress the current social and educational outcomes of Black males in society. As one Department official attending the launch of the Black male recruitment campaign at Morehouse noted, “Faced with the startling fact that black males represent 6 percent of the U.S. population yet 35 percent of the prison population and less than 2 percent of teachers, I can’t help but think how far we have to go” (Graham, 2011).

The Secretary of Education’s 2011 Black male teacher recruitment campaign is not the first of its kind. From Minnesota’s “Men Teach,” Prince George’s County’s MEN (Men Equipped to Nurture), South Carolina’s Call Me MISTER (Men Instructing Students Toward Effective Role Models) (Chimelynski, 2006), Maryland’s African American Males into Teaching Program (AAMTP) (Howard University School of Education, 1999) and New York City’s Teachers As Leaders Program (TALP), local

¹ In this dissertation, I use the word Black to refer to all persons who belong to the African Diaspora

school districts and state departments of education have attempted to create innovative ways to increase the number of Black male teachers. However, what is new is the advocacy on the part of national policy makers, which may be a response to the nation's renewed interest in the current state of Black males.

Reimagining The Culture of Schooling

When I entered graduate school in 2009, I was interested, primarily, in researching school effects for Black boys. This interest was a result of my five years, 2004 – 2009, of teaching experience in two New York City public schools. In my third year of teaching at my first school, I began to realize that males - specifically Black and Latino - were disproportionately in the dean's office or receiving in-school suspension for "misbehaving". When I would inquire from the dean or the teacher who referred the young men for suspension, it was evident that, in many cases, disciplinary action should have been taken. While I questioned, at times, whether the offense was commensurate with the penalty, I was more curious as to why the young men who were well behaved in my class displayed such different behavior in other classes.

It appeared to me that with little provocation, my colleagues may have labeled these Black and Latino young men as delinquent believing that their presence in the classroom disrupted teaching and learning. This zero tolerance posture seemed to inflame the very behavior it was designed to redress. After atoning for their past missteps, the Black and Latino young men returned from the dean's office or from in-school suspension to classrooms where teachers still labeled them as delinquent; consequently, a revolving door between the classroom and a disciplinary site continued to characterize the experiences of a disproportionate number of our Black and Latino male students.

I knew that the Black and Latino male students were not completely resistant to school because down the hall, in my class, I saw little evidence of the misbehavior described in my colleagues' classrooms. As such, I wondered if these young men needed an experience that addressed their educational and social needs - real or perceived - as a way to facilitate academic success.

After identifying about 15 young men, approximately seven Black, five Latino, one Asian and one White, I created "Eviscerating Emasculation" (the, then, English teacher in me could not resist the assonant temptation). In the formulation of the afterschool program, my theory of action was that if I could somehow "change" these young men, they would behave appropriately in my colleagues' classrooms. Despite demonstrating that they had the ability to "behave" and be fully engaged in my class, there remained, at least in my mind, a belief that the way to improve particular school outcomes for my Black and Latino male students meant acculturating, or providing them with tools to navigate successfully through school.

One goal for the after-school program – as I articulated to students and parents – was to turn these "boys into men." Now, I recognize that the essentialist approach I took in defining masculinity probably had a deleterious effect on the sexual identity of some of the program's participants; however, I do believe that there were some positive aspects to the program that problematized the dominant narrative around what it meant to be Black or Latino in contemporary U.S. society.

Over the course of an academic year, I met with young men after school. Twice a month, we met at the school where we read and discussed Hill Harper's (2006) *Letters to a Young Brother: Manifest Your Destiny*. Our conversations centered on how an "urban"

male youth could navigate the challenges of sex, drugs, and living in a female-headed household. While the young men enjoyed the conversations, they especially looked forward to our experiential opportunities. Through personal networks, I asked “prominent” Black and Latino males to share their journeys, both personal and professional, with students (these sessions took place at the office sites of each speaker). Over the course of the year, students had an opportunity to meet Professor Pedro Noguera, then New York City Comptroller William Thompson, Former Mayor David Dinkins, and former president of the National Urban League, Hugh Price.

Several months into the after-school program, some of my colleagues would describe the qualitative difference they believed the program was making in the lives of students. One design of the program was to place participants within a context that would allow them to transition to “manhood”. However, in retrospect what I believe might have facilitated this “improvement” described by some of my colleagues was that, for the first time in our school, these Black and Latino males were in an environment that focused on their strengths (e.g. being able to question social constructs), rather than their perceived shortcomings. As such, when these students believed that adults would positively engage with them, they, in turn, positively engaged with school.

It is this re-imagination of the culture for the schooling experience of students, created through the afterschool program, which positively influenced the social interactions between many of the Black and Latino males in the program and their teachers. In time, however, my colleagues began to inquire what *truly* led to these improved outcomes? Though never explicitly stated, they intimated that my race and

gender, Black male, influenced some of the positive outcomes our young men exhibited. I, too, wondered: was my success attributed, solely, to being a Black man?

Recruiting Black Men to Teach

In 2007, a year after creating the program for young men, a college friend, who was then a vice-president of the Deutsche Bank of America Foundation, asked me to join the advisory board of a new initiative, Teachers as Leaders Program (TALP). Specifically, TALP's aim was to increase the overall percentage of Black male teachers in the New York City public school system. To do this, the initiative focused its efforts on recruiting Black male undergraduates within the City University of New York (CUNY) and providing tuition assistance, summer job placements and tutoring for the New York State teacher examinations. While never directly stated or discussed during advisory board meetings, the prevailing assumption that I operated under, and many board members I presume, was that the presence of Black male teachers could serve as one policy lever that would improve the academic outcomes for Black boys. As Cohen & Ball (1999) suggest, learning happens as students interact with teachers and content. Central in this current iteration of school reform is the belief that school improvement efforts must begin, first, by a reexamination of what happens in schools. As such, individuals within this philanthropic organization believed that in strategically placing Black men in classrooms, as teachers, we might begin to observe Black boys' increased learning. This theory of action was based on some of the burgeoning research that linked improved learning outcomes for boys to having a male teacher (Dee, 2004).

Simultaneously, my colleagues and I at the second high school in which I taught were engaged in a similar conversation of how to increase the number of Black male

teachers on the faculty. At that time, two of the 30 teachers on staff were Black men: I was in the English department, my other Black male colleague in the physical education department. Then, much of the discussion around the need to recruit more men, specifically Black men, to the staff was based on earnest attempts to increase learning among males. Much of our discussion, in which I played an integral role in advancing, centered on students' deficits. We believed our Black boys' lack of role models in the media and in their community, for example, influenced their academic performance in school. If only we could get more Black men in academic positions rather than as safety officers, deans, physical education teachers, we would have found the elixir able to reverse the negative academic trends evidenced by our male students – or so we thought.

Missing from our conversation was an examination of how we, as educators, might be complicit in our boys' academic performance. Through later course work, I learned about Lee and Smith (1999) who posit that academic press, or “teachers' expectations for student performance” (p. 913), can lead to increased learning. After empirically testing this hypothesis using student and teacher survey responses alongside reading and math standardized test scores, Lee and Smith (1999) find that “school academic press has positive and significant effects on learning in both subjects” (p.930). As we observe from these findings, students, on average, internalize their teachers' learning expectations and perform accordingly.

I wonder if much of our discussion placed too much emphasis on thinking about what our boys lacked and little, if at all, on what we, as teachers, did not provide. My colleagues and I rarely discussed pushing our students. We never considered how teachers' inability to create high cognitive demand tasks influenced the academic

outcomes observed among our male students. In our school, which I think might be the case in many schools attempting, with great sincerity, to improve learning for boys, we focused on an aspect of organizational functioning we could control, hiring. We had more capacity to expend our energy on actively recruiting Black male teachers and inviting them, during their school visits, to meet with other boys than working with teachers on practice. While I am unsure if we even had the knowledge base to assist teachers in thinking about how to engage male students, we did not have the human capacity to create continued professional development opportunities to work with teachers on how they might organize their classrooms for academic press. What might it mean to develop tasks that require high cognitive demand? How does an administrator help teachers believe all students are capable of learning? Very few individuals in my school had the capability to answer these questions. Instead, the one resource we provided to teachers was to heighten control over students.

One instructional tool that was ubiquitous in my school was the worksheet. For classes in general, and to redress behavioral issues, specifically, administrators encouraged, and at times mandated, the use of worksheets. The idea was that if students were focused on one task that disallowed them to move around the room, they would be more engaged. McNeil (1998) discusses how, in responding to administrators' edicts to increase the class pass rate, teachers "maintain tight control over course content. Rather than allow students to be actively involved in gathering and interpreting information, they...reduce presentations to lists of terms..." (p.334). Unfortunately, what probably happened in many classrooms was the strategy used to reengage boys and increase learning only served to exacerbate the growing divide between overall academic and

behavior performance between male and female students. As such, ideas around boys' "natural" disposition to be disengaged in schools were only reified after teachers tried and were unsuccessful at designing curriculum that would engage them.

In the next academic year, we hired two Black men in the science and social studies departments. And, of course, boys continued to under-perform and exhibited, on average, many of the same behavioral and academic challenges from the previous year. I then began to question if human resource policy levers (Cohen, Raudenbush, & Ball, 2003) on their own, such as recruiting Black men, were enough to improve learning outcomes for Black boys. My work in advising a Black male teacher recruitment campaign and playing an integral role for such an initiative within my former school made me wonder if there was a need to decouple recruitment campaigns, based on teacher characteristics, from policy levers aimed at increasing student outcomes.

Nonetheless, the idea of increasing the numbers of Black male teachers still seemed appealing and reasonable. It would be useful for Black boys to see Black men represented in many ways, particularly in the areas which they struggled the most (e.g. core subjects). However, merely hiring Black men and believing their presence would be the elixir to improving the academic for Black boys seemed problematic. I wondered if allowing Black male teachers to be uniquely responsible for the most challenging students could have the unintended effect of making these teachers leave. Was it simply about recruiting? Or, was it more about the conditions under which Black male teachers taught that influenced their experiences in the organization? After hiring two more Black male teachers, our school did little to support these teachers. We believed that surely these Black men did not need any assistance with the Black boys in their class because,

of course, all Black boys needed were Black male teachers and then their social and learning outcomes would change. Reflecting on the challenges that these two new Black male teacher recruits exhibited, I became curious about the relationship between how schools recruited and tried to retain Black men as teachers.

Outline for Dissertation

After developing preliminary understandings from two research projects - the Research Alliance for New York City Schools Middle School Teacher Turnover project and the 2012 Black Male Teacher Environment Survey, I began to formulate some initial questions about Black male teachers.

Chapter Two focuses on the two data sets used to inform my research questions. I begin by discussing findings from my research assistantship with the Research Alliance for New York City Schools on its Middle School Teacher Turnover project. I describe how the Latino and Black male teachers appreciated serving as role models to their Black and Latino boys; however, these teachers also believed that they were disproportionately saddled with the responsibility of improving the learning outcomes for these students. From this finding that appeared to suggest teachers of color felt pressured to increase achievement for the boys of color in their schools, I developed the Black Male Teacher Environment Survey (BMTES) for Boston public schools (BPS). My analysis compared item responses from “Loners,”² or those respondents who are the only Black men on their faculty to Groupers, to respondents in schools with three or more Black male teachers.

² The term Loner is typically used to refer to persons who voluntarily remove themselves from social interactions. However, in this study I am appropriating this term, to the field of organizational theory, to characterize participants who are the only Black men on their school's faculty. In this dissertation, the term Loner conveys a dimension of how these participants choose to engage other members of the organization, as well as how other members in the organization choose (or do not choose) to engage them.

Specifically, I observed that a Black male teacher's group composition - whether he was a Loner or a Grouper - characterized some of the more distinct differences in the ways Black men experienced the school organization.

In Chapter Three, I begin by providing an historical narrative of Black male teachers. I then review the literature of Black male teachers and the theoretical underpinnings that may inform a Black male teacher recruitment campaign. I draw attention to social distance (Simmel, 1950) or the idea that Black men are uniquely positioned to understand and respond to the needs of Black boys. Next, I describe some of the social and school based outcomes for Black males that may have precipitated the need to create a Black male teacher recruitment campaign. I then explore some of the critiques of a Black male teacher recruitment campaign and shift to an inquiry of why Black men leave the classroom. Ingersoll and May (2011) found that minority male teachers, most of whom were Black, were more likely to move to other schools than teachers from other sub-groups. I use Rosabeth Moss Kanter's (1977) Theory of Numbers and Group Composition to explore the effects on persons in an organization who are in the numerical minority. Specifically, I draw attention to occupations such as male nurses, flight attendants, and teachers and female police officers and doctors. I end the chapter with a discussion of the burgeoning research on Black male teachers.

In Chapter Four, I describe how the qualitative method I employ allows me to answer my four research questions. Specifically, I illustrate why a phenomenological approach (Creswell, 1998; Denzin & Lincoln, 2005; Patton, 1990) is an ideal research strategy to assist my understanding of how the in-school organizational conditions influence the pathways into the profession, experiences, and retention of Black male

teachers. Next, I explain that my methods for collecting data, interviewing (Seidman, 2003) and observing (Creswell, 2007; Gold, 1958) Black male teachers are well-suited to explore what my participants think and how they interact with members in the organization. In my data analysis section, I describe how the process of analyzing my data, particularly the first wave of interviews, informed my continued data collection (Miles & Huberman, 1994), or the second wave of interviews. Specifically, I illustrate how etic coding informed my theoretical framework, and emic coding provided an opportunity to add to my theoretical framework. Moreover, I describe how I allay concerns regarding researcher subjectivity. Finally, I conclude the chapter by discussing the study's limitations.

In Chapter Five, I discuss influences on Black male teachers' pathways into teaching. Participants in this study were most likely to suggest having an early experience teaching as one influence on their decisions to become teachers. More than half of all participants believed that an opportunity to teach when in high school, college, after college, or substitute teaching facilitated their choice to enter the teaching profession

In Chapter Six, I expand on Kanter's (1977) framework that examines the representation of social categories (e.g. race and gender) in organizations across four group types: uniform, skewed, tilted and balanced. According to Kanter (1977), the ratio of members in the numerical majority to those in the numerical minority can be expressed by the following - uniform groups, 100:0; skewed, up to 85:15; tilted, 65:35; and balanced, 50:50. Much of Kanter's (1977) analysis is on skewed groups where the ratio is approximately 85:15 for members belonging to a specified social group. Specifically, I present a framework for exploring within group members' relationship to the

organization. I discuss how a person belonging to a skewed group can have varying experiences based on the organization he is in. To do this, I analyze the responses of teachers working in schools employing just one Black male teacher, Loners, and those schools with larger numbers of Black male teachers, Groupers. Based on their interactions with colleagues, I find that Loners, when compared to Groupers, experienced, what I term, *social isolation in the organization*.

In Chapter Seven, I build on the analytical framework developed in Chapter Six about the varying ways Loners and Groupers experienced the organization. I apply this framework to an exploration of the three organizational responses exhibited by workers in the numerical minority: performance pressure, role encapsulation, and boundary heightening. My findings suggest that the pressures for participants to perform in this study came from intrinsic beliefs about how a Black male teacher should improve the learning outcomes for students of color. In response to these performance pressures, participants engaged in job crafting, or redesigning tasks to increase their engagement with the organization. The degree to which participants were able to achieve the desired outcomes of the crafted job was dependent on the number of Black men on the faculty. While participants experienced role encapsulation, they resisted requests by their White female colleagues to be responsible for policing misbehaving students, who tended to be boys of color. I theorize that the Black male teachers might have been emboldened to resist these requests from their colleagues as a consequence of the male privilege that they drew on from outside of the organization. Boundary heightening had the greatest influence on participants' relationship with members in the school and their sense of attachment or detachment to the organization. Participants described colleagues' beliefs

about their being under-qualified or over-qualified to teach as one influence of heightened boundaries. Groupers, at times, used other Black male teachers in the building to make sense of their boundary heightening experience. And, participants attempted to lower these boundaries by interacting with White colleagues in informal settings.

In Chapter Eight, I discuss participants' decisions to stay or leave their schools and/or the profession. I observed a relationship between the reasons Black male teachers noted they would leave their schools and the schools' organizational characteristics. Loners were more likely to cite administrative leadership and challenges with colleagues; Groupers were more likely to suggest administrative leadership and professional opportunities. Moreover, there was also a relationship between the reasons participants cited for leaving, participants' actual decisions to stay or leave, and organizational characteristics. Loners stayed. Groupers moved to other schools and some left teaching altogether.

And, finally, in Chapter Nine, I discuss the study's limitations. I conclude with a discussion about the dissertation's implications for researchers, policy makers and practitioners.

Chapter II

Two Data Sets: The In School Experiences of Black Male Teachers

Middle School Teacher Turnover Project

During my second year in graduate school, I was hired as a research assistant for the Research Alliance for New York City Schools on its Middle School Teacher Turnover project. My responsibilities included conducting qualitative interviews at two case study sites. As I began to collect and analyze data, I found that organizational conditions affected teachers' decisions to stay or leave. At one school, teachers described the relationship with the principal as one reason why they were actively looking for jobs in the fall. At the other school, I found that teachers wanted to stay because of the professional relationships they had created with other colleagues.

As part of my work with the Research Alliance, I began to explore, further, my interest in organizational conditions that affected the retention of male teachers of color. At the 2012 American Educational Research Association annual meeting, I presented a paper "Policing and Teaching: The Role of Organizational Factors in the Retention and Attrition of Male Teachers of Color" (Bristol, 2012). In it, I described how the Latino and Black male teachers appreciated serving as role models to their Black and Latino boys. However, these teachers also believed that they were disproportionately saddled with the responsibility of improving the learning outcomes for their Latino and Black male students. One manifestation of this burden were the types of classes and students these teachers taught. When compared to their female and White male colleagues, a disproportionate number, specifically 75%, of the male teachers of color in the sample worked with special education populations; the overwhelming majority of special

education students, as I observed, were Black and Latino boys. In selecting teachers, my colleagues and I employed a purposive sample in which we chose respondents with a range of teaching experience, diverse academic disciplines (math, English, science, and social studies), and gender backgrounds. My finding that the majority of male teachers of color taught the most challenging students was particularly striking particularly because our sampling captured teachers from a range of content areas.

Also, from my paper presentation at AERA (Bristol, 2012), I observed that schools had more trouble retaining teachers than recruiting them. A Latino male special education teacher affirmed his belief that male teachers can play an influential role in students' lives, but acknowledged that it was the school's principal - a Black man - who made the recruitment of male teachers an organizational priority. According to the Latino male teacher, the principal hired less qualified male teachers of color candidates. This teacher noted, "it seems that no matter who gets hired, it's always men. And then they're not always necessarily the most qualified individuals. We've had people that come here for one year and they leave 'cause they're not very strong."

From this teacher's response and from my overall findings, more generally, I wanted to know more about what other organizational priorities a principal might create that uniquely affect Black male teachers. Here, the principal's decision, according to the respondent, to hire the least qualified male teachers of color made them more likely to leave. Roseville, it appeared, had little difficulty recruiting male teachers of color; its greatest challenge was its inability to retain male teachers of color. This finding from the teacher turnover project focused my research interests from trying to understand the experiences of Black male teachers to include an exploration of how the organizational

conditions in schools enable and/or constrain Black male teacher retention. However, there existed no literature on the relationship between organizational conditions within schools and Black male teachers' decisions to stay or leave the profession.

2012 Black Male Teacher Environment Survey (BMTES)

One way that I attempted to bridge the empirical gap of understanding the role organizational conditions play in influencing the experiences of Black male teachers was through my former position as a research associate in the Boston Public School's (BPS) Office of the Achievement Gap. There, I created the Black Male Teacher Education Survey (BMTES). The impetus for BMTES came as one of many of the district's ongoing efforts to increase the diversity of its faculty. I designed BMTES based on initial findings from Middle School Teacher Turnover project.

I administered BMTES under the auspices of the Office of the Achievement Gap. Then Superintendent Johnson sent an email with a link to the survey to each Black male teacher of record in BPS. The email was sent on Tuesday, June 26th 2012 - three days before the end of the school year. The timing may be one influence for the survey's 32 percent response rate. In total, 85 of the 266 Black male teachers in BPS responded to the survey; approximately 67 completed most items.

BMTES Findings

In this section, I describe the characteristics of the 85 survey respondents, their relationships with colleagues and intentions to stay or leave their schools. While analyzing survey responses, I looked for a natural break where I could determine, empirically, the varying ways Black male teachers experienced the organization. Based on this non-representative sample, I observed differences between respondents who were

the only Black men on their faculty and those respondents who were in schools with three or more Black male teachers. I used the term “Loner” to describe those respondents who were the only Black men in the organization and “Grouper” for those respondents who were in organizations with three or more Black male teachers.

Below, I provide the Full Sample , as well as compare item responses from Loners (12 percent) and Groupers (38 percent). As a way to explore further how, if at all, the presence, or lack thereof, of other Black men on a school’s faculty might influence Black male teachers’ experiences in the organization, my analysis strategy focused on the variation between Loner and Grouper responses. It is important to note that the absolute size of my Loner (n=8) and Grouper (n=33) teachers on whom I base the below analysis only allows me only to provide an impression of potential patterns in the district. An increase in response rate might have changed my findings.

Teacher Characteristics

After disaggregating the responses of Black male teachers in schools with one Black male teacher and those in schools with three or more Black male teachers, I observed some distinct differences in teacher characteristics. Loners were more likely to be certified in alternative certification programs than Groupers (see Table 2.1). Also, Loners, on average, had not attended any district schools as a student (see Table 2.2). And, Loners had a significantly higher pass rate on the MTELs (Massachusetts Tests for Educator Licensure) when compared to Groupers (see Table 2.3). Teachers can take the MTELs, which are offered monthly, as many times as necessary until they pass. However, teachers must pass the exam within a two-year period in order to keep their jobs. Finally, Groupers were more likely to teach in a failing, or turnaround, school (see

Table 2.4). Such differences in teacher characteristics warrant further exploration into how Loners and Groupers describe their pathways into the teaching profession and their decisions to teach at current and/or previous schools.

Table 2.1: Type of Teacher Certification Program

	Alternative Certification	Traditional Program
Full Sample (n=63)	29%	71%
Loners (n=8)	62.5%	37.5%
Groupers (n=33)	29%	71%

Table 2.2: A Student in Boston Public Schools

	Yes	No
Full Sample (n=63)	32%	68%
Loners (n=8)	12.5%	87.5%
Groupers (n=33)	38%	62%

Table 2.3: Attempts Needed to Pass the MTEL

	First	Second or more
Full Sample (n=63)	65%	35%
Loners (n=8)	87.5%	12.5%
Groupers (n=33)	54%	46%

Table 2.4: Experience Teaching in a BPS Turnaround School

	Currently in a turnaround school.	Previously taught in turnaround school.	No
Full Sample (n=72)	17%	4%	79%
Loners (n=8)	12.5%	37%	87.5%
Groupers (n=33)	23%	4%	73%

Relationship with the Organization

Groupers were more likely to be in schools where they improved instruction by analyzing their practice (see Table 2.5). This might be because more Groupers are in turnaround schools where the district mandates teachers to take into account students' standardized test score data when planning. Loners, when compared to Groupers,

believed that teachers of color had fewer opportunities to influence school policy (see Table 2.6). Moreover, Loners, when compared to Groupers, also suggested that their White colleagues were more able to influence school policies (see Table 2.7). Such differences may account for racial preferences by school administrators when selecting teacher leaders. Finally, Loners were more likely to perceive that persons in the organization were afraid of them because of their race and gender (see Table 2.8). Given the fact that these respondents were the only Black men on the faculty, it may well be the case that their colleagues did not know how to interact with them. This might have engendered a perceived sense of fear by Loners. In the end, the differences between how these two groups related to the organization requires a more nuanced understanding of Loners and Groupers' experience in schools.

Table 2.5: Improved Instruction by Learning From and Analyzing Practice

	Disagree	Neither Disagree or Agree	Agree
Full Sample (n=71)	7%	20%	73%
Loners (n=8)	37.5%	25%	37%
Groupers (n=33)	11%	11%	78%

Table 2.6: Teachers of Color Have Opportunities to Influence School Policy

	Disagree	Neither Disagree or Agree	Agree
Full Sample (n=71)	18%	27%	55%
Loners (n=8)	37.5%	12.5%	50%
Groupers (n=33)	18%	26%	56%

Table 2.7: White Teachers Have Opportunities to Influence School Policy

	Disagree	Neither Disagree or Agree	Agree
Full Sample (n=71)	5%	23%	72%
Loners (n=8)	25%	12%	63%
Groupers (n=33)	37%	26%	37%

Table 2.8: Being Black Causes People to Fear Me

	Disagree	Neither Disagree or Agree	Agree
Full Sample (n=70)	21%	26%	53%
Loners (n=8)	25%	12.5%	62.5%
Groupers (n=33)	63%	24%	13%

Intentions to Stay/Leave

Finally, an increased number of Black male teachers on the faculty was associated with respondents reporting a greater desire to remain at their current school. Even with the current economic downturn and the reduction in public school teaching positions, Groupers suggested they would remain when compared to Loners (See Table 2.9). Specifically, Loners noted that challenges with colleagues affected their decisions to leave. If, as Ingersoll and May (2011) suggested, Black male teachers were more likely to leave their schools at a greater rate than other sub-groups, it may be the case that Black men teaching in gender and racial isolated spaces may account for a greater proportion of those “leavers.” As such, further inquiry is warranted into how Loners and Groupers describe the organizational conditions that influence their decisions to stay or leave their schools.

Table 2.9: Desire to Remain in School Despite Opportunity to Find Another Job

	Yes	No
Full Sample (n=62)	40%	60%
Loners (n=8)	62%	38%
Groupers (n=33)	27%	73%

In sum, my analysis of these two data sets - the Research Alliance for New York City Schools Middle School Teacher Turnover project and the 2012 Black Male Teacher Environment Survey – informed my framing of an initial research question:

Are there differences for teachers working in schools employing just one Black male teacher versus schools with larger numbers of Black male teachers?

In the next chapter, I provide a review of the literature by first presenting an historical narrative of Black male teachers; I then consider the theoretical underpinnings that may inform recruitment efforts to increase the number of Black male teachers. I draw attention to social distance or the idea that Black men are uniquely positioned to understand and respond to the needs of Black boys. Next, I describe some of the in and out of school challenges faced by Black males that may have precipitated the need to create a Black male teacher recruitment campaign. I then explore some of the critiques of a Black male teacher recruitment campaign and shift to an inquiry of why Black men leave the classroom.

Chapter III Review of the Literature

Black Male Teachers: An Historical Narrative

In the United States, 74 percent of educators are females; 79 percent are White (Bureau of Labor Statistics, 2009). Black men comprise 1.9 percent of the entire U.S. teaching population (Bridges, 2009).

Black male teachers, however, have not always represented a small fraction of the country's teaching force. In 1890, data from the U.S. census suggested that among Black teachers, the majority of whom were in the South, 49% were men and 51% were women (Fultz, 1995). By the 1940s, the number of Black male teachers decreased dramatically when compared to Black female teachers: 21% and 79%, respectively (Fultz, 1995). While the literature is silent on this decline, one influence on the dramatic decrease of Black male teachers between the 1890 and 1940 may be increased job opportunities in a rapidly industrializing America combined with the need for soldiers in two World Wars.

In *Brown* (1954), the Supreme Court mandated that U.S. public schools integrate. Integration, then, manifested itself on the local level as Black students attending White schools. As Black students entered White schools, their teachers did not follow. One consequence of the *Brown* decision was the methodical dismissal of Black principals (Tillman, 2009) and teachers (Detweiler, 1967; Fultz, 2004). These teachers were dismissed for several reasons: their schools closed as a result of Black students attending integrated schools; school boards refused to pay Black teachers the same salary as their White colleagues; state legislatures adopted laws that allowed for the dismissal for Black teachers without cause (Haney, 1978). Before *Brown*, there were 82,000 Black male and female teachers across the United States (Haney, 1978). However, between 1954 and

1965, 38,000 Black teachers lost their jobs (Epps, 1999). Education historians noted that these teachers provided their Black students with the socio-emotional support and an academically rigorous curriculum to navigate an overtly racist society (Franklin, 2009; Randolph, 2009). These teachers believed their roles to be much more than delivering content, but to serve as surrogate parents to their students.

In proceeding with all deliberate speed, school districts began to comply with subsequent Supreme Court desegregation rulings, *Greene* (1968) and *Keyes* (1972), but this did little to stem the continued displacement of Black teachers. Critics charge at the same time local and state legislatures recognized that federal courts were intent on ending racially based school discrimination practices, states began introducing teacher certification exams (George, 1985). While state officials suggested that the implementation of teacher certification exams were based on raising educational standards through measuring teacher competency, others, such as Hoover (1984), charge that such tests were “educational genocide” for Blacks. Nonetheless, the first mandated teacher certification exams were passed into law in 1977 by Louisiana and Mississippi. By 1979, Arkansas, Florida, Georgia, North Carolina, and South Carolina were the only states in the Union that required teachers to pass a certification exam before assuming a teaching position (Kearns, 1984). In Louisiana, from 1978 – 1982, 10 percent of Black students passed the teacher examination (George, 1985). Also during that time, the percentage of Black teachers attempting the examination decreased, while the percentage of White educators increased. Specifically, in 1979, 31 percent of all teacher exam test takers were Black; however, by 1982, that number decreased to 13 percent. In contrast, 69 percent of all test takers were Whites; but, by 1982, that percentage increased to 87

percent (Kauchak, 1984). In sum, since 1964 there has been a 66 percent reduction in Black teachers in the United States (Kunjufu, 2010).

Empirical Claims for Increasing Black Male Teachers

Policy makers who want to justify increasing the number of Black male teachers could turn to two seminal studies by Thomas Dee (2004; 2005). Dee (2004) uses the Tennessee Project STAR class-size experiment, a randomized control trial aimed at determining the effect of small class sizes on student learning, and finds that students' academic achievement increases when they share the same racial group as their teacher. In a subsequent study (2005), he uses National Education Longitudinal Study of 1988 (NELS: 88) and observes that teachers are more likely to view students who belong to different ethnic and racial groups as disruptive and inattentive. While this pattern holds for all incongruent matches, i.e. Black teachers and White students, the largest effects are for low socioeconomic students and students living in the south. Consequently, as Dee concludes, "The most widely recommended policy response to these sorts of effects are arguably the ones that involve recruiting underrepresented teachers" (Dee, 2005, p.8).

The prevailing view of practitioners and policy makers is best captured by Secretary Duncan during his address at Morehouse College in which he called Black men to the blackboard: "Less than three percent of the nation's teachers are persons of color during a time when black children need black teachers as mentors and role models" (Seymour, 2011). Proponents of increasing the number of Black male teachers in schools argue that Black men can serve as role models for Black boys (Holland, 1991). King (1993) makes the normative claim that working class Black students need role models because they are

more likely to seek affirmation and internalize teachers' expectations. More importantly, she notes that Black teachers have the ability to bridge the cultural divide between Black students' home and school experiences. Historically, one way Black teachers have bridged the home-school divide is by serving as surrogate parents to their Black students (Franklin, 2009). Moreover, in serving as surrogate parents to their Black students, Black teachers have provided their students with the socio-emotional support to navigate a society characterized by institutional racism (Randolph, 2009).

One could argue that the predominantly White teaching population, specifically, and schools, more generally, in U.S. public schools have been unable to bridge the cultural divide between school and home environments for Blacks (Sealey-Ruiz & Greene, 2011). One reason why schools have been unable to bridge the cultural divide for Blacks is the societal perception, which is manifested in schools, that Blacks, according to Yancey (2003), are the "outcast race" (p.13). Yancey (2003) suggests that unlike other minority groups, such as Latinos and Asians, Blacks entered the U.S. as subjugated individuals and were deemed, by Whites, as being unable to assimilate into the dominant culture. Even if Blacks wanted to assimilate into the dominant culture, Yancey (2003) argues, Whites would rebuff such attempts because of the original dynamic (e.g. chattel slavery) that characterized the relationship between both groups. In the end, Yancey posits (2003) that U.S. society will remain one with two social groups – Blacks and non-Blacks; Blacks will be unable to assimilate into the dominant society, while non-Black racial minorities, such as Latinos and Asians, will be able to assume White status.

Moreover, the peculiar nature of Blacks, specifically Black males, has left them the most socioeconomically disenfranchised, or "outcast," when compared to all other racial

and gender subgroups. Black males perform less well academically (Schott, 2010), have higher incidence of high school dropout (Metropolitan Center for Urban Education, 2009) and incarceration (Alexander, 2010) when compared to other sub-groups. As such, implicit in a policy (e.g., U.S. Secretary of Education Arne Duncan's Black Men to the Blackboard) to increase the number of Black male teachers could well be the belief that Black men have the ability to ameliorate the educational and social outcomes for this marginalized group, Black males. Moreover, for the 75 percent of Black boys living in female-headed households (Snyder, McLaughlin, & Finders, 2006), having a Black man serve in a father-figure role, it is assumed, might improve academic outcomes (Kunjufu, 2005). As a result of their racial matching and similar perceived shared encounters with institutionalized racism, Black male teachers, researchers argue, are well positioned to increase Black boys' educational and social outcomes (Lynn & Hassan, 1999; Lynn, 2006).

Challenges to a Black Male Teacher Recruitment Campaign

While a small body of literature suggests positive academic outcomes for boys who have male teachers (Dee, 2004; Dee, 2005), there are potential problems with such a singular focus to recruit Black male teachers as a policy lever to improve the academic outcomes for Black boys.

A policy that aims to increase the number of Black male teachers without regard to preparing these men to understand how their role as being Black, a male, and a teacher can influence the learning and social outcomes of their students can do more harm than good. Researchers discuss how the infusion of male teachers within schools had the

unintended effect of perpetuating heteronormative understandings of gender and masculinity among students, particularly boys (Haase, 2005; Johnson, 2005).

Such a policy presupposes that all Black men are capable, or even desire, to serve in a father-figure role. In his study, Brockenbrough (2009) recounts how a Black young man tells his Black male teacher, who had assumed an authoritarian posture, “you ain’t my daddy.” If a recruitment strategy touts the ability for Black men to correct the social outcomes for Black boys, they may, inevitably, do more policing than teaching. By that I mean, schools and policymakers may, in their attempts to increase the number of Black men, encourage these new recruits to serve in disciplinary roles – particularly as it relates to Black boys.

Foucault (1979) uses Bentham’s Panoptic in his discussion of how discipline is maintained in society. The Panoptic, Foucault (1979) argues, allows for the prison guard, from his watchtower, to monitor the prisoner’s behavior in the courtyard without being seen by the prisoner. Similarly, in the schoolhouse, the role of the teacher, Foucault (1979) argues, is to maintain discipline. As Black boys exhibit the greatest in-school behavioral challenges (Catalyst, 2010), increasing the number of Black male teachers could serve as a neo-institutional control mechanism for controlling Black boys’ behavior. By neo-institutional control mechanism I mean modern day forms of control that are sanctioned and encouraged by schools.

Moreover, much of the current discourse around school reform - a euphemism for how to improve the academic outcomes for Latino and Black children in urban areas - continues to see a policy lever aimed at addressing issues of human capital (Cohen, Raudenbush, & Ball, 2003), or focusing exclusively on teacher characteristics as the

solution. Almost insidiously, a recruitment campaign to increase the number of Black male teachers places the onus of improving Black boys' academic outcomes on the backs of Black male teachers. And, a policy to add to the number of Black men in the classroom, while having merit, could be construed as yet another attempt to provide a human capital solution, without interrogating how teachers teach Black boys, for example, and how Black boys learn. Perhaps practitioners and researchers should instead invest more time in their work with pre- and in-service teachers on developing and refining good practice, which research suggests is a strong dependent variable for learning (Darling-Hammond, 2010).

Despite the problems around efforts to increase the number of Black men in the classroom, such as reifying heteronormative spaces and promoting neo-institutional control mechanisms, what is clear is that Black males continue to experience significant in school and social challenges. Below, I describe the current ecological challenges faced by Black males.

Social and School Based Outcomes for Black Males

Black Males and Incarceration

From the mass media (Murr, 2007) to the academy (Martino, Kehler & Weaver-Hightower, 2009), America is focusing its attention on understanding the debilitating condition facing Black boys and the ramifications for their life outcomes (Eckholm, 2006; Ferguson, 2000). When compared to White males, Black males, between the ages of 18 -24, were almost 8 times as likely to be victims of homicide; in 2008, the homicide victimization rate for White males was 12 per 100,000; for Black males it was 91 per 100,000 (Cooper & Smith, 2011). When compared to women and all other ethnic groups,

a disproportionate number of Black men are incarcerated (Pew Center for Research, 2008). In 2010, Black males were seven times more likely to spend time within a correctional institution when compared to White males (Guerino, Harrison, & Sabol, 2012).

Loic Wacquant (2002) posits that chattel slavery, for Blacks in America, never ended, but persists in this group's mass incarceration. Specifically, he states that despite the abolition of slavery and legalized segregation, or Jim Crow, with the rise of the Northern ghetto, Blacks reside in a "socio-spatial...setting [where they are] ostracize[d] and exploit[ed]...and endowed with negative symbolic capital," (p.50) which has resulted in "stigma[tization], constraint, territorial confinement, and institutional encasement" (p.50). Wacquant believes that embedded in the physical isolation of Blacks in "ghettos" is a greater attempt by Whites, society's hegemonic group, to reify social order by creating legal institutions, such as prisons, to continue the subjugation of this group. Moreover, according to Wacquant, there exists in society the continued perception, perpetuated by Whites, that Black males have come to represent "moral degeneracy and mayhem" (p.56).

Michelle Alexander (2010) continues to explore the deleterious social outcomes Black males face, specifically interactions with penal institutions; in her jurisprudential discussion, she traces the rise of mass incarceration among Blacks to Ronald Reagan's War on Drugs, which placed particular emphasis on arresting low-level offenders, most of whom were Black. State and federal governments have created the "New Jim Crow" by prohibiting voting, limiting public housing and welfare for incarcerated persons, most of whom are Black.

Similar to Wacquant (2002), Alexander (2010) notes that Black males are most affected by this “New Jim Crow” in that they are “more disenfranchised today than in 1870, the year the Fifteenth Amendment was ratified prohibiting laws that explicitly deny the right to vote...” (p.180). Disaggregating the rate at which Black men are imprisoned, one observes that incarceration is stratified along educational levels (Petit & Western, 2004). Specifically, 32 percent of Black males without a college education have spent time within a correctional facility. When compared to White men at the same level of educational attainment, one finds that only six percent of Whites have been imprisoned. One reason for this disparity between the rate at which Blacks and Whites are incarcerated, according to Alexander, is a result of hyper-policing of Black communities, which began with President Ronald Regan’s attempts to reduce drug related crime also known as the War on Drugs. Contemporary examples of the hyper-policing in Black communities are best observed in cities such as New York where the former mayor, Michael Bloomberg, encouraged a policy that allowed police to “stop and frisk” criminals they suspected of committing a crime. “Stop and frisk” disproportionately targeted Blacks (Alexander, 2010).

One continues to observe how one’s race influences varying outcomes, particularly job attainment for Blacks after they leave prison. Pager (2005) finds that Whites with a criminal record were twice as likely to receive callbacks from a potential employer when compared to Blacks. More strikingly, she notes, “whites *with* criminal records received more favorable treatment (17 percent) than blacks *without* criminal records (14 percent)” (pg.958). Having to share this “mark,” or criminal record, with

future employers may well affect recidivism rates for Blacks, Pager concludes; one influence for why persons return to jail is a lack of employment.

Penal institutions are “correctional” in name only, as the exit door has become a revolving door. The recidivism rates for Black males are equally alarming across the country. From Massachusetts, 44 percent (Kohl, Hoover, McDonald, & Solomon, 2008) to Washington, 72 percent (The State of Washington Sentencing Guidelines Commission, 2005), Black males recidivated at a larger percentage relative to their peers.

And, finally, there appears to be a direct correlation, for Black men, between dropping out of high school and incarceration. The Center for Labor Market Studies (Sum, Khatiwada, & Palma, 2009) found that in 2006, 23 percent of all Black men - between the ages of 16-24 - who had dropped out of high school had, at some point, spent time within a correctional institution compared to six percent of Latino, 6.5 percent of White, and seven percent of Asian men. Also in that year, 60 percent of Black men in their 30s who had not completed high school were incarcerated (Edelman, Holzer, & Offner, 2006). In the end, it would appear that Black men, when compared to their peers, are most likely to be trapped in the school-to-prison pipeline.

School Based Outcomes for Black Males

In addition to experiencing grave social challenges, particularly as they relate to incarceration, Black males also experience schools in distinct, particularly negative, ways, when compared to their peers (Ferguson, 2007). Fordham and Ogbu (1986) early attempts to explain the persistent rate at which Black students underperform in school when compared to their White peers have been refuted. First, Fordham and Ogbu’s (1986) suggested that Blacks have a shared identity based on a fictive kinship – a shared

persona based on social and economic similarity. Then, they theorized that one influence for Black students' underachievement, in addition to discriminatory funding policies that favored White schools, is a fictive kinship where Blacks develop an oppositional culture to school where performing well was akin to acting White. Drawing on a sample of eight students, four male and four female, from a predominantly Black public school in Washington D.C., Fordham and Ogbu (1986) conclude "Black students...who choose to pursue academic success are perceived by their peers as 'being kind of white'" (p.186). The gap in academic performance, they suggest, is a consequence of a cultural deficit that characterizes Black students.

Tyson, Darity, and Castellino (2005) challenge Fordham and Ogbu's (1986) theory that Black students equate high achievement with acting White. Tyson et. al. (2005) conducted a secondary analysis of data collected to explore patterns in minority students who took honors courses across public schools in North Carolina. Data included 11 secondary schools and 85 students – 40 Black and 36 White. Similar to subsequent studies that have tested Fordham and Ogbu's "acting white theory," they find, "Contrary to the notion that Black students do not value academic achievement, we found an expressed desire to do well academically among all informants" (589). The researchers note that although some Black students chose not to take more rigorous classes, their decision was not based on the belief that they would be accused of acting White. Instead, these Black students believed that their lack of preparation would not allow them to be successful – thus negatively influencing their overall grade point average.

In a more striking refutation of Fordham and Ogbu (1986), Tyson et. al. observed that in five of the sample schools, Black students embraced their peers' perception that

they were high achieving and felt little pressure from other students to underachieve. As one Black male student affirmed, “I wanted to stay ahead academically...have an edge on the competition” (590). This statement, in many ways, encapsulates similar claims by the majority of Black students in Tyson et. al.’s (2005) sample. Tyson suggests that Fordham and Ogbu’s small sample size, in terms of one school and eight students, disallowed them from identifying any complexity around oppositional culture and potential influences of underachievement among Black students.

While Tyson et. al. (2005) disprove Fordham and Ogbu (1986)’s claim that Black students equate academic success with “acting White,” they provide no discussion that explores other possibilities for why Black students underperform. Researchers, policy makers, practitioners, however, continue to inquire about possible influences for “underachievement” for Black students, more generally, and Black males, specifically.

At the very moment Black boys begin formal education, they are disproportionately more likely to be expelled from school. Gilliam (2005), in his national study of 3,898 state-funded pre-kindergarten classrooms, finds boys were four times as likely to be expelled than girls and Blacks twice as likely to be expelled than Whites. He concludes that although much attention is focused on Black boys in grades K – 12, “the pattern of disparity begins much earlier” (p. 11).

In elementary schools across the country, Black boys are twice and thrice more likely to be suspended than their Latino and White peers, respectively (Catalyst Chicago, 2010). Such trends hold in middle school, even among those schools lauded for closing the “achievement gap.” When compared to their classmates, a disproportionate percentage of Black males, specifically 40 percent, leave KIPP (Knowledge is Power Program) schools

(Miron, Urschel, & Saxton, 2011).

At the end of the compulsory schooling continuum, the disparity between Black boys and their peers increases greatly. The Schott Foundation's *50 State Report on Public Education and Black Males* (2010) highlight this crisis. In the 2007-2008 cohort, only 47 percent of Black male students around the country who started the school year graduated from high school. As 80 percent of all Blacks in the United States live in urban areas (Mincy, Lewis & Han, 2006), a look within these locales reveals the epicenters of the graduation rate crisis for Black males: New Orleans 28 percent, New York City 28 percent, Detroit 27 percent, Cleveland 27 percent, Boston 47 percent (Schott, 2010).

Black boys are disproportionately represented in special education when compared to their peers (Grant, 1992; Losen & Orfield, 2002). On average, Black males are two-three times more likely than their White male peers to be diagnosed as emotionally disturbed (Ferri & Connor, 2005; Crothers, 2007). Currently, Blacks are 15 percent of the public school student population, but are 33 percent of students classified as requiring special education services (Reschly, 2007); 80 percent of all Blacks in special education are male (Kunjufu, 2005).

Data around the rate at which Black males are expelled, unable to graduate from high school after four years, and disproportionate incidence of receiving special education services might well influence why policy makers want to summon "Black men to the Blackboard."

Deirdre Royster (2003) in *Race and the Invisible Hand* conducted a case-study, using a snowball, non-representative sample to investigate 1) how Black and White male seniors in high schools transition from school to work, 2) the roles families, schools, and

employers played in the school-work transition, 3) how the differences in skills, values, and attitudinal differences contributed to employment opportunities. Royster (2003) conducted fifty interviews - interviewing twenty-five Black and twenty-five White males. According to Royster (2003), after graduating from high school, Black men were 10 percent less likely to be employed; approximately half had achieved success in the labor market; for those Black men who did find work, it was typically not in their field. This finding was in stark contrast to the 76 percent of Whites who were able to locate desirable jobs.

In an attempt to explain the unequal job outcomes between Black and White males, Royster (2003) examined respondents' academic records; on average, Black males had grades equal to Whites on standardized math and reading exams, as well as on school report cards. However, in this recently desegregated vocational high school, some White male teachers provided preferential treatment in locating work opportunities for their White male students. Moreover, Black male students suggested that their relationship with the most connected White male teachers was tenuous at best and, in some cases, even hostile. Consequently, White male teachers played an integral role, according to Royster, in constraining Black male students' access to comparable work opportunities for when compared to White male students. This lack of access for Black male students had a deleterious effect on future desirable job opportunities. Royster's (2003) discussion of the role that within school factors play, specifically the role of the teacher, on student outcomes might only support the belief to "Bring Black Men to the Blackboard."

Black Male Teachers and Social Distance

Social distance (Parks, 1924; Simmel, 1950), or the perceived dissimilarity between groups based on race, class, or gender, underlie a policy initiative to increase the number of Black male teachers. In “The Stranger,” Georg Simmel (1950) discusses the precarious role of the “stranger” who, while dwelling among the individuals of a particular locale, is, in the end, distant from the experiences of those people. About the stranger, Simmel writes, “his position in this group is determined, essentially, by the fact that he has not belonged to it from the beginning, that he imports qualities into it, which do not and cannot stem from the group” (1). In Simmel, we observe the nascent thinking around how one’s identity shapes the ways in which people interact within a particular space. In many urban school environments, on average, White teachers are strangers to the experiences of their Black students. And, Black students are strangers to the experiences of their White teachers.

Applying Social Distance to Urban Schools

From Simmel’s (1950) early thinking about how the perceived similarities between persons can affect how they relate to each other, we begin to observe manifestations of social distance in urban areas across the United States, specifically as it relates to race. Parks (1924) describes how the population shift away from towns and to the metropolis brought varying ethnic groups within close proximity of each other. These groups, even when living and working near each other, began to recognize that they were, indelibly, different from each other. Such recognition of differences evolved into prejudicial attitudes by the majority Whites and the ways they interacted with the other. Moreover,

Parks's (1924) theory further underscores Yancey's (2003) belief that Blacks are the outcast race and unable to assimilate into the dominant, White, society.

In addition to race, one can also observe social distance through social class, specifically in the varying ways students along the economic continuum navigate the schooling environment. Annette Lareau (2003), in *Unequal Childhoods*, provides an analysis of how working and middle class children in America navigate institutions. One of Lareau's central claims is that parents in middle-class families, regardless of race, focus on the act of concerted cultivation or "actively foster[ing] and assess[ing] their children's talents, opinions, and skills" (p.238). For example, middle-class children observe how their parents persuade school officials to place them in honors courses. Working-class parents, however, employ an *accomplishment of natural growth* posture in child rearing. Specifically, these parents "viewed child development as unfolding spontaneously, as long as [the children] were provided with comfort, food, shelter, and other basic support" (p.238). Working-class parents trust that schools have their children's best interests at heart; they are less likely to push school officials to place their children in accelerated tracks. The net effect of such methods of parenting is that, according to Lareau, middle-class children are better situated, when compared to their working-class peers, at being successful in particular institutions, such as schools.

While Lareau does not use the language of "social distance" - or the perceived dissimilarity between groups based on race or class - another perspective on examining the schooling experiences of working-class children is not to characterize their within school challenges as being a consequence of some cultural defect, but rather of the school's inability to meet the needs of diverse learners. As a result of middle-class

parents' influence, schools afford greater privileges to middle-class children than their working-class peers, according to Lareau. With the political, economic, and social capital acquired outside of the school's walls, middle-class parents are more apt, when compared to working-class parents, at making schools serve their children's needs.

Moreover, middle-class children acquire cultural capital, the ability to use one's status to achieve social mobility, by observing how their parents encourage institutions to work for them. The skills middle-class children develop at home are then transferred to school vis-à-vis "develop[ing] and value[ing] an individualized sense of self...Learn[ing] to present themselves" (p.241 – 242). When compared to working-class parents, middle-class parents, on average, are more likely to encourage an environment where their children can communicate their ideas; this learned skill might influence the disparity in academic performance between middle and working class students. Thus, one could argue that the difficulties working-class children have are a result of the school's social distance from them. And, for the Black boys, who exhibit the greatest academic challenges, increasing the number of Black male teachers could serve as an attempt to make school less socially distant.

More recent applications of social distance within schools investigate the perceptions of White teachers on working-class Black students (Diamond & Spillane, 2004; Hyland, 2009). These investigations attempted to explore the relationship between teacher characteristics and students' academic outcomes. Researchers found that White teachers in urban areas have low expectations for their economically disadvantaged Black students. White teachers - who are of different socio-economic background than their

students - are more inclined to see student failure as a result of students' class and racial background rather than their socialized world views (Hale, 2001; Milner, 2006).

Such perceptions are not lost to Black students. They are able to recognize the culture of low expectations that envelop the psyches of their White teachers (Douglas, Lewis, Douglas, Scott & Garrison-Wade, 2008). Consequently, the White middle-class teacher, within an urban-school, it is assumed, will be the proverbial stranger among her economically disenfranchised Black male students. Black men, some educators and researchers argue, may be more attuned to the needs of their Black students and more apt to create learning environments to facilitate success (Brown, 2009).

Bridges (2011) builds on the growing literature that described the identities of Black male teachers and the impetus for their entering the profession in his study of ten Black men from the Hip Hop Generation - persons born between 1965 and 1984. Bridges (2011) situated the Hip Hop Generation as the progeny of the Civil Rights and Black Nationalist movements; despite coming into the good of legislation that, on average, provided increased access to social and educational opportunities, members from the Hip Hop Generation also witnessed the systematic dismantling of such gains.

Bridges (2011) found that central to the teaching persona of participants in his study was a call to service, commitment to self-awareness, and resistance to social injustice. According to Bridges (2011), Black male teachers felt a call to redress the growing educational and social shortcomings of Black boys; moreover, Black men recognized that before one could become a teacher of record, it was essential that they "examine [their] beliefs about the purpose of education [and] the social context of urban schooling" (p.331). Bridges's (2011) study begins to provide a more nuanced

examination into why Black men enter the profession – most notably in his attention to how Black males discuss the effect of their race and gender on the ways in which they teach, or perform.

As suggested above, the focus by national, state, and local policy makers to increase the number of Black male teachers might be an attempt to bridge the social distance between Black male students' home and school experiences. However, merely bringing Black men to the blackboard without careful consideration about how to keep Black men at the blackboard may envelop practitioners and policy makers in endless recruitment campaigns.

Black Male Teacher Retention

A supply side argument, in which the under-achievement of Black males in schools (Schott, 2010) makes them less likely to attain degrees in higher education, is often presented to describe the dearth of Black male teachers (Lewis, 2006). The debilitating condition they experience in schools make them less likely to attend college and much less assume a profession in teaching. Another argument is that college educated Black males are able to secure more lucrative jobs than teaching (Lewis & Toldson 2013). However, researchers and policy makers, i.e. those calling “Black Men to the Blackboard,” have failed to ask why Black male teachers stay in or leave the classroom. Put simply, urban school districts and schools, in particular, might have as much difficulty retaining Black male teachers as recruiting them. Ingersoll and May (2011) found in their analysis of longitudinal data in the Schools and Staffing Survey (SASS) that minority male teachers, most of whom were Black, were more likely to move to other schools than teachers from other sub-groups. Their analysis did not

identify the types of schools minority teachers were leaving or the schools these teachers were entering. Researchers at the National Center for Education Statistics label these teachers “movers,” as opposed to “leavers,” or those who leave the profession entirely (Bobbitt, Faupel, & Burns, 1991).

A recent meta-analysis of turnover and retention among teachers of color (Achinstein, Ogawa & Sexton, 2010) identified only one study (Kirby, Berends, & Naftel, 1999) that explored the turnover patterns for Black male teachers. Kirby et. al. (1999) analyzed a longitudinal data set from the Texas State Department of Education and found that White female and Black male teachers had the highest rate of leaving the profession when compared to other groups. While one national data set suggested that Black male teachers are more like to be “movers,” compared to a state-wide data set that finds Black men to be “leavers,” it would be reasonable to conclude, more broadly, that Black male teachers exhibit high rates of turnover when compared to their colleagues.

While researchers are aware of some of the organizational conditions that affect the retention of teachers (Pallas & Buckley, 2012), there is little empirical research on how those conditions influence the decisions for sub-groups (Johnson, Berg & Donaldson, 2005), such as Black male teachers. As such, a study is warranted that will attempt to investigate how the organizational conditions in which Black male teachers work affect their experiences in schools. Through such an examination we might be better able to gain insight into the trends Ingersoll and May (2011) observed around the disproportionate rate at which male teachers of color leave the classroom when compared to their colleagues.

Workers and the Organization

An understanding of the relationship between workers and the organization might provide some insight into how and why individuals exit. Bolman and Deal (1997) suggest that when individuals are correctly paired with an organization, they derive satisfaction from their work. The organization, or more specifically the manager, is able to capitalize on worker contentment as it attempts to achieve its goals. However, when workers and the organization are incorrectly paired, either one or both suffer. Specifically, individuals or the organization will take advantage of the other, causing both to suffer. In citing Hamper (1992), Bolman and Deal (1997) identify several behaviors manifested by workers who are a poor fit with the organization: 1) they withdraw by being absent or quitting, 2) they withdraw psychologically by becoming passive and apathetic 3) they resist by restricting output or committing sabotage 4) they climb the hierarchy in search of better jobs 5) they form groups to redress the power imbalance. To increase worker satisfaction, Bolman and Deal (1997) suggest that organizations invest in people. Such investments can come in the form of hiring right and rewarding well, providing workers with job security and on-going training, and promoting workers from within. More broadly, conditions in the organization that define workers' experience prove useful as a way to investigate turnover among Black male teachers.

A Theory of Numbers and Group Composition

Rosabeth Moss Kanter's (1977) *Men and Women of the Corporation* provides a useful theoretical perspective and empirical evidence that can be relevant to a study of Black male teachers. Kanter's framework allows for an understanding of how organizational conditions can influence the experience of workers. Kanter (1977) enters

the on-going conversation of how workers are defined by and define themselves through their work (Marx, 1959; Smith, 1776) by exploring the processes through which such definitions arise. Kanter suggests: “If jobs ‘create’ people, then the [organization] is the quintessential contemporary people-producer” (p.3). Kanter is interested in understanding *how* people production occurs within organizations. Specifically, Kanter’s exploration into how the organization influences the ways in which workers define themselves, particularly those in the numerical minority within the organization, is most relevant for this treatise.

Kanter (1977) states explicitly her normative interests that frame her study: “I wanted to further the cause of equality for women in organizations...” (p.331). In addition to suggesting the ways in which Smith’s (1776) and Marx’s (1959) writing explore how the nature of the work come to define the worker, Kanter’s (1977) research appears, also, to be informed by the historical context in which she is writing. The second wave of feminism, circa 1960 – 1980, drew attention to how women were oppressed in society, as well as in the workplace (Nicholson, 1997). Unlike the first wave of feminism that focused on women’s suffrage, theorists and activists in the second wave of feminism were interested in a “radical critiquing of gender roles” (Nicholson, 1997, p.2). While Kanter does not describe herself as a feminist in *Men and Women of the Corporation*, she does appear to share an affinity to the second wave of feminism movement:

I was interested in offering practical insight and suggestions that would both be useful to individuals in making sense out of their situations, especially in helping women understand the traps that organizations held out for them, as presently structured, and that would help decision-makers and program planners think more innovatively about new policies and procedures in organizations (p.332).

Such a normative rendering to an empirical study may engender bias in findings that provide singular ways of exploring the roles of workers in the numerical minority, generally, and women, specifically. However, the uniqueness of Kanter's (1977) study and its subsequent findings have made it a seminal piece in understanding how organizational conditions influence the experiences of those in the numerical minority.

Kanter (1977) conducted both individual and focus group interviews with the twenty female employees in a three hundred person sales force unit. The sales force unit was the most elite division in Industrial Supply Corporation, a pseudonym, (Indsco): as one manager suggested, "It's the best function...There's the best training, the most money spent on boondoggles, the most recognition, and the loosest climate" (p.40). Semi-structured interviews included questions on female employees' personal background, career trajectory, relationships with peers, customers, managers, persons from whom they received support or opposition, and general attitudes about the company. Kanter (1977) also used participant observations in meetings and training sessions. Specifically, Kanter (1977) focused on formal interactions during training sessions and meetings, as well as informal interactions among colleagues before and after sessions.

In her analysis, Kanter (1977) posits that organizations, specifically the social groups to which members belong, can be categorized in four distinct groups: uniform, skewed, tilted, and balanced groups. She characterizes these groups by the numerical proportion of group members who identify with a particular personal characteristic, for example gender or race/ethnic group. Specifically, a uniform group, according to Kanter (1977), is one hundred percent homogenous. In a skewed group, there exist a majority of 85 percent and a minority group comprising up to 15 percent. The conceivable ratio of

workers in the numerical majority to the numerical minority could range from 85:15 to 99:1. Members belonging to the numerical majority wield great influence in defining the organization's culture. Kanter (1977) refers to members in the 85 percent as "dominants" and those comprising the 15 percent as "tokens." Tilted groups are best expressed vis-à-vis the ratio 65:35. Despite not being in the majority, having a numerical representation of 35 percent allows members to have a greater influence in changing the organizational culture. Kanter (1977) describes a balanced group by the ratio of 60:40 or 50:50. Here, members of different social groups have equal, or close to equal, opportunities to influence the culture of the organization. In sum, while the differences might manifest themselves in racial or gender terms, for Kanter (1977) it is solely about numbers and the consequences for how one experiences the organization by being in the numerical minority or majority.

Performance Pressure, Boundary Heightening, and Role Encapsulation

Given the numerical representation of Black male teachers (e.g. two percent of the teacher workforce), they would, according to Kanter (1977), be considered tokens. In order to understand their experiences it would be important to understand Kanter's theory around skewed groups. In skewed groups, tokens' experiences can be characterized in three ways: performance pressure, boundary heightening, and role encapsulation. Kanter (1977) describes the *performance pressure* faced by tokens as having to "perform their jobs under symbolic conditions different from those of dominants" (p.212). By that she means workers in the numerical minority enact tasks with the burden of believing that their social group identity influences both their interactions with colleagues and the product derived from the work. For example, the lone male teacher may be hyper aware

of his interaction with female students when compared to his female colleagues. Additionally, she refers to *boundary heightening* as the result of dominants becoming cognizant of their similarities with tokens, but also aware of what might “threaten that commonality” (p.222). As such, dominants may move to “erect new boundaries that at some times exclude the token or at others let [him] in only if [he] proves [his] loyalty (p.222). Finally, Kanter (1977) notes that in *role encapsulation*, tokens are constantly fighting “stereotypes... [and] preexisting generalizations about their category as a group” (p.230). She concludes that even if some tokens are able to navigate successfully through these organizational conditions, on average, the psychological stress created may influence the disproportionate rate at which tokens leave organizations when compared to members of the dominant group.

The tokens’ inability to become like the dominants (e.g. the lone male teacher could never become a female teacher), being more visible because they stand out, and the implicit and explicit decisions by the dominant group to safeguard the established culture can create performance pressures, according to Kanter (1977). Such performance pressures can influence how tokens perceive their work and their relationships with colleagues who identify as being in the majority. Consequently, such demands have the potential to influence turnover because tokens may believe their output to be of a lesser quality when compared to individuals in the numerical majority.

Kanter (1977) is rather fatalistic in her discussion of the token’s response to the organizational culture. One reason for this fatalism may be a result of the normative feminist lens Kanter uses to understand tokens. If, as she suggests, one impetus for this treatise is to “help women understand the traps that organizations held out for them”

(p.332), Kanter believes that corporations in the 1970s were more likely to be more constraining than enabling on women's experiences and professional mobility. While she does acknowledge that there could be benefits for a token who is highly visible in an environment where popularity equates to success, Kanter (1977) does not examine positive aspects of performance pressure, boundary heightening, and role encapsulation for those in the numerical minority.

For Kanter (1977), the token is consistently acted upon by dominants and reacts accordingly. They do not question, or attempt to change, either colleagues' beliefs or that of the organization. While Kanter (1977) is correct in suggesting that tokenism is a consequence of being in the numerical minority, i.e. the "lone black among whites, the lone man among women..." (p.207), there may be societal constructs operating outside of the organization that affect tokens' experiences inside of the organization. As such, the responses of female tokens may be different from that of male tokens and racial/ethnic tokens. Men, society's dominant gender group, might be able to activate their acquired social capital to derive some organizational benefits when in the numerical minority. One example of this social capital is the perception that men are more apt to lead than women; as such, even when in the numerical minority within an organization, men may be presented with greater opportunities to lead when compared to women.

Racial/ethnic tokens working in an organization that serve clients of a similar race/ethnicity feel a great sense of fulfillment (Flores, 2011). This is primarily due to those racial/ethnic workers in the numerical minority who believe they are "uplifting the race" when their clients experience positive outcomes. In addition to describing performance pressures, boundary heightening, and role entrapment as one facet of their

experiences as racial/ethnic tokens, these workers might also describe how being less socially distant from clients provide a sense of purpose and uniquely position them to meet clients' needs. Instead, then, of rendering tokenism as merely a constraining experience, for workers in the numerical minority, there might also be ways they are enabled because of their token status (Kelley, 2007).

Within Skewed Groups

While Kanter (1977) provides a way of examining the representation of social categories across four group types, missing from such a framework is an exploration of within group type and its relationship to the organization. By that I mean, might persons belonging to a skewed group have varying experiences based on the organizations they are in? Might the added presence of one or two same race and gender colleagues off-set the organizational challenges of being the only member in one's social group in the organization? Kanter (1977) gives brief attention to potential differences within skewed groups when she mentions, "A mere shift in *absolute* numbers, then, as from one to two tokens, could potentially reduce stresses in a token's situation" (p.238). Kanter (1977) adds to this uncertainty around how the increase of one or two other individuals in one's social group might blunt the effect of being a token when she notes, "It would appear that larger numbers are necessary for supportive alliances to develop" (p.238). How "large" is large? What is unclear is the degree to which a token's experience can be mediated by having more than one other same race or gender colleague in the organization. Consequently, for this study, it will be important to explore the differences for teachers working in schools employing just one Black male teacher versus schools with larger numbers of Black male teachers.

Expanding on Kanter's Conception of Tokenism

Below, I explore the literature around tokenism since Kanter's (1977) seminal work. While Kanter (1977) nested her data collection, analysis, and subsequent derivation of a theory around the organizational implications on numerical representation of workers in one organization, Industrial Supply Corporation (Indsco), a corporate setting, with one sample, women, she does postulate that Blacks and men, for example, are also tokens. Researchers have explored how tokens respond in different settings (Young & James, 2001; Krimmel & Gormley, 2003; Archbold & Schulz, 2008; Floge & Merrill, 1986) as well as the ways in which a token's personal characteristics (Fairhurst & Snavely, 1983; Simpson, 2005; Flores, 2011; Fairchild, Tobias, Corcoran, Djukic, Kovner, & Noguera, 2012) influence particular responses. The literature below, most notably, extends Kanter's (1977) discussion of tokenism by exploring spaces outside of the corporation where men or women operate as tokens, such as hospitals, the police force, and, schools. Also, the literature below seeks to address the implications for racialized tokens, a perspective missing from Kanter's (1977) discussion around gender.

Performance Pressures

As noted above, one effect of being in the numerical minority is that it creates performance pressures. Such pressures, according to Kanter (1977), derive from the token's high visibility within the organization. Workers in the numerical minority, according to Kanter (1977), responded in three distinct ways: over-achieving, acting in a way that appeared less threatening to those in the numerical minority, or becoming invisible, socially. Being one of a few men occupying a particular role in the organization, for example, can create the perceived need to behave in ways that conform

to societal stereotypes. Simpson (2005) conducted forty in-depth interviews with men in four “nontraditional” male jobs: primary (elementary) school teaching, flight attendance (cabin crew), librarian-ship and nursing. She found that men fell into three main categories: seekers (who actively chose the ‘female’ occupation), ‘finders’ (who did not actively seek a non- traditional career but who found the occupation in the process of making general career decisions) and settlers (who actively chose the occupation, often as a result of dissatisfaction with a more ‘masculine’ job, and who then settled in their non-traditional career). Simpson (2005) identified thirteen men as seekers, nine as finders and eighteen as settlers. More than half of respondents suggested that they experience role strain, or the tension that arises when trying “to maintain masculine identities” (p. 16). Such strains, or demands, resulted from the ways in which males believed they needed to perform as a result of their gender. Nine out of the ten elementary school teachers felt the need, for example, to be involved in organizing sports. Thus, as Simpson concluded, such pressures to perform increase the likelihood that men leave “non-traditional” work environments.

Evidence of such performance pressures was present in Young and James (2001) quantitative analysis of male flight attendants. Young and James (2001) sampled 236 male and female flight attendants to test whether male attendants perceived themselves as less attached to the organization than their female counterparts. They also tested the extent to which male flight attendants were less satisfied with their job than female flight attendants. Eighty of the flight attendants surveyed were men. Outside of male flight attendants being more likely to have a college degree, male and female attendants, on average, were similar in age and tenure. Statistically significant findings suggested that

male flight attendants were less satisfied with their jobs, less committed to the organization, and more likely to quit (Young & James, 2001). Token male flight attendants, in this sample, who were in the numerical minority, saw themselves as different from their female colleagues. This difference, according to Young and James (2001) affected work attitudes vis-à-vis lower self-esteem, poor job fit and increased role ambiguity. Thus, when persons are in the numerical minority, according to Young and James (2001), they are less likely to feel an attachment to the organization and more likely to quit.

Similar to Young and James's (2001) discussion of how the performance pressure tokens experience affect their attachment to their job, Krimmel and Gormley (2003) conducted a similar study of policewomen. Krimmel and Gormley (2003) administered a survey to 175 policewomen who fall into two groups – one skewed, representing less than 15 percent of the total population and the other tilted or balanced, accounting for more than 15 percent. Specifically, Krimmel and Gormley (2003) observed that female officers in departments with less than 15 percent representation reported that they would like to take a different job, would not recommend the job to a friend, would not do the job again, and believed the job unimportant. Moreover, they find that job satisfaction improved with an increase in participant's age, education, and number of female co-workers. It might be the case that the longer tokens spend within the organization the more they become acculturated to fulfilling expected roles and, more importantly, less likely to leave. While it could appear as if older women were happier when compared to younger women, it may be that older women are more likely to operate within the structure they have found themselves as opposed to leaving.

Unlike Krimmel and Gormley (2003) and Young and James's (2001) quantitative studies around tokenism, Archbold and Schulz (2008) present a study that used semi-structured interviews to explore the effect of being a policewoman. Archbold and Schulz (2008) found that female patrol officers were less likely to seek a promotion because their male supervisors, who they described as well meaning, intimated that the opportunity to receive a promotion was linked to their token status rather than job performance. As one female officer noted: "I would want people to know that I got promoted because I am a good cop, not because I am a woman or to become a piece of window dressing for the organization" (p.66). While policewomen described a work environment that fostered professional advancement, they, more importantly, acknowledged that such advancement would only heighten their visibility and only amplify the pressure to perform. Consequently, even under conditions meant to enable the tokens' upward mobility, they were constrained by the effects of being in the numerical minority.

Lastly, Floge and Merrill (1986), in addition to conducting semi-structured interviews, collected observational data in an attempt to move beyond tokens' perception of the organization. Across three hospitals, they conducted semi-structured interviews primarily with seven male nurses and three female doctors. They also interviewed persons with whom tokens interacted on a daily basis, most notably supervisors and other nurses and doctors. Floge and Merrill found that male nurses and female physicians are, on average, more visible than colleagues in the numerical majority. Notably, both patients and supervisors were more able to recall names and the actual number of male nurses when compared to female nurses. However, while male nurses and female physicians shared similarities as a consequence of their token status, the effect was

dissimilar; males enjoyed organizational benefits that females did not. Presumably, because male nurses belonged to the higher status gender group, patients routinely mistook them for physicians. Male nurses were more likely to receive promotions when compared to their female colleagues, not because, as a group, they were more qualified than female nurses, but because they were perceived to be more competent based solely on their gender. Conversely, female doctors were mistaken for nurses and garnered less respect from male physicians. Despite both being in the numerical minority in their respective roles, we observe that for women, their token status created a glass ceiling; however, for men, being in the numerical minority created a glass escalator (Williams, 1992). Unlike a glass ceiling that has the potential to limit the professional advancement of individuals from historically disenfranchised groups, a glass escalator, according to Williams (1992), describes the upward mobility that high status groups exhibit even when in the numerical minority. Specifically, men in female dominated professions appear much more likely to advance into supervisory roles than their female colleagues.

Boundary Heightening

As Kanter (1977) suggests, boundary heightening occurs when both tokens and dominants, in being acutely aware of their differences, interact with each other based on those differences. According to Kanter (1977), persons in the numerical minority attempt to assimilate with colleagues, at times begrudgingly. Or, these workers keep to themselves, thus remaining in isolation. Similarly to the effect of performance pressures, tokens suggest that boundary heightening creates a feeling of job dissatisfaction. The boundary heightening serves as a constant reminder to the workers in the numerical minority that they are different than dominants. Analyzing interview data across two

schools from 20 Latina elementary school teachers, Flores (2011) investigated the effect of racialized token status. When compared to Latina teachers in the numerical majority, those teachers in the numerical minority were more likely to perceive a devaluing of Latino culture and subtle forms of racism such as being chastised for speaking Spanish in the teacher's lounge. These negative encounters made them more likely to isolate themselves from their White colleagues. Latina teachers also described feeling disproportionately saddled with the responsibility of being the liaison between school and the community. Despite these circumstances, Latina teachers in the numerical minority still felt an unyielding desire to be of service to the Latino children and families in their school. Here, we observe an extension of Kanter's (1977) theory that focuses on racial tokens; Latina teachers are negatively impacted to such a degree by the perceived boundaries that separate them from White teachers that they avoid social spaces such as the teacher's lounge. Despite challenges with White colleagues, Latina teachers were able to articulate some benefits to their outsider status, specifically in their relationships with students.

Smith (2003) studied how a group of White alumni described their experiences in a school setting comprised mainly of students of color. Again, Kanter (1977) suggests that one's token status is tied to numbers or the percentage of members in the organization with whom the tokens share a personal characteristic. Smith's (2003) application of tokenism to explore the experiences of Whites in the numerical minority illuminated how aspects of how Kanter's (1977) theory still hold, despite White's higher status in society. Smith (2003) conducted semi-structured interviews with 18 White alumni. He found that respondents described a feeling of otherness in particular contexts.

Discussions around race, which typically occurred in class discussions and whole school assemblies, heightened, in the minds of White alumni, the boundaries between them and their classmates of color. During these class discussions, for example, White students talked about their fear of being viewed as racist: “What are you going to say? How are you going to say it?” (p.147).

Smith (2003) found that while it is important to classify tokens by race and gender, there may be other observed characteristics that affect how tokens relate to dominants. According to him, there is great variability in token groups that are perceived by dominants as being homogenous. One White alumna described that living with her Black stepfather allowed her to “experience [Black students’] culture...because [she] had some of that culture in [her] house” (p.71). Consequently, this respondent believed her boundaries to be less heightened when compared to her classmates. It stands to reason that further investigations of within token differences, particularly in an ever evolving multi-racial society, should continue to be explored when trying to capture the various affects of persons in the numerical minority.

In her description of how tokens describe their token minority status, Kanter (1977) focuses solely on the constraints of women at Indsco. While she suggests that the organizational responses might be true to all gender and racial tokens, Fairhurst and Snavelly (1983) indicated that males might derive some benefits from their token status, as also seen in the male nurse example previously mentioned (Fløge & Merrill, 1986). Fairhurst and Snavelly tested whether male tokens were more socially isolated than their female peers with regards to political information such as dismissing bureaucratic organizational norms. Using a questionnaire, researchers sampled 322 nursing students,

41 of who were males, across four different nursing schools. Fairhurst and Snively (1983) hypothesized that the difference in social status between males and females outside of the organization might have mitigated any gender token effect for males. Merely being in the numerical minority or operating as a token, more specifically, does not necessarily suggest that one is unable to experience the organization in the same way as the majority group. Consequently, exploring other characteristics such as social status, outside of numerical representation, might also provide insight into organizational dynamics.

Fairchild et. al. (2012) also found that males acquired benefits from their token status in schools. They used a subset of Black and White teachers in urban schools from the School and Staffing Survey (SASS) to explore teachers' job satisfaction. Specifically, they tried to understand the role of relational demography, or how the intersection of personal and organizational characteristics influenced job satisfaction. Drawing on a sample of 8,665 teachers across 1,992 schools, Fairchild et. al. (2012) found that female teachers experienced greater job satisfaction when working for a male principal. While males were in the numerical minority within schools, they benefited from their high social status in society and were thus perceived to be better leaders. However, when compared to female teachers, male teachers were, on average, more dissatisfied. Thus, for men, the greatest constraint in their token status within organizations might be in peer interactions rather than relationships with managers. Further, challenges with colleagues might vary depending on the actual number of other individuals in the organization who belong to one's social group. One could conclude, then, as tokens come in contact with

colleagues more than an administrator, they are more likely to be reminded of their token status.

As we observed from Flores (2011) and Fairchild et. al. (2012), not all tokens respond in the same way; a token's gender or racial characteristics might lead to particular benefits and consequences based on the organizational context. Dworkin et. al. (1986) investigated the intersection of race and gender to observe tokens' responses. To do this, they used a district-wide questionnaire in one of the country's largest urban school districts to study the effects of teacher morale following desegregation. In total, 3,277 teachers responded, of whom 17.1 percent were male and 82.9 percent female, 68.4 percent White, 28.6 percent Black, and 3.0 percent Mexican-American. In 63 of the 239 schools in the district, males were numerical tokens. Male tokens were disproportionately located in secondary schools. As a consequence of the low sample size, it became difficult to find statistically significant measures. After holding constant personal characteristics, gender was the only variable correlated with alienation. As such, we begin to observe the role that gender plays within schools, particularly as it creates a sense of "otherness" for male teachers.

Additionally, Dworkin et. al. (1986) posit that tokenism negatively affects the alienation a teacher feels if he/she is a racial token. As an extension of the work on tokenism (Kanter, 1977), Dworkin et. al. (1986) begin to look for within token differences. Specifically they test the interaction of teachers' race and gender in predominantly White and predominantly Black schools. Black male teachers, specifically those on a predominantly White faculty, experience greater alienation than those on a majority Black one. However, White male teachers perceive little alienation on either a

predominantly Black or White faculty. This might be due to the higher social status that Whites, in comparison to Blacks, have outside of the organization; regardless of their numerical representation, White males, on average, experience a certain sense of privilege that has the potential to break down boundaries that may prove insurmountable for Black male teachers.

Lastly, Dworkin et. al. (1986) test the effect of alienation based on the faculty's size. For White male teachers, the number of teachers, whether small or large, had little effect on perceptions of alienation. A Black male teacher, however, felt less alienated when on the faculty of nine teachers or fewer; however when on staff with greater than nine teachers (e.g. many more White male teachers), Black men felt more alienated. While the researchers do not propose a theory for this phenomenon, it may be the case that Black men were aware of their numerical status because there were many more people in the organization to remind them of their racial and gender difference. Here, we observe, that in holding the environment constant, there are different effects on a male's token status based, at least in this sample, on race. As a result, a continued exploration into how a token's boundary heightening might be influenced as result of race and gender merits further investigation.

In sum, boundary heightening can negatively influence how workers in the numerical minority experience the organization. However, gender can moderate the effect of tokenism, specifically for men because of their social status in society. Race can also mitigate the effects of tokenism; for example, if workers share the same racial category as their clients then their awareness of difference decreases as it relates to their colleagues and turns to the similarities shared with those clients.

Role Encapsulation

In addition to performance pressures and boundary heightening, Kanter (1977) posits that tokens also face role encapsulation, or being required, by the dominant group members, to serve in “familiar and stereotyped” (p. 230) roles. Hasse (2010) used semi-structured interviews to explore how 11 male primary school teachers negotiated gender in a predominantly female setting. Hasse (2010) suggested that male teachers were disproportionately asked to serve in disciplinary and coaching roles. Failure to accept such roles, according to Hasse (2010), subjected male teachers to being perceived as gay or having pedophilic tendencies from colleagues; consequently, male teachers performed - willingly or unwillingly - heteronormative behaviors. Hasse (2010) quoted one male teacher, Gerald, who asserted: “there are assumptions that you are tough, you can handle it. You can handle this parent. That sort of thing where it’s like you can see some injustice sometimes, in what they expect of a male as opposed to expectations for a female” (p.181). The teacher suggested that assumptions that the school’s administration held around expectations for male teachers made it challenging to seek support as it related to managing student misbehavior. Here, Gerald believed that he was unable to receive assistance from administrators because it was believed that, as a man, he was capable of disciplining his students.

Additionally, male teachers may also feel that their roles were encapsulated by being unable to display affection to students for fear of being labeled a pedophile. Kanter (1977) notes that one response by workers in the numerical minority was to engage in minimal risk; this reaction was, most often, an attempt not to draw further attention from colleagues in the numerical majority. Hasse (2010) recounted one male teacher’s horror

after a female student accidentally grabbed his crotch: “Oh God! It’s morning line up with parents around! What are they going to be thinking? ‘What’s he getting them to do in class?’” (p.186). Hasse (2010) suggests that male primary school teachers become hyper-vigilant around children because of the prevailing notion that men who choose to work with young children are pedophiles. Thus, unlike female teachers who can encourage physical interactions with students, male primary school teachers are less inclined to do so.

In addition to the constraints that male elementary teachers express, namely the inability to physically touch students and assuming heteronormative roles such as being responsible for maintaining student discipline and engaging in sports related fields, Lee, Loeb, and Marks (1995) also illuminate other ways male teachers’ roles are encapsulated. In their survey analysis of a nationally representative sample of 629 independent schoolteachers across 60 schools, Lee et. al. (1995) found that female teachers reported more control over classroom policies when compared to male teachers. However, male teachers, on average, reported more control over school-wide policies. Lee et. al. (1995) described classroom policies as establishing curriculum, selecting content of courses, selecting teaching methods and determining grading policies. In contrast, school policy, according to Lee et. al. (1995) revolved around influencing the school budget, school goals, admission policy, discipline policy, scheduling hiring and firing. Thus, men invested greater energy in seemingly administrative roles whilst women focused more on roles in the classroom. By focusing on more administrative tasks, men confirmed Williams’ (1992) glass escalator theory in ascending to higher status jobs despite being in the numerical minority.

While Lee et. al. conducted quantitative analysis, a qualitative analysis might uncover why females and males perceived such differences around control. One might surmise that female teachers felt more control over classroom policies and male teachers more control over school policies based on societal perceptions around women's responsibility for managing children and men's responsibility for managing adults. Previous research around the experiences of males within "pink" collar jobs, or female dominated professions (Young & James, 2001; Krimmel & Gormley, 2003; Archbold & Schulz, 2008; Floge & Merrill, 1986) suggested that male teachers were more likely to ascend into leadership positions than their female peers.

Similarly, Cognard-Black (2004) examined responses from 5,734 elementary and secondary school teachers using data from the Schools and Staffing Surveys to test the effect of tokenism on male elementary and secondary school teachers. Cognard-Black (2004) found that elementary school male teachers were almost four times as likely to become principals when compared to their female colleagues and, consequently, suffer no disadvantage due to their token status. Similarly, Riehl and Byrd (1997) observed male teachers were more likely to assume an administrative role when compared to equally qualified female teachers. One reason for the increased likelihood of male teachers assuming administrative positions may be a result of the "glass escalator" (Williams, 1992) effect that provide men with organizational benefits despite their token status. Thus, within schools, male teachers' roles become encapsulated by the assumption that they will eventually become an administrator. It may also be the case that Black male teachers feel alone in their role as a pedagogue and choose another role in the profession with many more men such as administration.

Kelly's (2007) study is one of the few empirical pieces that extends Kanter's (1977) theory of tokenism to investigate the within school experiences of Black pedagogues teaching among a predominantly White staff. She conducted one semi-structured interview with six teachers – two from elementary school, one from middle school, and three from high school. Kelly (2007) selected respondents based on a school site with no less than an 80 percent White faculty and no greater than five percent students of color. Additionally, teachers in the sample were either the only Black faculty or one of two members on the faculty. Kelly (2007) also observed three of the six teachers, at each grade level, to investigate, further, teachers' interactions with students and their colleagues.

Despite the small sample size, the research here is seminal in that it makes more complex the tokens' experiences. Kelly (2007) found that while Black teachers experienced performance pressures, boundary heightening, and role entrapment, there were positive facets of being a token – specifically performance enhancers, border crossings, and role integration. Kelly (2007) captured this performance enhancer effect through a Black male teachers' description of the socio-emotional supports he provided to Black students, particularly around how to navigate their interactions with White classmates. This support was particularly crucial given that Black students in the school also comprise a token population. The Black male teacher, Timothy, considered leaving because of the aforementioned challenges that come with one's token status, but decided to remain at the school because of his commitment to the school's Black students.

Kelly (2007), then, went on to discuss how some Black teachers in his sample, despite being aware of their difference with White colleagues, or boundary heightening,

engaged in border crossing. These teachers purposefully set out to interact, create inter-group dialogue, and personal contact with fellow teachers. One Black female teacher, Daisy, the only person of color on her faculty, described how she used her position on the faculty to educate her White colleagues. During Black History Month and Martin Luther King Day, Daisy mentioned that she decorated the school's bulletin boards honoring Black leaders. Daisy's colleagues, possibly in response to her work, came to her for materials they might use in their curriculum. In attempts to include the perspectives of historically marginalized groups in curricula, White teachers relied on Daisy's knowledge, particularly around Black History Month, and saw it as integral to their work.

Finally, Kelly (2007) posited that Black teachers moved beyond functioning in stereotypical and prescriptive ways, or role entrapment, in school to consider how they might reimagine their work as a teacher to include multiple roles - role integration. One Black male teacher, Eric, described his work as being able "to make a Black man human" (p. 246). He recognized that the images presented on television often cast Black men in athletic and violent roles; for his White students, Eric acknowledges that he is, in all likelihood, the only Black man with whom his students come in contact. As such, he works hard at helping students reconstruct what it means to be Black and male. Another Black male teacher, Everett, according to Kelly (2007), in addition to coaching, also assumed other responsibilities at the school, including becoming a club advisor and a computer technician. In contrast to Kanter (1977), Kelly (2007) provided a counter-narrative when discussing how Black teachers negotiated their token status within schools. Black teachers acknowledged that there were constraints to being in the numerical minority, but resisted those constraints in both subtle and explicit ways.

While Smith, Yosso, and Solorzano (2007) in their study do not employ Kanter's (1977) framework around the experiences of persons in the numerical minority, they do provide some insight into the interaction of race and gender in organizations. Using a Critical Race Theory framework, they investigated the within schooling experiences of collegiate Black men at predominantly White institutions. In the aggregate, Smith et. al. (2007) characterized the perceptions of Black males as Black misandry, or the "exaggerated pathological aversion toward Black men created and reinforced in societal, institutional, and individual ideologies, practices, and behaviors (p. 563). Such misandric feelings created a sense that Black men did not belong on their respective college campuses; furthermore, the constant need to reaffirm one's existence within the university community affected, according to Smith et. al. (2007), the mental energy needed to focus on academic pursuits.

Discussion

The review of the literature above broadens Kanter's (1977) theory of tokenism or how being in the numerical minority within an organization affects experiences in that space. In trying to extend Kanter's theory around the three conditions experienced by tokens, namely performance pressure, boundary heightening, and role encapsulation, I have investigated how subsequent researchers have applied Kanter's theory to other numerical minorities outside of a corporate setting. Across hospitals with male nurses and female doctors (Floge & Merrill, 1986), police stations with female police officers Archbold and Schulz (2008), airline cabins with male flight attendants (Young & James, 2001), and schools with White and Black male teachers (Dworkin, Dworkin, & Chafetz, 1986), we find that individuals in the numerical minority experience the organization in

similar and distinct ways. Tokens spoke of similar expectations to perform in ways based on gender and racial/ethnic stereotypes that their colleagues held. For some tokens, however, such stereotypes became enabling and for others constraining.

A token's experiences within an organization appear to be tightly coupled with their status in the wider society. Thus, female tokens experienced greater constraints when compared to male tokens. Female tokens in male dominated settings, for example female doctors and police officers, described their experiences as encountering gender stereotypes that, in sum, negatively affected their work - for example patients believing female doctors to be nurses and female police officers perceiving that opportunities for advancement only came as a result of needing to fill a quota. This, however, was not as true with male tokens who, despite acknowledging performance pressures, boundary heightening, and role encapsulation, derive benefits in pink collar professions - hospital patients mistaking a male nurse for a doctor or the increased likelihood that a male teacher would assume an administrative position within a school.

One gap that this review of the literature attempts to fill around Kanter's (1977) theory of tokenism is to explore how tokens may benefit from being in the numerical minority, most notably men. Also missing from Kanter's original discussion was an exploration of race. While racial tokens experience some of the same responses as gender tokens, in organizational settings that serve the public, such as schools, teachers in the racial minority describe that they are uniquely placed to bridge their students' home culture with the school's academic environment. Moreover, being both a racial and gender token, or Black male, suggests that their responses to the organization might be both enabling and constraining. Within schools, Black men described feeling more

alienated than White male colleagues (Dworkin, Dworkin, & Chafetz, 1986). Similarly, Black men suggested that the degree to which they were tokens created a sense of increased boundary heightening (Fairchild et. al., 2012). Consequently, as we consider why Black men are more likely to leave the profession when compared to their peers, subsequent research should explore the varying ways Black men respond to their gender and racial token status and, more importantly, if they describe being in the numerical minority as one explanation for leaving their currently assigned school.

I have added one research question in light of Kanter's (1977) framework for understanding how persons in the numerical minority experience the organization and the recent literature on ethnic and minority tokens (Kelly, 2007).

What are Black male teachers' experiences with organizational dynamics of performance expectations, social boundaries, and role encapsulation?

As I am interested in the experiences of Black male teachers, I now turn to an examination of the literature of this sub-group to explore how it resonates with Kanter and/or provides a new way of understanding how the conditions in schools could influence the recruitment, experiences and retention of Black male teachers.

Black Male Teachers: In the Classroom

The empirical literature on Black male teachers continues to be in its embryonic stage. One reason for this is that they represent an extreme minority of the country's teaching force, two percent. The overwhelming majority of studies designed to explore the experiences of Black men have relied on relatively small sample sizes [e.g. n=10 (Bridges, 2011); n= 7 (Brockenbrough, 2009); n= 1 (Lynn, 2006); n= 1 (Rezai & Martino, 2010)]. Nonetheless, this burgeoning literature on Black male teachers is useful

in understanding how they experience schools. Below, I draw attention to this literature by discussing the ways in which Black men enact their practice, their challenges around navigating the organization, and their pathways into the profession. I end with describing the need for research for continued research that investigates Black male teachers' pathways into the profession.

The Teaching Practices of Black Men

Black male teachers are not a monolithic group. While there is a temptation to develop homogenous understandings of their pedagogy (Lynn, Johnson & Hassan, 1999; Lynn, 2006), it is important to recognize the multi-faceted dimension that they bring to the teaching profession. Specifically, the ways Black men teach their Black boys vary. Brown (2009) provides three types of pedagogy displayed by Black teachers, enforcer or one who “seeks abrupt and immediate enforcement of the defined expectations,” negotiator, or one who is “prone to asking questions, probing for answers and listening to students’ perspectives,” and playful, or one who “exchanges jokes, debate ideas and share personal experiences” (p. 424).

Despite their differences in how they implement curriculum, Black men characterize their work with students as that of social justice (Lewis, 2006; Lynn, Johnson & Hassan, 1999), particularly with their Black male students (Motley, 1999; Lynn & Jennings, 2009). More recently, as researchers have been able to complicate the varying ways Black men enact their practice, so too have they raised the need to develop a pluralistic understanding of the role of Black male teachers within schools (Brockenbrough, 2009; Rezai-Rashti & Martino, 2010). Such research suggests that not all Black men come to the teaching profession to be role models for their Black boys.

Additionally, researchers point to the need to recognize the continuum of sexual preferences among Black male teachers, which is absent from the present discourse of encouraging Black men to enter the profession to imbue to their male students a hetero-normative prescription of masculinity (Alexander, 2006; Boykin, 1996; Connell & Messerschmidt, 2005).

Challenges for Black Male Teachers in the Organization

Rezai and Martino (2010) discussed a case study analysis of one Black male elementary school teacher, with eight years of teaching experience; Andrew, their case study, is critical of reform efforts that view the recruitment of Black men as the elixir for improving the social and academic outcomes for Black boys. In their study, they used a queer, feminist, and anti-racist framework and conducted one semi-structured interview over two hours and found that their participant, Andrew, does not essentialize his success with Black male students as being exclusively a consequence of his race and gender. One factor that is important to Andrew's success was his work with boys outside of the classroom and in the community. As such, Rezai and Martino concluded that merely adding Black male bodies to the classroom will not improve the learning and social outcomes of Black boys; as we observe with Andrew, Black male teachers should have multiple roles if they will become effective teachers of Black boys.

Rezai and Martino's (2010) study is useful in that it provides a dissenting perspective on why Black male teachers might be ineffective at achieving certain outcomes, particularly around increased learning for Black boys. Despite policy makers' attempt to increase the percentage of Black men to save Black boys, they charge that is not enough. While a convincing argument, it becomes challenging to generalize such a

claim based on one respondent. Might we find other Black male teachers who are successful in their work with Black males despite having no connection with students outside of the classroom?

Brockenbrough (2012) builds on the literature that explores some of the challenges Black males encounter as they navigate the environments in which they teach, specifically the power relationships in schools that have historically been female dominated. He conducted three in-depth interviews with the eleven Black male secondary school teachers in a northeast urban school district. Using a life history method, Brockenbrough (2012) found that seven of his participants rarely, if ever, considered their male privilege within schools, but consistently identified with the more marginalized facets of their social location - being Black and male. In not acknowledging their male privilege, Brockenbrough noted that these Black male teachers engendered stereotypical views of women that rendered them subservient to men.

According to Brockenbrough, the perceptions that Black male participants had about women negatively affected their interactions with female colleagues. Respondents used castration metaphors to describe how, in their minds, female administrators – most of whom were Black – attempted to emasculate them in the workplace. To combat what they believed to be an oppressive gendered environment, Black male teachers suggested the need to work in more male-centered spaces where the administrator of choice would be a man.

While Brockenbrough (2012) described the border heightening, or the realization that Black men were acutely aware of how their gender influences their relationship with female administrators within schools, he made no allowance for acknowledging that his

participants' marginal status as Black men might indeed have a deleterious effect on their interactions with colleagues. Outside of Black male teachers' attempts to reassert perceived notions of gender hierarchy, why else might these teachers articulate their work environment as constraining? Such an expanded analysis is missing from Brokenbrough's discussion of Black male teachers.

Pathways into the Profession

Finally, quantitative data have provided some insight into the influences of why Black men enter the teaching profession. One study by Brown and Butty (2000) used logistic regression to examine the potential reasons Black men pursued a career in teaching within a suburban school district. The study found that, on average, most participants entered the teaching profession to "impart knowledge" (p.290). Similar to females and teachers of other ethnicities, the researchers found that Black men were more likely to remain in the teaching profession if they received adequate training in college and mentoring while as in-service teachers.

Lewis (2006) provided one of the few quantitative analyses of the varying influences of why Black male teachers entered the profession. He used survey data from 147 African-American male teachers across three urban school districts in Louisiana to examine how school districts could increase the number of Black men in K – 12 classrooms. Participants were between their first and third year of teaching. Lewis (2006) found that 60 percent of Black men were influenced to enter the profession based on a recommendation from a family member. The most influential reason these men entered the profession was to be of help to students, approximately 50 percent. Finally, Black male teachers expressed a desire to remain in the profession if they had greater job

security, believed they were contributing to humanity, and had a defined career ladder that would allow them to obtain administrative positions.

At a macro-level, Lewis (2006) provided insight into the importance that Black men place on entering the teaching profession - to be of influence in the lives of students. However, as is the case with a quantitative method, one is unable to decipher “the why.” Why, specifically, did Black men articulate a desire to help students? Why did they believe students were in need of help? Which students did Black male teachers suggest required the most help? One reason why Black male teachers asserted that they had entered the profession might be a result of their awareness of the current academic and social outcomes for Black boys. If this was the case, Black male teachers may articulate how their approach to teaching differed from their colleagues, for example. Specifically, they might discuss how in articulating a desire to be of help to Black boys, administrators and colleagues steered them to focus, exclusively, on improving the lot of Black boys, thus *role entrapment*. However, in the absence of in-depth interviews it becomes challenging to probe and explore what Black male teachers mean when they suggested their reason for entering the profession. In addition to understanding why Black male teachers decided to enter the profession, it might be useful also to consider why Black men choose particular schools in which to teach.

Given the gaps in the literature around Black male teachers’ pathways into the profession, another research question that I am curious to explore is -

What are Black male teachers’ pathways into the profession?

In sum only in the past decade have researchers turned their attention to an empirical investigation of Black male teachers. Almost all of this burgeoning research

has focused on exploring pathways into the profession (Lewis, 2006; Sealey-Ruiz & Lewis, 2011) and the teaching practices of Black male teachers (Bridges, 2011; Brockenbrough, 2012; Brown, 2009; Lynn, 2006). There has been almost no research that attempts to understand how the organizational conditions within schools shape the experiences of Black male teachers. My dissertation attempts to fill this empirical gap by exploring how the organizational conditions, characteristics, and dynamics in schools affect the recruitment, experiences, and retention of Black male teachers. Specifically, in this dissertation, I investigate and answer the following four research questions.

Research Questions:

- 1) What are Black male teachers' pathways into the profession?
- 2) Are there differences for teachers working in schools employing just one Black male teacher versus schools with larger numbers of Black male teachers?
- 3) What are Black male teachers' experiences with organizational dynamics of performance pressures, boundary heightening, and role encapsulation?
- 4) How do these organizational contexts and experiences affect teachers' plans to stay in their schools or in teaching?

Chapter IV

Research Methodology and Study Design: Phenomenological Case Study

As I indicated in Chapter Three, my study looks at how the organizational conditions in schools affect the pathways into the profession, experiences, and retention of Black male teachers. In particular this study explored how organizational conditions influenced the experiences of two groups of Black male teachers: Loners, or those teachers who are the only Black male teachers on the faculty, and Groupers, or those teachers in schools with many more Black male teachers.

Chapter Four begins, first, by describing my method, qualitative, and research strategy, phenomenology, that I employed to answer my research questions from Chapter Three; I also describe the theoretical underpinnings for my selected method and strategy and the context for the various sources from which I have drawn my data. Then, I explain how I collected and analyzed data: moreover, I address the study's limitations. Finally, I conclude the chapter by discussing how I allayed concerns regarding my subjectivity.

In analyzing data from the teacher surveys from the Black Male Teacher Environment Survey (BMTES), I used the quantitative method (i.e. descriptive statistics) to explore the "how many" (Maxwell, 2005). Specifically, I captured how many Black male teachers in racial and gender isolated spaces intended to leave their current schools in the upcoming year. My analysis of BMTES allowed me to get an impression, in the aggregate, of how many Black male teachers suggested they wanted to leave because of relationships with other colleagues, but I was unable to ascertain *why* respondents had these feelings. Furthermore, I was unable to probe how current challenges with colleagues compared to those at other schools.

While the quantitative method allows researchers to explore the "how many," it does

not allow researchers to ask the “why,” or why a particular phenomenon has occurred (Maxwell, 2005). Given the limitations of the quantitative method with regards to my research questions, I employed a qualitative method. The qualitative method allows the researcher to gather rich and in depth data about respondents’ experiences (Maxwell, 2005). In describing the utility of the qualitative method, Maxwell (2005) notes, "Understanding the particular context within which the participants act, and the influence that this context has on their actions (p. 22)." I am interested in exploring the organizational conditions within schools that affect the varied experiences of Black male teachers; a qualitative method, specifically the ability to analyze respondents’ descriptions, proved useful. Finally, employing a qualitative design captured the influences of why Black men remained or left a particular school or the profession. More specifically, this method allowed for gathering data that permitted a nuanced examination of the relationships between Black male teachers and their students, administrators, and colleagues. Such an examination, in the end, informed an understanding of how the interaction of both race and gender affected Black male teachers’ experiences in the organization.

Research Strategy

I used the qualitative method, specifically phenomenology (Creswell, 1998; Denzin & Lincoln, 2005; Patton, 1990) to understand Black male teachers’ experiences in schools. Given the absence of research that explores how organizational conditions affect the experiences of Black male teachers, a phenomenological study was most appropriate for the questions I answered.

In the early twentieth century, German philosopher Edmund Husserl developed

the theoretical underpinnings of phenomenology. Husserl (2001) posits that “each law for facts arises *from* experiences, which means that it can only be inductively based on individual experiences” (p. 43). Here, Husserl suggests that we can begin to understand the world around us, first, by considering our experiences in the world. An examination of individuals’ experiences is the means, not the end, to espoused theories. Induction, then, becomes central in phenomenology as one uses the specific experiences shared by individuals to create theories about how those individuals navigate the organization. Consequently, gathering rich data on the experiences of individuals is integral when devising theories about how those individuals navigate the unit of analysis, in this case schools.

Researchers conducting a phenomenological study are interested in understanding the essence of particular groups or individual’s experiences (Bogdan & Biklen, 2007). As one of this project’s research questions is, how are the organizational responses for Black men teaching in racial and gendered isolated settings similar or different to Black men teaching in schools with multiple Black male teachers, any attempt to answer this question requires, first, an understanding of Black male teachers’ varied experiences within schools. Not only does a phenomenological study allow the researcher to describe “what people experience and how it is that they experience what they experience” (Patton, 1990, p.71), but it then requires researchers to look for the underlying meaning (Creswell, 1998) in the ways respondents talk about their experiences. A researcher employing a phenomenological strategy cannot adopt a passive posture in merely listening to respondents’ experiences, but must also consider how those experiences might inform a burgeoning theory or “law for facts” (Husserl, 2001).

Setting and Sample

Setting: Boston Public Schools

Given the backdrop of Boston Public Schools's (BPS) federal court order to desegregate schools in the 1970s and to increase the number of Black teachers, coupled with the district's current recruitment efforts to diversify the teaching force, BPS is an ideal setting for studying the experiences of Black male teachers in organizations.

Geographically situated in the northeast, BPS is the country's oldest and one of the largest urban public school systems. Similar to many of the nation's other urban school districts, BPS has a significant "achievement gap" between its students of color and White students, which is most pronounced around gender. In 2010, 40% of Black male students read below grade level, when compared to 18% of White male students. Further, 50% of Black males graduate within four years, as compared to 60% of White males (Schott, 2012).

The city and the district remain under a 1974 federal court desegregation order, which became known as the *Garrity Decision* (see *Morgan v. Hennigan*, 379 F. Supp. 410 [D.C. Mass., June 21, 1974]). In 1973, Black families brought suit against BPS for maintaining a highly segregated school system and for their refusal to hire Black male teachers. Below is an excerpt from the federal complaint:

Plaintiffs have alleged that the city defendants have intentionally brought about and maintained racial segregation in the ... public schools by various actions, including the adoption and maintenance of pupil assignment policies, the establishment and manipulation of attendance areas and district lines reflecting segregated residential patterns, the establishment of grade structures and feeder patterns, the administration of school capacity, enlargement, and construction policies, transportation practices, and by unjustifiably failing to adopt or implement policies reasonably available to eliminate racial segregation in the ... public schools. Plaintiffs assert that these alleged practices have resulted in denying black school children the

equal protection of the laws, in violation of the Fourteenth Amendment to the United States Constitution. Plaintiffs further contend that the city defendants and their predecessors have engaged in racial discrimination with respect to the hiring and assignment of faculty and staff, and with respect to curricula and the allocation of instructional materials, and resources.

In 1974, Judge Garrity sided with the plaintiffs and ordered BPS to integrate its schools; consequently, the city began a busing program that continued through the data collection period for this study. In 2012, – 2013 school year, the district was projected to spend \$80 million dollars in transportation costs (i.e. busing) to comply with the federal court order (Russell & Ebbert, 2011). Judge Garrity also required the district to increase, to 25%, the number of Black teachers in the district to reflect the percentage of Black students in the district at that time. Specifically, the federal judge mandated that BPS hire a Black teacher for every newly hired White teacher.

Students' racial composition shifted greatly after the federal court ruling. Today, public data suggest that the student population is approximately 41% Latino, 36% Black, 13% White, and 9% Asian; a large percentage of White families chose parochial schools or moved out of the district. The teaching force has also become more diverse: 62% are White, 10% are Hispanic, 5% are Asian, and 23% are Black.

In early 2012, BPS came under fire by the Boston City Council for not being in compliance with the federal court order to have 25% Black teachers. At one city council meeting, a councilman declared: "There's a problem here...we are not in federal compliance." Another asserted: "I can't fathom why we have schools that don't have a single Latino teacher in a system that is 40 percent Latino students, a system that is more and more diverse by the week." Then BPS Superintendent, Carol Johnson, agreed that while there have been improvements in teachers' racial composition, there was much

more that the district should do to come into compliance with the federal court order.

At a school committee meeting in March 2012, the superintendent outlined the district's on-going mission to "Recruit, hire, retain, and support a diverse workforce that competently meets the cultural and linguistic needs of [the district's] student population. Increase [the district's] ability to serve the diverse cultural learning needs of students and better engage the diversity of [the district's] community. Some of the current district initiatives to diversify the pool of teachers are through the continued cultivation of relationships with higher education institutions with large percentages of students of color. Additionally, the district started to provide test preparation courses on the state teacher licensure exam for perspective teachers of color in recognition that persons of color fail these exams at disproportionate rates when compare to White test takers. More recently, the district has mandated that the Boston Teacher Residency Program (BTR), a 12-month teacher training program, increase the number of Black and Latino candidates by 40%. However, Superintendent Johnson suggested that the district could do more to increase the diversity of its teachers; as such, she created a teacher diversity work group to study teachers of color's recruitment and retention patterns.

One way BPS decided to study the recruitment and retention patterns of teachers of color is through the 2012 Black Male Teacher Environment Survey (BMTES). Of all BPS teachers, 23% are Black, 5.8% are Black men. In actual numbers, from the 4,556 teachers in BPS - 266 are Black males. Designed under the auspices of the Office of the Achievement Gap, Superintendent Johnson sent, through email, the Black Male Teacher Environment Survey, noted in Chapter Two, to all full-time Black male teachers of record in the district in which she described BPS's continued efforts to increase the

number of teachers of color. She also added BMTES will assist the district in understanding how Black male teachers: “experienced recruitment and retention support in the district... we believe that this data will be valuable to the district as we improve our efforts to recruit and maintain a diverse workforce.”

Sample: Black Male Teachers

As noted above, at the end of 2012-2013 approximately six percent of teachers were Black men. The district categorizes schools by four distinct grade spans: K -5 (elementary); K - 8 (elementary/middle); 6 - 8 (middle); 9 -12 (high school). Black male teachers in BPS were, on average, more likely to teach in secondary schools (see Table 4.1). In 2012-2013, 61 percent of all Black male teachers taught in the 9 -12 grade span; 17 and 16 percent in the 6 - 8 and K - 8 grade spans, respectively. Six percent of all Black male teachers taught in the K - 5 grade span.

Table 4.1: 2012 -2013 Distribution of Black Male Teachers Across Grade Spans by Percentage

	K - 5	K-8	6-8	9-12
Black Male Teachers	6%	17%	16%	61%

Based on human resource data for all of the district’s schools and teachers from the 2012 – 2013 school year, Black male teachers were more likely to teach in schools with a Black principal (see Table 4.2). School level data from the table show that schools without Black male teachers are more likely to have a White principal. However, schools with three or more Black male teachers are more likely to have a Black principal. White principals comprised slightly more than half, fifty-six percent, of BPS school leaders where there were no Black male teachers on staff. In comparison, about one-third, thirty-one percent, of all district schools without a Black male teacher on the faculty had a

Black principal.

Table 4.2: 2012- 2013 BPS Schools that have 0, 1, 2 or 3 or more Black Teachers Disaggregated by the Percentage of the Principal’s Race

Black Male Teachers	Number of Schools	Principal’s Race			
		Black	White	Latino	Asian
0 ¹	32	31%	56%	9%	3%
1	28	43%	43%	10%	7%
2	15	40%	53%	7%	0%
3 or more	43	55%	32%	13%	0%

When compared to Black principals, a disproportionately low number of White principals led schools with three or more Black male teachers. Exactly the same percentage of Black and White principals led schools with one Black male teacher, forty-three percent. The overall percentage of Latino school leaders increased, marginally, when there were more Black men on the faculty: from nine percent with no Black male teachers to thirteen percent with three or more Black men on the faculty. There was some variation between the relationship of Asian school leaders and Black male teachers in that three percent and seven percent led schools without a Black man and one Black man on the faculty, respectively. There were no Asian principals who led schools with three or more Black men on the faculty. Finally, out of the approximately 118 BPS schools, there were slightly more Grouper schools, 43, than Loner schools, 28.

BPS schools without Black male teachers were more likely to be elementary schools (see Table 4.3). Similarly, Loners were highly concentrated in elementary schools. And, schools with three or more Black male teachers were more likely to be high

schools.

Table 4.3: 2012 -2013 Percentage of BPS Schools that have 0, 1, 2 or 3 or more Black Teachers Distributed Across Grade Spans

Black Male Teachers	%K - 5	%K-8	%6-8	% 9-12
0 ¹	66	28	3	3
1	50	18	4	28
2	53	31	7	33
3 or more	19	9	19	53

School Selection

To understand how varying schools’ organizational dynamics influenced Black male teachers’ experiences, I selected many schools - fourteen to be exact. By looking at multiple schools, I was able to investigate how varying contexts - the number of Black men on the faculty and on the staff, other male teachers of color, the size of the school, elementary or high school, the number of students of color - affected the experiences of Black male teachers.

In Chapter Three I developed one working hypothesis: Black men who were the only Black male teacher on a school’s faculty experienced school differently than those on a faculty composed of many more Black male teachers. Selecting schools where there was only one Black male teacher and other schools where there were many more, (e.g. three or more Black male teachers) allowed me to test my hypothesis. With this hypothesis, I am attempting to understand how this sub-group’s numerical representation within the organization can influence interactions with colleagues and decisions about retention.

I used a purposive sample when selecting schools. The district provided me with

human resource data that included the number of Black men in each school. From this list, I chose schools that had one Black male teacher, as well as schools with three or more Black male teachers (see Table 4.4). I attempted to capture the range of schools BPS's students can attend, i.e. regular district, turnaround (reconstituted), pilot (semi-autonomous), innovation (federally funded; autonomous), and exam schools, as described in Table 4.4.

After identifying schools, I sent an email to Grouper principals. I also included a recruitment letter for participants (See Appendix A). I asked principal's permission to participate in the study. For those principals who did not respond to my email, I visited the schools and asked participants directly if they would like to participate. I used a similar recruitment strategy for Loners. Except, here, I visited selected schools and asked participants directly. My decision to approach Loners, as opposed to contacting their principals first, was an attempt to decrease the likelihood that their confidentiality would be violated and they could be identified.

I selected fourteen schools, in particular two types of schools - two Loner and two Grouper schools at the elementary and high level. While my analysis across schools took many forms, I chose comparison schools with similar percentages of students on free or reduced lunch, as a crude attempt to control for socio-economic status during analysis. I also selected schools that captured the district's racial diversity.

I present demographic data from the 2012 - 2013 school year for each of the fourteen schools in the study (see Table 4.4). Many of the selected schools, like Boston itself, reflect a growing Latino population. In fact, in many schools the majority of students were Latino. On average, the seven Loner and seven Grouper schools in my

sample were representative of the 28 Loner and 43 Grouper schools in BPS. These similarities included students' SES, grade level distribution (e.g. elementary, K – 8, and high school), and school size. There were, however, slight differences between my sample when compared to Loner and Grouper schools in the district. My sample did not include any pilot (semi-autonomous) Grouper schools. However, two of the 43 Grouper schools were pilots. Also, I have more Grouper schools with Black principals in my sample, 71%, than there were in the district, 55%. Likewise, I have under sampled White principals in Grouper schools, 14%, when compared to the number of White Grouper principals in the district, 32%. To approximate the number of Black and White Grouper principals in my study, I would have needed to substitute about one school led by a Black principal for one school led by a White principal. In the end, given the robust number of schools in this study, 14, I do not believe these differences, on average, between Black and White Grouper greatly influenced the findings in the following chapters.

Table: 4.4: 2012-2013 School Demographic Data for Sample Schools

School Name	School Type	School Composition	Principal Race/ Gender	#Teachers	%Black Male Teachers	%Black Teachers	%White Teachers	%White Students	%Black Students
Race to the Top Elementary	1Innovation	Loner	White Male	18	6	22	67	30	24
Roseville Elementary	2Pilot	Loner	White Female	51	2	22	57	3	51
Alberto Schomburg High	Dual Language	Loner	Latina Female	27	4	15	41	6	2
South High	2Pilot	Loner	White Female	40	3	15	65	7	38
Grand Case Pilot High	2Pilot	Loner	Black Male	12	8	15	75	30	28
Marcus Garvey K-8	Regular District	Loner	Black Female	38	3	24	50	3	25
Apple Elementary	2Pilot	Loner	White Female	30	3	20	63	26	36
Cross Roads K -8	Regular District	Grouper	Black Female	35	12	40	60	3	53
Crispus Attucks Elementary	Converting to Turnaround	Grouper	Black Female	52	8	44	48	2	72
Clarke High	Regular District	Grouper	Black Male	102	5	10	70	16	14
Ralph Emerson High	Exam	Grouper	White Latina Female	78	5	14	68	29	29
Washington Irving High	3Turnaround	Grouper	Black Female	72	6	47	39	1	68
Explorations Charter	Charter	Grouper	Black Male	17	12	59	24	1	70
Thomas Jefferson High	3Turnaround	Grouper	Latina Female	95	10	41	31	3	37

Innovation schools received their initial funding from the state's Race to the Top allotment. These schools have flexibility in hiring and school budgeting.

²Pilot schools have autonomy over more hiring and school budgeting than district schools. Teachers are part of the Boston Teachers Union.

³Turnaround schools were previously failing, as measured by student performance on state standardized exams. Principals were replaced and teachers were required to reapply for their jobs.

⁴The percentage of students who qualify for free or reduced lunch.

Method for data collection: In-depth Interviews and Observations

My two primary sources of data – interviews (see Appendices B and C) and observational field notes - allowed me to answer my research questions. I used an audio recorder for each interview. I then sent the recording to a transcription company that transcribed each interview. Interviews provide one source of information to answer research questions (Maxwell, 2005). Over the course of my interviews, I inquired about how the organizational factors influenced the ways in which Black male teachers experienced schools by using an adapted form of the in-depth phenomenologically based interview structure created by Dolbeare and Schuman (Schuman, 1982) and improved upon by Seidman (2006). Seidman (2006) suggests that the in-depth phenomenologically based interview is characterized by open-ended questions within a semi-structured framework; semi-structured interviews give space for participants to introduce new concepts, while also keeping uniformed themes across subjects (Knapp, 1997).

Seidman (2006) notes that interview data should be collected across three separate periods, or waves; collecting data from more than one wave allows the researcher to gather a rich and complex telling of the interviewees' experiences. In the first wave, according to Seidman (2006), the researcher should ask participants to share his life history. Such questions might include asking respondents to share memories of being a Black male in school, recount those teachers who had the greatest influence on his life, and inquiring about how many Black male teachers did he have during his K -12 schooling experience. In the second wave, interviewees describe the details of the experience. Specifically, one could ask “Who are some of the teachers you interact with socially outside of the classroom?” or “How does being a Black male influence your

relationship between with your colleagues and students?” Finally, in the third wave, the researcher should focus on having participants “make sense” (p.12) of their experiences across both interviews. Again, such questions might be “What is influencing your decision to return in the fall?”

As I mentioned above, I used a modified version of Seidman’s Three Interview Series. Specifically, I conducted two waves of interviews with study participants (see Appendix A). I combined the first and second waves, life history and details of the experience. This decision was based on my analysis of BMTES (see Chapter Two) where I developed a working impression of some of the demographic patterns across approximately one-third of district Black male teachers and this project’s focus on how organizational conditions affect Black male teachers’ experience within school and retention. Also, the focus for this study was less about participants’ life histories and more about their experiences in the organization.

Since Loner schools by definition had just one Black male teacher, I interviewed that individual in each Loner school. For my Grouper schools, I used a purposive sample to select teachers. Specifically, I selected teachers in varying core content areas (e.g. English and Language Arts, math, science, and/or social studies), as well as physical education. I selected Black male teachers in Grouper schools to interview until I reached data saturation of the organizational characteristics influencing respondents’ experiences. Specifically, I interviewed two – four teachers in each Grouper school.

After analyzing data from the first wave (see below for a more complete discussion of analysis), I conducted a second wave of interviews informed by preliminary

findings. During the second wave of interviews, I asked participants to engage in meaning making (Seidman, 2003) around their experiences as Black men within the organization. As part of this project's focus is on understanding how the within school experiences affect Black male teachers' decision to stay or leave their current schools, I was able to capture those teachers who were considering changing schools, specifically, or leaving the profession, more generally. In the end I conducted two waves of interviews with twenty-four participants. Two participants left their schools during the data collection period. And, due to constant scheduling conflicts, I was unable to interview another participant.

In addition to interviews, I also collected data through observations (Creswell, 2007; Gold, 1958). My observation records were primarily hand-written notes. Gold (1958) suggests the observer is used in "community studies," where the researcher "observes formally, as in scheduled interview situations: and at other times he observes informally" (p.220). In the study's initial design, I planned to spend time, over multiple visits, observing informants in school. Such formal observations were intended to take the form of witnessing the respondent's interaction with other members in the organization. However, while many school principals approved of my talking to the Black male teachers on their faculty, these principals were resistant to my observing whole school or small learning community meetings. One school, Explorations, the only charter school in the study, did allow me to observe a whole school meeting. In lieu of formal observations, I conducted informal observations. These observations took place primarily before the semi-structured interview. Typically, I arrived about ten minutes before the mutually agreed upon time to get some insight into participant's day-to-day

interactions and experiences. In the end, data collected through participant observation consisted primarily of field notes (Creswell, 2007).

Data Analysis

This is a study of teachers. My variable of interest, however, is teachers' organizational context. Teachers nested within different organizational contexts served as my unit of analysis. These teachers, Black men, served as my primary source of data. Through an analysis of interview and field observation data on individual teachers nested within schools, I gained insight into how the organizational conditions inside the school influences the experiences of Black male teachers. My analysis of interview and field observations was informed by the work of Miles and Huberman (1994). Miles and Huberman (1994) suggest that analyzing data becomes an iterative process whereby the researcher uses analysis of data to inform a second round of data collection. As such, an early analysis focused on analyzing my first round of interview data to inform the types of questions I asked during the second round of data collection.

Immediately after interviewing each participant, I completed a Contact Summary Form (Miles & Huberman, 1994). This form (see Appendix D) allowed me to reflect on the interview, while also allowing me to determine on what themes I should focus during the second round of interviews. Specifically, some of the information in the contact summary sheet included questions such as "What were the main issues or themes raised by this fieldwork? Do you have any particular impressions or observations?" "What hypotheses, speculations, or unresolved questions were raised for you?" and What (if anything) do we need to ask/look for in round 2?"

To guard against data overload and to focus my analysis around answering my

research questions, I began my analysis by coding interview transcripts. These codes, or tags, allowed me to ascribe meaning to smaller units of data collected (Miles & Huberman, 1994). To assist my coding, I began, first, by organizing and preparing the data for analysis (Creswell, 2009). To organize and prepare data for analysis, I cleaned data, or corrected misspelled words or phrases, after transcription. Next, I read through each transcript to develop a sense of its overall meaning (Creswell, 2009).

As I coded individual teacher interview data, I employed two approaches. First, I used the literature in Chapter Three to create codes, also known as etic coding. Etic coding relies on the researcher analyzing data based on theories developed outside of the organization (Lett, 1990). For example, one of the theoretical frameworks central to this study is how the numerical composition of members in an organization affect the experiences of those in the minority. As such, my etic codes relied on analyzing how Black male teachers responded to being either the only Black male teacher on the faculty or one of many Black male teachers on the faculty through the experiences of performance pressure, boundary heightening, and role entrapment.

I also used emic coding, which allowed for the creation of codes grounded, first, in what participants described as their meaning-making within the organization (Lett, 1990). Emic coding presumed that there may be gaps in the espoused theoretical framework that are best fit by analyzing what respondents say about their experiences. After using both etic and emic coding, I collapsed codes with the same theme into categories and identified the patterns that emerge (Miles & Huberman, 1994). I looked for both similarities and variations in patterns. I also summarized observed patterns for individual teachers and aggregated them to make claims at the school level. In the end, I

conducted both a within school type (e.g. Loner and Grouper) and cross school analysis (e.g. Loner compared to Grouper) to look at patterns in schools with the same and different numerical composition of Black male teacher. With evidence based observations and analysis within and across cases, I answer my four research questions. I used a cross-walk table as a way to align my research questions with interview questions (See Appendix E). I used Nvivo, a qualitative data analysis software, to assist my organizing and analysis of created codes and categories.

Validity Threats

Maxwell (1996) describes several threats to the validity of qualitative research. Maxwell describes *interpretation validity* as the researcher's failure to allow respondents to describe their true experiences. To guard against this, I avoided asking leading questions and have included several probes in my interview protocol to allow Black male teachers to describe how they experience the organization. In particular, I had my first wave of interview questions evaluated by three faculty members during my dissertation proposal hearing in order to ensure they were not leading. And, I had two professors at Harvard University, Ronald Ferguson and Susan Moore Johnson, assess my second round interview questions.

Additionally, Maxwell (1996) suggests that *theory validity* prevents the researcher from including competing theories in his framework. To ensure that my theoretical framework was malleable, I have added a research question that is exploratory in nature in which I acknowledged that there may be unaccounted for organizational dynamics in schools that influence the experiences of Black male teachers. Moreover, I have addressed places where Kanter's (1977) theory on the experiences of predominantly

White women failed to capture the experiences of the Black male participants in my study. Furthermore, I introduced new theories to explain participants' experiences that I had not considered in my original framework.

Researcher Subjectivity

One characteristic of qualitative researchers is their subjectivity in that their social location may inform how they theorize, collect and analyze data about the phenomenon they desire to study (Lichtman, 2006). As a Black male and former secondary school teacher, I am aware that my analytical framework, interactions with respondents, and analysis were influenced by my own experiences in schools. When I began my career as a teacher, I was a Loner. When I moved to my second school, I was a Grouper. During my data collection and analysis, I had to guard against conflating my experiences with those of my participants. Such awareness of my social location, or reflexivity (Luttrell, 2010), influenced the study's design, particularly one of secondary questions that acknowledged that there may be organizational characteristics in my framework for which I had not accounted. One such example was around pathways into the profession, specifically the relationship between participants' background characteristics and the schools in which they decided to teach. As a Black male researcher conducting research on Black males, it was important to listen, with attention, to how each participant described his in school experiences to avoid treating all Black male teachers as a monolithic group.

Peshkin (1988) provides several ways researchers can be attuned to their subjectivity and understand its influence during the data collection and analysis process. Specifically, he notes that an Ethnic-Maintenance subjectivity entices the researcher to value respondents who discuss their experiences in the organization through an ethnic

rather than an assimilationist lens. Peshkin (1988) suggests, then, that the researcher attempts to allow interviewees to describe the school through multiple lenses. For my study, it was important to allow Black male teachers an opportunity to define their experiences in ways that they choose and, in my analysis, ascribe value to an assimilation perspective if one was described. One specific example was when one participant declared he was a “gay Black male;” this participant noted that his sexuality, more so than his race and gender, informed the ways in which he navigated the organization.

Most importantly, Peshkin (1998) discusses a Justice-Seeking I in which the researcher observes an injustice taking place and is unable to talk, objectively, about the phenomenon under investigation. To this end, while Black male teachers might share experiences where they have encountered racism, for example, it became important, in my analysis, to see such descriptions as one of many influences for respondents.

Finally, I believe that being a Black male allowed many participants to speak freely and openly about the challenges they experienced in their schools. In introducing myself to participants, I noted that I was a former teacher. As such, participants may have assumed that I could understand their experiences. One way participants believed I could identify with what they shared during the interview was best observed through comments such as “you know what I mean” or “you know what it’s like.” During these moments, it was important to push participants to expound on the stories.

Chapter V Pathways into the Profession

In this section, I explore study participants’ pathways into the teaching profession. This chapter has two purposes: to use vignettes to introduce each of the study participants and to draw attention to patterns that influenced their decisions to enter teaching. Below, I provide the pseudonyms for each of the 27 study participants and their schools (See Table 5.1). I also provide the school composition (e.g. Loner [schools with one Black male teacher] or Grouper [schools with more than three Black male teachers), grade level and content taught for each participant.

Table 5.1: Participants’ School, School Type, and Grade Level, and Content Area

Participant	School Name	School Composition	Grade Level	Content
James Price	Race to the Top Elementary	Loner	Elementary	All subjects
Josiah Washington	Roseville Elementary	Loner	Middle	Math
Benjamin Young	Alberto Schomburg K – 8	Loner	Elementary	Physical Education
Kurt Sharpton	South High	Loner	High	Physical Education
Dennis Sangster	Marcus Garvey K - 8	Loner	Middle	English
Wole Achebe	Grand Case Pilot	Loner	High	English
Peter Baldwin	Apple Elementary	Loner	Elementary	All subjects
Jacob Collins	Cross Roads K -8	Grouper	Elementary	All subjects

Amilcar Depina	Cross Roads K -8	Grouper	Elementary/ Middle	Physical Education
Eddie Rock	Cross Roads K -8	Grouper	Elementary	Theatre Arts
Joseph Nkrumah	Crispus Attucks Elementary	Grouper	Elementary	All subjects
Adebayo Adjayi	Crispus Attucks Elementary	Grouper	Elementary	All subjects
Henry Groover	Crispus Attucks Elementary	Grouper	Elementary	Physical Education
Leroy Jackson	Clarke High	Grouper	High	Physical Education
Slaughter Gibson	Clarke High	Grouper	High	Social Studies
Kendall Robeson	Clarke High	Grouper	High	Spanish
Samuel Soyinka	Clarke High	Grouper	High	Physics
Roger Manley	Ralph Emerson Exam High	Grouper	High	Physics
Hugh Ferguson	Ralph Emerson Exam High	Grouper	High	Math
Matthew Morial	Washington Irving High	Grouper	High	English
Kanye Carter	Washington Irving High	Grouper	High	English
Pierce Bond	Explorations Charter	Grouper	High	Math
Okonkwo Sutton	Explorations Charter	Grouper	High	English
Lawrence Graham	Explorations Charter	Grouper	High	Physical Education
Christopher Brooks	Thomas Jefferson	Grouper	High	Math

George Little	Thomas Jefferson	Grouper	High	Social Studies
Dante Smith	Thomas Jefferson	Grouper	High	English

Early Experiences in Teaching

Participants in this study were most likely to suggest having an early experience teaching as one influence on their decisions to become teachers. More than half of all participants believed that an opportunity to teach when in high school, college, after college, or substitute teaching facilitated their choice to enter the teaching profession. Guarino, Lucrecia, and Daley's (2004) meta-analysis of teacher recruitment and retention found that teachers of color were initially resistant to entering the teaching profession because of their perceptions that students of color would present behavioral challenges. Participants in this study may have shared a similar sentiment before considering a career as a teacher. However, here the Black male teachers noted a sense of surprise that students not only listened, but also appeared engaged and learned during these encounters. Consequently, these initial successes outside of being a teacher of record influenced participants' decisions to enter the teaching profession.

Below, I provide the frequency for each reason participants cited as an influence for entering the teaching profession (See Table 5.2). As one will observe, some participants cited several reasons for entering the teaching profession. Below, I draw attention to participants' primary reasons for choosing to become a teacher, namely an early experience teaching and having a male educator of color serve as a role model.

Table 5.2: Influences for Why Participants Decided to Enter the Teaching Profession

Participant (n = 27)	Early Teaching Experience (n=18)	Male Role Model (n=7)	College Course (n=3)	Ineffective Teacher (n=2)	Service Obligation (n=1)	Societal Pressure (n=1)
James Price	x					
Josiah Washington	x	x				
Benjamin Young	x					
Kurt Sharpton	x					
Dennis Sangster		x	x			
Wole Achebe	x	x				
Peter Baldwin	x					
Jacob Collins	x					
Amilcar Depina				x		
Eddie Rock	x					
Joseph Nkrumah		x				
Adebayo Adjayi		x				x
Henry Groover	x	x				
Leroy Jackson	x	x				

Slaughter Gibson	x					
Kendall Robeson	x					
Samuel Soyinka	x					
Roger Manley					x	
Hugh Ferguson			x			
Matthew Morial	x					
Kanye Carter			x			
Pierce Bond	x					
Okonkwo Sutton	x					
Lawrence Graham	x					
Christopher Brooks				x		
George Little	x					
Dante Smith			x			

Crossroads Elementary: Jacob Collins and Eddie Rock

Jacob Collins, 35, a 10-year veteran, is in his first year at Crossroads Elementary.

Born and educated in the south, Collins taught in two elementary schools before deciding to relocate to the New England area to attend graduate school. He described how, as a high school student working at a summer camp as a teacher’s aide, the lead teacher

encouraged him to teach a lesson to a group of elementary school students. He remembered the lead teacher saying, “You can teach on anything, but I want you to get in front of the class and teach a lesson.” It was this early experience and in particular students’ positive responses to what and how he taught that “launched [him] into teaching.”

While Collins described an early teaching experience in high school, the decision to teach, for other Black male teachers in the study, came through teaching opportunities while in college. Eddie Rock, 34, a bi-racial veteran Theatre Arts teacher at Crossroads, worked as an assistant teacher in a Beverly Hills synagogue after college. After being laid-off during the economic downturn following 9/11, Rock returned to school. For Rock, the decision to teach was a consequence of the “synagogue experience, between the positive experience I had growing up as a student, between my affinity for working with youth it all seemed to kind of point me in the right direction, in the direction of being a teacher.”

Clarke High: Samuel Soyinka

Samuel Soyinka, a physics teacher in his fourth year at Clarke, was born and attended primary, secondary, and tertiary schooling in West Africa. Soyinka earned a PhD in the sciences at an institution in the Boston area. In addition to describing that teaching “runs in the family,” Soyinka described when [he] was in college, actually, both secondary and college, [he] taught [his] fellow classmates solve the more difficult problems.” These early teaching experiences, imprints, proved influential in Soyinka’s decision to become a teacher: “I felt it was just part of me to teach to a very large extent.”

Washington Irving High: Matthew Morial

Matthew Morial, 29, in his first year at Washington Irving, a turnaround school, previously taught for two years at Thomas Jefferson High, a turnaround school. Most of Morial's schooling, high school and college, was in the South East. After spending a year and a half as a chef, Morial described having to "reevaluate his life after a friend died." "I was kind of like partying a lot and stuff... I reevaluated what I was doing and like my impact on the world or society," he suggested. Morial, then, started working at an after-school tutoring position in a socio-economically disadvantaged part of the city. In the after-school program, he assisted worked with elementary students on "creative projects" and "sports." The school's principal, on observing him during the spring, "approached [Morial] about a third grade opening" for the fall. During that summer, he enrolled in an alternative teacher preparation program. Morial did not believe this program prepared him to deal with the many challenges students brought to the classroom. Consequently, acting on the advice of a girlfriend, he considered applying to three urban teacher residency programs in New York, Chicago, and Boston. He found New York City "overwhelming" being "a country kind of guy." Ultimately, he decided on the program in Boston because it was "far superior than the one in Chicago."

Thomas Jefferson High: George Little and Christopher Brooks

An "army brat," George Little, 29, spent much of his primary school experience in several states. His family finally settled in Boston where he attended a BPS high school. After graduating from a historically Black university, Little returned to Boston where he taught in "an adolescent unit at a psychiatric hospital." For "adolescents who were there for weeks or in some cases, months," there were classrooms where students

attended school, noted Little. Little said, “My favorite time was being in a classroom helping them out... connecting with youth who [were] going through all sorts of traumatic issues.” This experience, he noted, “kind of pushed me into education.” Jefferson is in his third year at Thomas Jefferson, a turnaround school.

Thomas Jefferson High School: Christopher Brooks and Dante Smith

Christopher Brooks, 26, was born in a working-class Black community in Boston. In describing his class status, he inquired if “there was something lower than working class?” In responding to his rhetorical question, he suggested, “Dead broke. I was the youngest of seven children coming from a single parent household. I’m talking about we were broke. We were past broke.” Brooks’s parents and many of his older siblings were born in Haiti. He admits that he has lost much of his ability to speak Haitian Creole, his first language. However, there were times during our interview when he reverted to speaking Haitian Creole. When describing his mother’s reaction to his lackluster performance in high school, Brooks, unconsciously, used the term “Saiwan” or a shame. Attending BPS from K – 12, Brooks graduated from one of the district’s exam schools. Thereafter, he attended an in-state university that specializes in engineering and studied engineering. After working for two years as an engineer, Brooks left, describing his office job as “not sociable” and “not for him.”

During a job fair, a recruiter from a teacher education program encouraged Brooks to apply. Brooks based his decision to apply because he had “always tutored and mentored in high school and in college as a little side hustle to make extra money. So, when a door opened up to become a teacher I was like yeah, why not.” In his third year in the profession, all of which have been at Jefferson, Brooks teaches 9th grade Algebra.

Race to the Top Elementary: James Price

James Price was born and raised on the West Coast and is a second year teacher at Race to the Top Elementary School; he had not intended on becoming a teacher. While participating in an after-school tutoring program at his historically Black college, he came to realize that “education was pretty awesome,” particularly as a result of seeing students grow “academically, socially, [and] emotionally.” Price believed, more generally, that a policy aimed at providing Black men with early classroom experience was essential for increasing their numbers in the profession: “As far as getting Black males involved in teaching aspect, I really feel that providing opportunities where Black males can actually go in the classroom during the undergrad years [and] getting that exposure is very important.” Subsequently, Prince enrolled in an alternative teacher training program. He relocated to the Boston area because his wife started a graduate program at a local university.

Explorations Charter School: Lawrence Graham, Okonkwo Sutton, Pierce Bond

Lawrence Graham, 25, is a first year teacher at Explorations Charter School; he teaches and directs physical education (his official title is wellness director). Born and raised in an upper-middle class family in New England, a state college in Michigan recruited Graham to play hockey. After the school closed its hockey program, he transferred to a state university in Massachusetts and continued playing hockey. Majoring in psychology, Graham, after graduation, worked two jobs as a fitness instructor at a national gym chain and an after-school organization. During his tenure at the after-school program, Graham admitted that he “stumbled across a career in teaching” while working with students at Explorations. The teachers who brought students to the after-school program observed that he was “good with the kids.” They encouraged him to apply for a

job because, according to them, Graham was “qualified” and “capable of doing [the job a physical education teacher].” Initially enticed by the stability and “financial security,” Graham likes that Explorations is “innovative” and that there are opportunities to grow and develop, both his professional skills and the department’s vision. During the hiring process he learned that his position would require adding to the “basic skeleton” of the wellness program, which [he] found “exciting.”

Okonkwo Sutton, 25, was born and raised in Boston. He is of West African descent and is a first year English teacher at Explorations Charter School. Sutton described his class status as a child as “working class;” he attended a private high school on scholarship and then a private selective liberal arts college in New England. Sutton suggested, he never “saw himself as a teacher” until a college internship brought him back to his former high school. Sutton found most rewarding the opportunity to “pour [his] knowledge into the kids and watch them grow...” After graduating from college, Sutton enrolled and received in a graduate degree in education from a university in the Boston area.

Pierce Bond, 25, is a first-year math teacher at Explorations Charter School. Bond, whose father is African and mother White American, noted that he was an “African-American in the true sense of the word.” He attended boarding schools and a suburban high school outside of D.C. Before assuming his position at Explorations, Bond served in the Peace Corps. Although his work focused on development, he described “mostly enjoying the work I was doing with local youth and spending most of my time in the classroom and school system observing and contributing to English lessons.”

Moreover, Bond suggested that when his commitment to the Peace Corps ended and he returned to the U.S., “education seemed like a natural next step.”

Apple Pilot Elementary: Peter Baldwin

Peter Baldwin, 32, and of Haitian descent, was born and raised in a suburb outside of Boston. He described his class status when growing up as “working-class,” but lived in and attended public schools that were predominantly white and middle and upper-middle class. From high school, he attended a highly ranked state university, majoring in business administration. As an undergraduate, Baldwin considered teaching because of his volunteer work with a national mentoring program. “After my experience working with [the mentoring program], I wanted to do something that was a bit more fulfilling than the options that I was pursuing at the time. Teaching seemed like a good way to be able to have a positive impact in people’s lives, and also do work that I felt was rewarding and valuable,” he recalled. However, to major or even minor in education would have prolonged Baldwin’s tenure in college, which was not an option because of his fiscal constraints. After graduating, Baldwin worked in the financial sector for several years “all the while trying to complete [his] MTELEs and research ways to transition into teaching. He is in his first year and teaches in a lower elementary classroom at Apple Pilot Elementary School.

Substitute Teaching

Most participants described the opportunity to teach when in high school or in college as a primary contributing factor to their decisions to enter the profession. There were some teachers, three in particular, who noted that the chance to substitute teach encouraged them to become teachers of record.

South High Pilot: Kurt Sharpton

Sangister's realization that there were non-pecuniary benefits to substitute teaching, namely the ability to influence positively the lives of his students, appeared to influence his decision to become a teacher of record. Kurt Sharpton, 52, a physical education teacher at South High Pilot, worked for a military defense firm, but was laid off after 9/11. After being laid off, Sharpton described substitute teaching in a physical education class. He described "really enjoying" this experience because "it was just a natural fit." One reason teaching physical education was a "fit" for Sharpton may have been particular imprints from his early schooling experiences: "Being an athlete myself in high school and college I loved sports all my life... just the love of fitness and love of sports has been one of my biggest assets, you know in many ways." The first school where Sharpton subbed invited him to assume a long-term position. He stayed there for two years and left because they were unable to provide him with a full-time position.

Clarke High: Slaughter Gibson

Slaughter Gibson, 56, a self-described "military brat" who "doesn't give a shit about what people think" about him, spent much of his earlier schooling in Department of Defense schools around the world. This is until his family moved to a, as he described it, "vanilla," or predominantly White mid-Atlantic suburb where his father worked at the Pentagon. In his senior year of high school, the district began integrating schools: "they took half of our school and moved it to a Black school and half of that Black school and moved it to the White school." After graduating from a private university in Boston, Gibson opened an affiliate office of a business owned by his family. According to Gibson, his family owns "one of the largest such businesses in the country." After

managing the company for five years, he sold it “for a nice profit” and ran for a state political position, as he always wanted to enter politics. In losing the election, Gibson, who said he always had an interest in teaching, decided to “try the teaching thing.” Specifically, Gibson began substitute teaching at Thomas Jefferson. In his 20th year in the classroom, Gibson teaches 10th grade history at Clarke High School.

Marcus Garvey K - 8: Dennis Sangister

Dennis Sangister, 29, was born in the Midwest, but moved to Boston when he was in kindergarten. He noted that he was “poor” growing up, moving seven times in three years. His mother continues to receive the federal housing subsidy, “Section Eight.” In the 8th grade, he took an exam, which allowed him to attend a prestigious religious school in a Boston suburb. Right before graduating, his father was deported to the Caribbean and his mother was arrested. He went on to attend a Jesuit institution. After college, he returned to Boston and worked at several afterschool non-profit organizations. One day when paying a visit to one of his former teachers at the Boston public middle school he attended, Sangister’s teacher asked him if he was interested in a job as a substitute teacher. He subsequently applied for and was hired to be a substitute teacher. Sangister cited economic reasons for entering the teaching profession– substitute teaching “paid more.” But, he soon realized the important role he could play in his students’ lives. Currently, in his sixth year of teaching, Sangister is an English teacher at Marcus Garvey, a K - 8 school. He has, for the past three years, directed an after-school program geared to improving Black and Latino boys’ academic and social outcomes.

Male Role Models of Color

Many participants described the importance of males of color who influenced their decisions to become teachers. Not only did teachers in this study talk about the significance of having a male of color as a role model on their decisions to become a teacher, participants also spoke of themselves as a type of their mentor. References to the male role model of color arose mostly when participants described their work and relationships with students.

Crispus Attucks Elementary: Joseph Nkrumah and Henry Groover

Joseph Nkrumah, 37 and a fourth year teacher at Crispus Attucks, described how one male teacher, an African, at his elementary school in a West African country inspired him to become a teacher. Nkrumah described how, while in elementary school, he would “slack off” and his teacher “would see that I should have done better. He would just come back, and say, ‘I know you can do better than this.’” Nkrumah also recalled how this male teacher “took his time, not only helping me, but others” reiterating challenging concepts in class. So influential was this teacher on Nkrumah that, in his senior year, when he had to choose a career, he remembered thinking, “man, I wish I could be like him, you know, so...when the choice came, what do you want to be, then I said, hey, I just wanna be a teacher.”

Like Nkrumah, his colleague, Henry Groover, who is in his twentieth year at Crispus Attucks, described the role that male role models played in his decision to become a teacher. Groover, who was born in the mid-Atlantic, teaches physical education. He described three male college professors, two Black and one White, as being particularly influential when deciding to enter the teaching profession. “I wasn’t

interested in science but once I got into college science became one of my focal points... [these professors] let me see some strengths about myself and some of the interests that I didn't have," he noted.

Grand Case Pilot: Wole Achebe

Wole Achebe, 33, who was born in West Africa and educated in England, described his socioeconomic status while growing up as "upper-middle class." Achebe attended private schools in West Africa and England and immigrated to the United States for high school. Initially wanting to study medicine in high school, Achebe's English teacher encouraged him to pursue a career in journalism. After attending a state university in Massachusetts and majoring in English, he worked, for four years, as an editorial assistant and staff writer for a Boston paper. Achebe described becoming frustrated with the type of writing he was doing: "I realized I didn't want to be a journalist." Achebe's interests were more geared to "creative writing" and his position did not provide an "outlet to do that kind of writing," so he looked for another job.

As he commenced his job search, Achebe remembered how many family members likened him to his father, a former teacher. When he saw an advertisement on monster.com, an e-classified service, for an alternative teacher certification program, he decided to apply. Currently, Achebe teaches 12th grade English and serves as the English department chair at Grand Case Pilot High School. He is in his sixth year in the profession.

Alberto Schomburg: Benjamin Young

In addition to describing the role of male educators of color in influencing their decisions to become educators, participants also spoke about how they saw themselves as

a type of that teacher who had influenced them. One such teacher, for Benjamin Young, was Coach Ellington. Young is a veteran physical education teacher at Alberto Schomburg Dual Language School. After moving from the Midwest to the mid-Atlantic, where his father served as head of a prominent Black civics organization in a small city, Young's parents separated. Young described Ellington as someone who: "kept it real...He would call my house and make sure I was in bed. He would just be the dad I didn't have...taught me to be on time... made me step up as a leader, captain of the track team... He was the main guy that got me in a disciplined mind." For Young, a physical education teacher, Coach Ellington played an integral role in his life and served as an inspiration for becoming a teacher. In describing his relationship with students, Young suggested: "they like me a lot and I became some kind of an influence for a lot of the kids here – much like Sam Ellington was for me." As Young talked about his own experiences in the classroom, he defined his success relative to that of Coach Ellington.

Roseville Pilot School: Josiah Washington

Like Young, Josiah Washington, a fourth year math teacher at Roseville Pilot School, described how his interactions with one male teacher of color, in particular, influenced his decision to enter the teaching profession. Washington, 29 and in his fourth year of teaching, was born in the south. In direct contrast to the other 27 participants in this study, Washington consistently wore a tie that complemented his starched shirt during interviews. Washington recounted that his elementary school was predominantly Black; as a result of his academic success, he attended a "county school that was predominantly White" for middle school. It was there, in the school where Whites comprised the majority of the student body, that Washington met Mr. Grey – his seventh

grade technology teacher. In writing his college essay about Mr. Grey, Washington reflected that he was one of the few Black male teachers in the building: “I can count on my hand maybe four total.” But, it was Mr. Grey’s “subtle way of being” that Washington most remembered. “You would never see Mr. Grey without a suit, literally, every day, no matter what. And he worked in a lab so it was like he’d have a lab coat on top of his suit coat, ready to go,” Washington recalled. One Saturday, in his junior year in high school, when Washington was at school, he saw Mr. Grey in jeans. Surprised, Washington remarked to Mr. Grey that in his five years in school, he had never seen him in jeans. Washington remembered Mr. Grey’s response: ‘Well I’m at work. So if I’m at work I’m always presenting a professional manner.’ During Washington’s tenure in middle and high school, Mr. Grey, his teacher, referred to him as “Mr. Washington.” Mr. Grey, according to Washington, called all of his students “Mister” “Miss” “Sir” or “Ma’am.” At Young’s high school graduation, Mr. Grey, for the first time, called him by his first name “Josiah.” Washington described this moment as a “transitional point,” where Mr. Grey might have been signaling to him that in graduating from high school he was becoming an adult and thus a peer.

In responding to the question about his decision to become a teacher, Washington remarked: “It grew out of my interactions with Mr. Grey. The thing that inspired me about him again was that he was what I would consider a true renaissance man.” Washington then described how Mr. Grey majored in electrical engineering, “owned his own production company where he had toured with several artists,” and was a manager at a jewelry store. Despite Mr. Grey’s inspiration, Washington, who majored in computer science at a historically Black college, recounted how he was “running from education a

little bit because of the stigma that once you get in education it's really hard to get out.” Here, Washington described the tension of wanting to pursue a career in education, while also pursuing other professional interests. However, Washington reconciled this tension by turning to Mr. Grey: “I always looked back to [Mr. Grey] as a model of being a way to in essence have it all and do all those multiple things.” In the same breath, Washington continued to describe himself as a type of Mr. Grey, “In essence at the point I am very similar to him in that I am an entrepreneur and that I have a computer science background. I have an arts background as well. We're similar in terms of juggling.” In addition to teaching seventh grade math, Washington describes his out of classroom responsibilities as follows:

I'm actually one of the greeters in the morning time doing greeting and just code check in the mornings. It happens three times a week. I am one of the tech chairs, what's called the Learning and Technology Integration Committee. I chair that committee. I am also the head basketball coach. I am also one of the – we lead a group of students to Costa Rica on expeditionary learning trips every April. There's an elective that I teach outside of regular classroom time, which is the time when you've joined us today. That's actually that elective. And then also there is Social Justice Assembly chair which we do – This is a social justice school so there's actually an assembly that we have every year that is basically culminating projects of academic connections we make in the classroom throughout the year. These are final presentations of that. In addition I also help to do the Black History program, which this year I was doing as well. And then lastly I am also on the PBIS Committee, which is the Positive Behavior Intervention System Committee for the school.

While slightly overwhelmed by the many out of classroom responsibilities that he has assumed, Washington has a support network – Mr. Grey. Washington still talks to Mr. Grey. “That's where our conversations are now when we talk. It's kind of like, you never told me this, or how challenging it is to perform all of the aforementioned roles.” Mr.

Grey's advice, Washington recalled, "Yes you do all these things but at some point you have to sleep and that's kind of how it works out."

Captured in the stories of why the Black male teachers in this study decided to enter the teaching profession are the roles males, specifically other male teachers, played in their lives – socialized imprints. To some, these teachers were surrogate fathers; to other participants these teachers were archetypes of what it meant to be a Black male teacher. These examples inspired the men in this study to become teachers. And, in turn, study participants measured their success against that of their former male teachers of color. In a sense, Black male participants developed a schema, vis-à-vis the older male teachers of color with whom they came in contact, around what and how one should teach. These mental models for what a teacher should be, or more specifically a Black male teacher, also provide a barometer to measure their success.

College Course

Ralph Emerson Exam High: Hugh Ferguson

Hugh Ferguson, 49, was born and raised in the Caribbean in a middle class family. Ferguson attended private school until he immigrated to the United States at 18 to attend one of the nation's premier technical universities. In college, Ferguson majored in electrical engineering. Laid off during the Great Recession that began in 2008, Ferguson returned to graduate school for a degree in computer science. During his graduate program, Ferguson described becoming fascinated by "computer-based learning." He added, "I realized that people had different learning styles and technology could actually help improve learning outcomes, so I was interested in being able to blend learning with

technology to help students.” In his second year at Emerson and the profession, Ferguson teaches pre-calculus.

Thomas Jefferson High: Dante Smith

Dante Smith, 29, was born and raised in Boston and teaches English. However, most of Smith’s schooling took place in “a white very affluent community” through his participation in the Metropolitan Council for Educational Opportunity (METCO) program. Created in 1966 as a response to desegregation efforts across the country, one of METCO’s aims is to increase racial diversity in suburban schools outside of Boston by bussing in BPS students. Most of Smith’s schooling in this district, which he described as “probably one of the best in the world,” was spent in special education: “when I was in elementary school I was in like special reading class, I was put in a special reading class because I had trouble decoding words I was...trapped or grouped into that group all the way through middle school and into high school.” Smith finally exited special education after “protesting” to take A.P. English. He suggested feeling like “one of the smartest students in the class as far as understanding the content and being able to discuss it,” And, Smith cites the A.P. teacher as one of his most inspiring.

In attending a large state university in a state neighboring Massachusetts, Smith initially wanted to be an engineering major. However being on the track team he weighed the “decision between having a social life and having like a life where [he] was just studying all the time and doing track all the time” and realized engineering “wasn’t for me.” Smith also suggested wanting “to be a lawyer for a little bit,” but shied away from this possibility because “I don’t want to sacrifice my life for like profession...I want to be able to be myself and still make money and live my life.” Ultimately, Smith decided to

major in English and decided on a career in the education profession as he learned more about “Black History” and “started seeing the need for male, black male teachers...in the inner city.” Smith, an English teacher, taught for two years at another district and left after it closed due to under-performance. This is Smith’s third year at Jefferson.

Service Obligation

Ralph Emerson Exam High: Roger Manley

One participant, Roger Manley, suggested that his decision to enter the teaching profession was a consequence of a service obligation.

Roger Manley, 60, a physics teacher, was born and reared in the Caribbean. Manley attended private religiously affiliated elementary and secondary schools where most of his teachers were White British expatriates. Manley majored in engineering at a university in the Caribbean. Manley described his decision to enter the teaching profession as “accidental.” After graduating from university, according to Manley, “there was a program back home where they asked recent university graduates to give back service to the country.” Initially, the program required a two-year commitment; Manley taught for seven years and then returned to university for a degree in “physics and geology. And then after that, [he] did a degree in education admin and management.” Manley then taught for thirteen years, across three schools in the Caribbean island of his birth, before immigrating to the United States. After teaching in two school districts in Massachusetts and acquiring a Master’s from a technical university, Manley secured a position at a large comprehensive high school in BPS. He was eventually recruited to assist Emerson in its creation of a new physics department. This is Manley’s 10th year at Emerson and 30th in the teaching profession.

An Ineffective K – 12 Teacher

For some participants, a role model served as their impetus to enter the teaching profession. For others, however, an ineffective teacher served as the reason for entering the teaching profession.

Crossroads K – 8: Amilcar Depina

Amilcar Depina has more than 20 years in the district. Depina, a physical education teacher, was born on an island off of Africa's coast, but spent much of his schooling in Boston Public Schools, which included the period during the district's desegregation. He described being a "product of bussing." The federal court order mandated that Depina move from the middle school he attended in one of city's Black communities to one in a predominantly White community. In jest, he attributed the start to his running career to "being chased home by White students." An experience he described as "traumatic."

Equally traumatic and memorable for Depina was his experience with one high school teacher. Depina described his decision to become a teacher through realizing "how much of an impact the teacher had on your future and your goals. They could either make or break your goals." When Depina entered high school he wanted to be an architect. However, he described learning very little from his "alcoholic" shop teacher who "always has his cough medicine" in class. In time, Depina learned "it was just hidden alcohol in a cough syrup." Since he wasn't "learning," his time in the shop class "killed [his] career choice... [he] figured if [he] couldn't do the work, then in school, how was [he] gonna be able to do the work when [he] got to college." This experience

“had a drastic impact on my future goals.” In the end, Depina “realized [he] wanted to help other kids versus not helping.”

Societal Pressure

Crispus Attucks Elementary: Adebayo Adjayi

Adebayo Adjayi, 50 and in his 32nd year of teaching, lived most of his childhood in West Africa. Adjayi described growing up “poor” in a rural village and was hired, while in elementary school, to live as a servant with a middle class gentleman in the country’s capital. After leaving secondary school, he entered seminary because of a desire to help and be around people. He noted:

I went to the seminary for some time. I didn’t make it because my people say that being a priest is throwing the person away, so, from there I went to teacher training and then I became a teacher because I love to deal with people, I love to teach. If I wasn’t a priest, the next way I could have contact with people is teaching.

According to Adjayi, his first career as a priest had little social status in his country. As such, one whom desired to assume the priesthood was thought of as “throwing [his life] away.” Adjayi, succumbing to societal pressure, opted for the higher status profession, teaching. He taught for 13 years in his home country before immigrating to the United States. In his 19th year of teaching at the Crispus Attucks Elementary School, Adjayi teaches in a self-contained class with students who have moderate disabilities.

State Teacher Examinations: A Constraint to Entering the Profession

Many of the Black male teachers in my study shared how a particular socialized imprint (i.e. early experience teaching or male role model) enabled their entry into the teaching profession. However, in addition to factors that encouraged entrance into the profession, one factor, the teacher certification exam, served as a constraint.

Approximately 60 percent of study participants who took the Massachusetts Tests for Educator Licensure (MTEL) failed it on their first attempt (see Table 5.3). Teachers can remain in the classroom, while retaking the exam, for up to two years. If, after two years, teachers do not pass the MTEL, they can no longer assume a full-time teacher of record position in a school. Each teacher who took a state exam eventually passed and became a teacher of record. However, given the evidence that more than half of respondents noted that they were unable to pass the exam on the first try, I describe how state exams served as a constraint for two teachers’ entry into the profession. Specifically, I draw attention to the experiences of Leroy Jackson and Kanye Carter, who described how an inability to pass state exams was the most significant barrier in becoming a teacher.

Table 5.3: Participants’ Success and Failure on Massachusetts Tests for Educator Licensure (MTEL)

	Not Required to take MTEL ¹	Passed all MTELEs on the first try	Failed at least one MTEL on first try
Loner (n=7)	0	3	4
Grouper (n=20)	6	6	8

¹Teachers were in a charter school or began teaching in the district before the state mandated passing MTEL to become a teacher of record.

Clarke High School: Leroy Jackson

Leroy Jackson, 55, in his 28th year of teaching, was born in the South. He attended all-Black primary and secondary schools and then graduated from one of the state’s oldest historically Black universities in the mid 1970s. Jackson noted that he and his eight siblings were not middle class; he then added his family was “never on welfare” and proudly that “seven of us have college degrees.” He suggested that an early-experience teaching, a socialized imprint, influenced his decision to enter the profession. Jackson recalled, “While I was in college my mother went back to get her GED and I helped her

to get her GED. So I felt that if my mother would listen to me and she was patient enough to ask for my help...I can really do something in this field.”

Jackson began his career teaching high school math in the same district he attended. He described the school as a “predominantly Black lower economic community.” Jackson worked for two and a half years as a math teacher. Licensed by his university to teach both math and physical education, Jackson decided to teach math because there were no physical education jobs available in the district. Around 1980, according to Jackson, the state “started the teacher certification test.” After two years and numerous attempts, Leroy Jackson had not passed the exam in math.

Jackson could have remained a “provisional teacher,” but instead assumed a position as a grocery store clerk. This pattern of southern states introducing teacher certification exams became prevalent in the late 1970s and early 1980s at the same moment federal courts required local school districts to integrate schools (George, 1985). One consequence of these teacher exams that were, first, exclusively introduced in southern states was the decrease in Black teachers because many were unable to pass these tests (Hoover, 1984; Kearns, 1984).

One question of interest to researchers is what happened to those Blacks who attended universities to become teachers, but were unable to do so because of the newly created teacher examination (Kauchak, 1984). Unable to pass the teacher examination in a southern state, Jackson, a college educated math major, decided to work in a grocery store. He recalled, “Well back then teachers didn’t make no money. I ended up doubling my salary.” Content with the money he made, Jackson suggested little urgency for “jumping back into teaching.” After three years, the discriminatory practices at the

grocery store prompted Jackson to leave. In describing the White store owners, Jackson suggested:

they were jealous of me being a college graduate because I was basically the only one who was a college graduate. They never felt comfortable around me. I didn't like the idea that I had to train all these little White kids who were just high school graduates or dropouts. They let them become managers, but they won't let me become [one].

While working at the grocery store, Jackson continued to study for the exam, which he eventually passed during his second summer at the grocery store. Amid the racial discrimination at the grocery store, Jackson decided to move. He was encouraged by his sister, a graduate of one of the nation's most prestigious historically Black colleges (a point Jackson highlighted) to move to Boston. Jackson's sister and her husband were both teachers. Massachusetts did not begin its teacher certification exams, until 1998. With the absence of a state exam, Jackson believed he was qualified to teach both math and physical education in Massachusetts.

Jackson entered the district at the end of Boston Public School desegregation, circa 1974 – 1988, (Formisano, 1991). In 1973, Black families brought suit against BPS for maintaining a highly segregated school system and for their refusal to hire Black male teachers. One outcome from the *Garrity Decision* (see Tallulah Morgan et al. v. James Hennigan et al, 1974) was an attempt to racially balance district schools' teacher and student populations. When Jackson applied to BPS, in the mid-1980s, to teach math, he was denied. District officials would not accept his math courses from the southern historically Black university he attended. Jackson suggested that the district's refusal was a matter of "misunderstanding of language." For example, Jackson attempted to get his Analysis 1 and Analysis 2 classes counted as Calculus 1 and Calculus 2 – a request that

was denied. In a second attempt to get BPS to grant him permission to teach math, Jackson described bringing “my syllabus and stuff so they can see college syllabus, see the courses, description and stuff like that.” Again, denied. Jackson did not want to cite the district’s refusal to grant him a certificate to teach math as “discrimination.” Instead, he believed it was incompetence:

I just basically thought that someone wasn’t doing their job and did not understand exactly what I did because if anything my courses were a little more advanced than what they were asking for, because I took the advanced courses...I took Calculus One, Calculus Two. I took upper level Math courses as far as upper level college courses for matrices, systems and... So it had nothing to do with just regular college algebra and stuff like that. I took advanced Math courses.

Choosing not to “fight” and wanting to avoid the continued “headache with all the paperwork,” Jackson applied for, and was granted, a certificate to teach physical education. Jackson is currently a physical education teacher at Clarke High School.

Washington Irving High School: Kayne Carter

In his eleventh year in the profession, Kayne Carter, 35, teaches English at Washington Irving High School, a turnaround school. Originally from Boston, Carter described his class status, as a child, as “poor.” He went on to add, “we were on welfare, my mom didn’t work, my mom never worked she struggled with drugs and alcohol and, you know, we got food stamps, we lived in shelters....” Carter graduated from a large comprehensive high school in BPS and then attended an elite liberal arts college in New England for his undergraduate degree. Of his experience in high school, Carter recalled, “When I went off to college, I didn’t even know what a thesis was.” He also described taking an English course in college that “covered classic literature that high school students should have read. You know, *The Catcher in The Rye*, *Of Mice and Men*, *The*

Great Gatsby, stuff like that. I never read any of those things.” As a consequence of attending college and realizing that many of his peers lacked a structure that could facilitate college access, Carter wanted to become a teacher to “go back and be the difference... [show] students that they can go on to college.”

However, this sincere attempt at entering the profession was halted after Carter did not pass the MTEL. After graduating from college, he returned to his high school where, because of his continued relationship with his former basketball coach, Carter assumed a substitute teaching position. Then, in his second year and for the next five years, Carter worked as an English teacher under a provisional license. However, when the principal who hired him and his former basketball coach retired, he applied for an “assistant unit leader position,” which focused on student support services. Under the new principal, Carter noted that he “couldn’t be guaranteed assurance” because he had not passed the MTEs. Since he wanted to remain at the school, he applied for the assistant unit leader position where the only qualifications were “a Bachelor’s degree and teaching experience.” Because the new principal wanted to purge all possible ties to the school’s formal leadership, according to Carter, he was not offered the position.

Carter left this school and was hired at another high school, Winthrop Academy, where his basketball coach knew the school’s principal. However, after one year, he lost his position at Winthrop because he had not passed the exam:

I hadn’t passed the teacher exam yet so they couldn’t keep me and normally when you’re in the system, you can go under a waiver, you know, like, you’re trying to take your teachers exam and you’re showing progress so you can get a waiver under certain guidelines and I received a waiver and then my year was up. I hadn’t passed the test that year and so I couldn’t keep my position there.

The summer after Winthrop released Carter, he passed the general education MTEL; in passing, a test in which he took “a total of like 15” times,” Carter was now certified to teach students in special education with moderate disabilities. He identified several socialized markers, or imprints, that contributed to his challenges with state teacher exam: “I didn’t read a lot growing up, I didn’t read a lot in high school, the work that we were doing compared to suburban [students] or other counterparts was like...I probably was doing middle school work...” For Carter, both out-of-school (e.g. not reading at home) and in school (e.g. doing middle school work in high school) appeared to influence his struggles with the state exam.

Two weeks before the start of the new school year, Washington Irving’s current principal invited Carter to interview for what he thought would be a health education position. However, when Carter arrived, he learned that the position was actually for a student engagement officer. It’s unclear whether Irving’s principal recognized that Carter could play a valuable role in improving the school’s achievement (the school had just been reconstituted) and found a position for him as a student engagement officer, despite the posting for a health education teacher. Nonetheless, after his first year as a student engagement officer, he was sent into the classroom and for the past two years has taught ninth grade English.

After two years of teaching English, Carter submitted that he is “not in love with teaching.” Carter continued: “I am in a wrong space for what I think I am really good at.” For Carter, he sees himself as “good at” supporting students outside of the classroom as an engagement officer. However, another factor that might have influenced Carter’s decision to leave the classroom may well be the discouragement of having to take an

exam 15 times. Carter suggested as much when he said, “challenges with the MTEL is probably one of the things that made me want to leave the classroom.” He went on to add, “Maybe I just need to find a different position or a different job doing different, because the MTEL was difficult for me. For me - I started in 2002; I didn’t finish it until 2009.”

Carter acknowledged that he is “in a wrong space;” however, when pressed, Carter described how, over the course of seven years of failing the MTEL, he began to doubt his ability to teach. Carter lamented, in expressing his desire to leave the classroom, “maybe I just need to find a different position.” However, this desire to leave appears to be related to his difficulty in passing the state’s teacher exam.

In the end, Carter’s socialized imprints, which include his lack of success over an extended period of time and interest in helping social rather than cognitive development rendered him dissatisfied in the classroom. In his eleventh year as a teacher, Carter recognizes that these imprints are not the right fit for teaching. Unlike other participants in this study who left one school for another after citing a mismatch between themselves and the organization, Carter is deciding to leave his current role as classroom teacher for a position that is a better fit. For Carter, that role includes redirecting student misbehavior.

Summary: Influences and Barriers into Teaching

In response to one of this study’s research questions around what are Black male teachers’ pathways into the profession, I observed that an early experience teaching influenced participants’ decisions. There were no discernible patterns as it related to entry when comparing Loners and Groupers or elementary and secondary teachers, for

example. Moreover, I am not asserting that an early experience in teaching was unique to the Black male teacher study participants, but true of this population.

Jacob Collins, Eddie Rock, Okonkwo Sutton, James Price, and Dennis Sangister, for example, spoke about their early experiences teaching when in high school, college or after graduating from college. Participants described enjoying these experiences being surprised by how effective they were, as measured by student engagement and learning, in these early experiences. These successes prompted them to enter the teaching profession. As one participant, James Price noted, “As far as getting Black males involved in teaching, I really feel that providing opportunities where Black males can actually go in the classroom during the undergrad years, getting that exposure, is very important” to becoming a teacher.

Joseph Nkrumah, Josiah Washington and Benjamin Young reflected on the importance of having Black male teachers who influenced them to enter the profession. Washington and Young, in particular, measured their success against that of their former male teachers of color. In a sense, Black male participants developed a schema, vis-à-vis the older male teachers of color with whom they came in contact, around what and how one should teach.

Finally, for LeRoy Jackson and Kayne Carter, there were prior factors that constrained their ability to enter the profession. The largest constraint appeared to be these teachers’ difficulties with passing the state teacher certification exams.

Chapter VI

Within Skewed Groups: Loners and Groupers

In this chapter, I attempt to answer what are the differences for teachers working in schools employing just one Black male teacher versus schools with larger numbers of Black male teachers? To do this, I build on Kanter's (1977) theory of skewed groups. I explore how workers in the numerical minority experience organizations in varying ways based, primarily, on the actual number of members who belong to the same social group. My primary purpose in this chapter is to provide an analytical framework for exploring the differential organizational experiences between Loners and Groupers. Specifically, I describe a new phenomenon in this theory of numbers that characterizes the unique interactions for the lone member of a social group in the organization.

Within Skewed Groups

Kanter's (1977) theory of numbers and group composition provides a helpful framework for understanding how one's proportional representation can influence experiences in an organization. Specifically, Kanter's (1977) attention to the ratio of members who identify as belonging to a particular social group (i.e. based on race or gender) provides some insight into the enabling and constraining factors that influence a sense of attachment to the organization. Again, Kanter (1977) creates four such groups where the ratios vary for workers in the numerical majority compared to those in the numerical minority. In uniform groups, the ratio is 100:0; in skewed the ratio is up to 85:15; another range of possible ratios in a skewed group between workers in the numerical majority to those in the numerical minority could be from 84:16 to 99:1. Kanter's (1977) analysis is, exclusively, on skewed groups.

While Kanter (1977) provides a way of examining the representation of social categories across four distinct group types, missing from such a framework is an exploration of how workers' experiences vary who belong to a skewed group. Might individuals who are in a skewed group have different experiences? Might the presence of one or two same race and gender colleagues off-set the organizational challenges of being in the numerical minority? Or, could being the only same race and gender person with a particular job description increase the positive organizational experiences associated with being in the numerical minority? To answer these questions, I analyze the responses of teachers working in schools employing just one Black male teacher, Loners, and those responses from schools with three or more Black male teachers, Groupers. All study participants, as a consequence of their race and gender, Black men, were a part of a skewed group (see Table 6.1). Specifically, participants were in schools such as Roseville where they ranged from two percent of all teachers to schools such as Crossroads and Exploration where they were 12 percent of all teachers. I find that Loners and Groupers experienced the organizations in distinct ways. Moreover, I introduce an analytical framework – *social isolation in organizations* – to draw attention to workers who operate in the extreme minority (i.e. Loners).

Table 6.1: 2012-2013 School Demographic Characteristics for Sample Schools

School Name	School Type	School Category	#Teacher s	# Black Male Teachers	%Black Male Teachers	%Black Teachers	%White Teachers
Race to the Top Elementary	Innovation	Loner	18	1	6	22	67
Roseville Elementary	Pilot	Loner	51	1	2	22	57
Alberto Schomburg High	Dual Language	Loner	27	1	4	15	41
South High	Pilot	Loner	40	1	3	15	65
Grand Case Pilot High	Pilot	Loner	12	1	8	15	75
Marcus Garvey K-8	Regular District	Loner	38	1	3	24	50
Apple Elementary	Pilot	Loner	30	1	3	20	63
Cross Roads K -8	Regular District	Grouper	35	4	12	40	60
Crispus Attucks Elementary	Converting to Turnaround	Grouper	52	4	8	44	48
Clarke High	Regular District	Grouper	102	5	5	10	70
Ralph Emerson High	Exam	Grouper	78	4	5	14	68
Washington Irving High	Turnaround	Grouper	72	4	6	47	39
Explorations Charter	Charter	Grouper	17	3	12	59	24
Thomas Jefferson High	Turnaround	Grouper	95	10	10	41	31

Toward a Theory of Social Isolation in Organizations

A theory of social isolation in organizations characterizes the experiences of workers in the absolute numerical minority - the lone Black male teacher in the organization, for example. Drawing on social distance (Simmel, 1950), the biological

consequences of isolation (Cacioppo & Hawkley, 2009), and work alienation (Erickson, 1986), I posit that workers in the absolute numerical minority navigate organizations with a hyper-awareness around how other members of the organization perceive their work. In organizations where there are two or three members in the numerical minority, these workers have the advantage of building relationships with each other and normalizing problematic peer-to-peer interactions. However those in the absolute numerical minority are at a disadvantage because they are the only such member of their social group in the organization. Furthermore, these workers, Loners, express a sentiment that they are socially alone and disconnected from the core mission of the organization. Their primary relationships are not with fellow teacher colleagues, but, when they do exist, are with paraprofessionals. Finally, Loners recount how their colleagues relate to them in ways, which increases their social isolation.

In Chapter Three, I theorized that social distance (Simmel, 1950), or the perceived dissimilarity between groups based on race, class, or gender, might underlie policy initiatives to increase the number of Black male teachers. I argued that White teachers may be strangers to the experiences of their Black students. And, that one influence for Black students', particularly males, continued underperformance could be this continued demographic mismatch in public schools. Dee (2004) empirically tested this demographic mismatch and found that having a same race teacher was associated with improved learning. Dee (2005) also found that having a teacher of the opposite gender was associated with being viewed as more disruptive and inattentive. In the school hierarchy, teachers wield more power than students (e.g. teachers assess students and can influence student suspension). The net effect of this distance, between teacher and

student, it stands to reason, appears to be negative outcomes for the least powerful group – students.

In this study, I use the theory of social distance to characterize the dynamic between White female teachers, on average, and Black male teachers. Poor academic (Noguera, 2003) and social (Alexander, 2010) outcomes appear to be one consequence of social distance for Black male students. In this study, however, one outcome of social distance for Black male teachers is social isolation in the organization.

Cacioppo, Hawkley, Norman, and Berntson (2011) discuss the evolutionary role of humans depending on other humans for the species' survival. They contend that from a reproductive perspective, the human species would have ceased to exist if isolated. Survival, then, is dependent on not being isolated. Similar to the relationship between human to human interaction and the species' survival, researchers observe adverse effects for individuals in the wider society who believe they are isolated. The perception of being alone, or isolated, is associated with decreased cognitive ability, the increased likelihood of negativity and depression, a decreased desire to associate with other individuals, and constant paranoia (Cacioppo & Hawkley, 2009). Biologically, the net effect of continued isolation is death (Holt-Lunstad, Smith, & Layton, 2010).

Similar to the perception of feeling isolated in the wider society, sociologists are able to test, empirically, isolation, or what sociologists (Erickson, 1986) call alienation, in the workplace. Erickson (1986) defines workplace alienation as “a condition that is registered somewhere in the person's mind or spirit or body, and is reflected in actual behavior” (p.6). As such there are experiences in the workplace that lead to a sense of work alienation, which manifests itself in how the alienated interact with other members

of the organization. In a meta-analysis on work alienation, Chiaburu, Thundiyl, and Wang (2014) identify five predictors of work alienation – individual characteristics, role stressors, leader dimensions, job ambiguity, and work context. This alimentation, then, leads to four outcomes – attitudes about the work, withdrawal, poor task performance, and side effects such as increased drinking.

Here, I focus on work context as one predictor for study participant’s alienation and withdrawal as one outcome. This study was designed to understand schools as organizations; the collected data cannot determine the extent to which the four other predictors (i.e. individual characteristics, role ambiguity, leader dimensions, and job design) influenced work alienation. Moreover, I focus on attitudes about work and withdrawal because these outcomes captured participants’ responses to work alienation. Chiaburu, Thundiyl, and Wang (2014) describe how work context, or believing that power in the organization is concentrated in the hands of a few, can lead to alienation. Moreover, a sense of alienation can be heightened when a worker feels that his voice or ideas are not valued in the organization. Attitudes about work in the Chiabaru, et. al. study encompassed beliefs about job insecurity and decreased job satisfaction. And, withdrawal, according to the researchers, could be observed by increased absenteeism.

In this study, I observed that being in the numerical minority in the organization increased the social distance between Black male teachers and their colleagues, most of whom were White women. Furthermore, I find that participants’ sense of social distance was heightened when they were the only Black male teachers on the faculty. This sense of heightened social distance manifested itself as participants, or Loners, described how their lack of voice or ideas were not valued by their colleagues in the organization. In

perceiving that one’s voice, for example, was less likely to be heard, because of one’s race and gender, participants described feeling alienated. In response to this alienation, Loners intimated that they were insecure about their jobs and noted how they stopped participating, or withdrew from the organization. It is this process that I define as social isolation in organizations.

Below, I disaggregate responses based on school category (e.g., Loner and Grouper). I draw attention to those questions with the greatest number of participant responses because I am better able to make claims about the differences between Loners and Groupers, both of which belong to skewed groups. Moreover, by comparing Loner and Grouper responses, I am able to draw attention to Loners’ social isolation in the organization. Understanding the varying experiences of workers in the numerical minority is important given that the previous literature (Kanter, 1977; Kelley, 1997) treats these “tokens” as a unitary group.

Table 6.2: Participants’ Beliefs Around the Challenge or Ease of Being Around Colleagues

	Groupers (n=20)	Loners (n=7)
Challenging	6	5
Easy	14	2

In terms of relationships with colleagues, Table (6.2) shows that about three-quarters of all Groupers suggested that it was easy to be themselves around colleagues. This is compared to one-third of all Loners.

Groupers’ Social Integration

Groupers appeared to be more socially integrated in the organization and described a sense of connection to their colleagues (See Table 6.3) At Crispus Attucks,

Joseph Nkrumah, 37, suggested, “it’s easy, for me no problem at all. I don’t want to put on any faces” Nkrumah’s colleague, Henry Groover, 49, noted, “It’s very easy because I don’t have to be anyone else. So, I am who you get.” Across Grouper schools, participants who were of varying ages described a sense of comfort when interacting with their colleagues. These participants present a collegial and hospitable environment, as it relates to interacting with their colleagues. Some Groupers, such as Matthew Morial, 29, noted “many of my colleagues I would call friends.” Moreover, Morial intimated that he could be his true self with his colleagues “many of the teachers already know me from in my personal life, so I don’t really feel like bashful around them.” Morial’s colleagues, whom he described as friends, were not only Black, but also White men and White women. In fact, he routinely spent his lunch period with the White female librarian. Morial’s colleague, Kayne Carter, 35, appeared to have developed the closest relationship with males of color who were on the support staff. Carter described feeling “more comfortable” with these men.

Table 6.3: Groupers’ School Name, School Composition and Descriptions of Social Integration

Participant	School Name	Descriptions of Social Integration
Eddie Rock	Cross Roads Elementary K – 8	“My father was Black and Baptist; my mother is White and Jewish...I grew up in this inter-racial, inter-faith household, which never really meant anything to me. I’m a strong candidate for what’s called code switching. And I think it’s a psychological response to wanting to make other people feel more comfortable around me.”
Amilcar Depina	Cross Roads Elementary K – 8	“I don’t change my behavior for somebody. I look at it as I’m a very easygoing person. My personality is I’m a team builder.”
Jacob Collins	Cross Roads Elementary K – 8	“I’ve not actually been out in public with other people from this particular school. And I believe that it comes down to I made a decision. I made a decision along the way because of the preconceived notions, because of the presumptions, because of the

		gossip, because of the rumors, because I don't honestly believe that, one, people hear in this particular community, want to get to know me as a person, as an individual, and as a practitioner..."
Joseph Nkrumah	Crispus Attucks Elementary	"It's easy, for me no problem at all. I don't want to put on any faces."
Adebayo Adjayi	Crispus Attucks Elementary	"Well, you must know that in this school here or any school we have individual classrooms, so you can only meet during lunchtime like this or when there is a conference, so you don't really have much time to be around your colleagues..."
Henry Groover	Crispus Attucks Elementary	"It's very easy because I don't have to be anyone else. So, I am who you get."
Slaughter Gibson	Clarke High	"I'm consistent. I'm a military brat. I don't give a shit. You're either a good person or you suck."
Leroy Jackson	Clarke High	"It's easy to be myself because I don't try to be something that I'm not; I don't have any troubles hanging around them [my colleagues]."
Kendall Robeson	Clarke High	"So I'm a happy person, playful – playful with them, and like you just saw the teacher come to the window and make a face because we do that back and forth. Like he's friendly, I'm friendly, and you know, there's certain people that you can be a little more friendly with..."
Samuel Soyinka	Clarke High	"I don't care what you think. Just say it the way it should be said and get out. You know, I don't have any troubles hanging around – I mean hanging out with them [my colleagues]."
Roger Manley	Ralph Emerson High	"I think it's pretty easy [to be myself around colleagues] because in a sense, I think as you get older and after teaching... I'd say coming on ten years now [in this school], I think I have a pretty good idea of kind of how to approach [my colleagues]."
Hugh Ferguson	Ralph Emerson High	"So I'm the only Black male teacher in the department. There's actually one other Black woman this year, so they're most are White males and white females. But it's actually the white males that I've done well with. They also teach the same subjects."
Matthew Morial	Washington Irving High School	"Many of my colleagues I would call friends. Many of the teachers already know me from in my personal life, so I don't really feel like bashful around them."
Kanye Carter	Washington Irving High School	"I think what happens is the people of color as some of the people that I referred to are people that I've formed relationships with in various lights."

Pierce Bond	Explorations High	“A couple of weeks back myself and one of the other African American colleagues went to a Celtics game. There's a possibility we'll get together to watch the Super Bowl tomorrow... I just for the first time went out for drinks with a couple of my colleagues – again the younger more relatable individuals. I couldn't imagine myself doing that with most of my colleagues, the more older, established, folks.”
Okonkwo Sutton	Explorations High	“You want to watch how you speak to some people, and you want to watch your tone because you may be perceived as, say for example, angry, or you don't really mean to be angry. You just mean to be more serious.”
Lawrence Graham	Explorations High	“I think our colleagues are very open. They express – I think one of the things that makes us a tight knit group is kind of we talk about our personal lives all the time.”
George Little	Thomas Jefferson High	“There is so much turnover in this school and schools like this and it's almost like starting over each year, but our department particularly is so comfortable like a family. We call ourselves a family.”
Christopher Brook	Thomas Jefferson High	“I feel like almost a prisoner as if all eyes are on me though. Like if my phone's out or if I'm on my laptop or I'm being oh look. It's almost like they're trying to find something wrong with me instead of just letting me be sometimes.”
Dante Smith	Thomas Jefferson High	“I can be myself; I can be myself socially;

Such sentiments were also shared among participants at other Grouper schools. Kendall Robeson, 32, at Clarke, described being “playful” with his colleagues. One observation during the data collection period was that teachers, mostly Black but some White, would come to his classroom door presumably to talk with him. As interviews took place during his free period, colleagues assumed he would be able to speak. Robeson explained one teacher's visit this way: “and like you just saw the teacher come to the window and make a face because we do that back and forth.” He also described walking up to another male colleague to “give him a hug...have a laugh and joke or

whatever, talk about music, talk about sports.” Robeson also discussed routinely going out to eat his colleagues and the school’s Black male principal. Robeson’s colleagues shared similar beliefs about the ease of being themselves around their colleagues. Leroy Jackson, 55, asserted: “It’s easy to be myself because I don’t try to be something that I’m not, while Samuel Soyinka, 40, affirmed: “I don’t have any troubles hanging around them [my colleagues].

And yet at another Grouper school, Explorations Charter, a first year teacher, Pierce Bond, noted the importance of his burgeoning friendships with colleagues. He believed this friendship “made tremendous changes in [his] attitude because [he] was hitting that rough, mid-winter, long and difficult period.” Bond described how he “got a text from a fellow co-worker – one of my African American colleagues [Lawrence Graham] and said, ‘Hey do you want to get together and go to the basketball game?’” This initial interaction with Black colleagues appeared to form a crucial social bond for Bond who recently moved to the Boston area. “I’m new do the area. I don’t know many people around here.” Bond continued to socialize with his colleagues, particularly the other Black male teachers. “A couple of weeks back myself and one of the other African American colleagues went to a Celtics game. There’s a possibility we’ll get together to watch the Super Bowl tomorrow.” This social network, for Bond, kept him attached to the organization appeared to influence his decision on whether he might stay or leave: “I would now, given our relationships, have to take those into consideration when thinking about whether or not I’m going to stay or go.”

Loners’ Social Isolation

While Groupers appeared to be more at ease in the organization and described a sense of connection to their colleagues, the majority of Loners described challenges with being the only one (see Table 6.4). One exception to this sense of social isolation was James Price at Race to the Top. The primary reason Price felt less alienated was a result of his relationship with Ms. Maud – a Black woman who has served for 28-years as the school’s paraprofessional. Despite being the only Black man on the school’s faculty, Price described turning to Ms. Maud because she’s “a person of color” around whom he feels “very comfortable.” Price described how he relied on Ms. Maud’s institutional history, as a new teacher in a new city. When compared to his other colleagues, according to Price, Ms. Maud is able to “understand what I’m going through.” Missing from this dissertation is a lack of a thorough analysis exploring the interactions between study participants and their Black female colleagues. However, this aforementioned example of the integral role Ms. Maud played in Price’s sense of connection to the organization may begin to explain why he was one of the only Loners who described being able to be himself around colleagues. Specifically five, or about three-quarters of these teachers believed it was difficult to be themselves around colleagues. Loners asserted that, at times in their schools, they were “in someone else’s house” described feelings of “paranoia” or wondering if they were “saying something crazy” when interacting with colleagues. The sum total of these sentiments, I posit, are a manifestation of being socially isolated in the organization.

Table 6.4: Loners' School Name, School Composition and Descriptions of Social Isolation

Participant	School Name	Descriptions of Social Isolation
Josiah Washington	Roseville Elementary	"It can feel empowering at times; it can also feel isolating at times...it's isolating because you are the only one that really has your viewpoint or vantage point from which you are looking at situations or thinking of different things."
Kurt Sharpton	South High	"I'm the only black male here and I feel like I'm being perceived or looked at as someone who has to be watched... I'm the only brother working in here....I feel like you just stand out in the crowd all the time. Like all eyes are truly on you."
James Price	Race to the Top Elementary	"I think she (an aide who has been at the school for 28 years) understands just another person of color...She's a woman of color as well, I feel very comfortable, talking and sharing things that I normally wouldn't share with somebody else, because I feel like definitely we are the same race. Certain things, I think they'll understand I'm going through. Maybe not another person of a different race. So having that – I feel comfortable."
Benjamin Young	Alberto Schomburg K -8	"Well I'm a male. It's mostly female here. Two – I'm a Black male so I can't get mad like people can because people don't like Black males getting mad. I can't be myself all the way... No they're going to perceive the stereotype... Angry black male. If I raise my voice people get scared. They think I'm going to go off or something. I don't go off. I don't ever do that."
Peter Baldwin	Apple Elementary	"It almost feels like I'm in someone else's house like intruding. Like you guys are having this conversation about these things and you're all like sort of connected and I'm kind of just here because I have to be here because I have to eat my lunch"
Wole Achebe	Grand Case Pilot	"I feel that there are things that are being said about me when I'm not there, and sometimes it slips out... "I think – and this might just be paranoid me speaking, but I think that people get the impression that I'm conceited, and I feel like I'm better than everyone else. It's really hard for me to get into their heads."
Dennis Sangister	Marcus Garvey K- 8	"It (being on the school's faculty) sucks. And if I could swear I would...I mean it makes you feel inadequate. Like

		<p>am I saying something that's crazy? I've been educated. I have a Master's. I pass all these MTEs just like everybody else. It's frustrating you know?"</p>
--	--	---

Loners' sentiments were a consequence of their challenging relationships with colleagues, or, specifically, social isolation. Pierce Bond's experience, as a first year teacher in a school with many more Black male teachers, was strikingly different than Peter Baldwin's – a first year teacher and Loner at Apple Pilot Elementary. Baldwin, 32, initially suggested positive feelings towards his school because of relationships with colleagues. In describing his school, during the first round interview in January, Baldwin noted: "it's very close to what I was looking for. I feel like the staff, they're great...And everyone's just nice. I wouldn't have anything negative to say." By the second round interview in May, however, Baldwin's sentiments about his colleagues appeared to change. He recounted the isolating experience of sitting around a table and as his female colleagues discussed "menstruation and childbirth." "It almost feels like I'm in someone else's house like intruding. Like you guys are having this conversation about these things and you're all like sort of connected and I'm kind of just here because I have to be here because I have to eat my lunch," suggested Baldwin. The notion of "intruding" and "being in someone else's house" may well be the consequence of his social isolation in the organization. Here, in an informal setting, the teacher lunchroom, where the lines between the professional and the personal conflate, Baldwin was acutely aware that his female colleagues were "all like sort of connected" and he was not.

Wole Achebe, 33, described himself as an "outgoing person," but around his colleagues he's "a very, very quiet person...that's when my quiet personality comes in."

He noted that his change to a “quiet personality” was because it was “the safest place to be.” Achebe’s retreat from his outgoing self to his quiet self, appeared to be in response to a belief that his colleagues talked negatively about him when he was not in their presence. “I feel that there are things that are being said about me when I’m not there, and sometimes it slips out.” While Achebe is uncertain what people are saying, he believes that people are indeed talking about him. In perceiving that his colleagues talked about him when he was absent appeared to engender a sense of paranoia and resulted in Achebe having to “fill in the pieces.” “I think – and this might just be paranoid me speaking, but I think that people get the impression that I’m conceited, and I feel like I’m better than everyone else. It’s really hard for me to get into their heads.” According to Achebe, one reason his colleagues may cite for why he could be considered “conceited” is the principal’s public adulation for how Achebe engages students in learning. During one meeting, as the principal highlighted some of Achebe’s effective practices he looked around the room and saw his colleagues “rolling their eyes.” As a result of the constant worrying about how his colleagues might interpret what he says, Achebe appeared to withdraw, psychically from his colleagues, primarily in formal settings.

For the most part. I mean there’s sometimes depending on the atmosphere, you know, or if I know that my contribution, my engagement, my obvious engagement is necessary for the meeting to continue, then that’s where I would become more talkative. But otherwise, if it’s a meeting where I’m supposed to be passive, I will be passive. But if my activity, excuse me, is expected I would be more talkative.

One Loner, Dennis Sangister at Marcus Garvey K - 8, described his feelings as negative because of colleagues was a bit more direct in sharing his sentiments about being a faculty member: “It sucks. And if I could swear I would.” For Sangister, his

greatest frustration comes with, as he described the “invisible liberal identity that seems to be present. I’m not saying that the people themselves are racists. However their interactions and their choices that involve our children are slightly racist.” Sangister recounted an experience that may have increased his sense of social isolation. He noted that his colleagues issued demerits as a form of behavior modification. Despite his protestation in a grade team meeting that such a method did not allow for “positive reinforcement,” the policy persisted. Appearing fatalistic in his ability to change such a policy, Sangister conceded: “I’m one voice among eight –one Black voice amongst eight White staff” on his grade team. In the end, Sangister noted that his colleagues’ inability to listen to his ideas, to acknowledge his voice, “messes” with him. Elaborating, “I mean it makes you feel inadequate. Like am I saying something that's crazy? I've been educated. I have a Master's. I pass all these MTEs just like everybody else. It's frustrating you know?,” Sangister lamented. Sangister was unequivocal about his characterization of his negative feelings about being a faculty member at Marcus Garvey. And, like Achebe, his sense of social isolation in the organization increased as his colleagues continuously chose not to acknowledge his voice, or ideas, when deciding on matters pertaining to students.

And, finally, Kurt Sharpton’s experience, particularly as it relates to paranoia, at South High where he is the only Black male teacher on the faculty supports a theoretical framework that suggests Loners are socially isolated in the organization. Sharpton teaches physical education at South. His class, like many physical education classes, is located in the gymnasium. And, like in many gymnasiums located in schools, there are cameras. A U.S. Department of Justice report highlighted that schools should install

cameras to deter unsupervised students from entering the gymnasium or to help identify intruders who break into a school (Green, 1999). In schools, cameras are commonplace and ubiquitous.

Kurt Sharpton believes cameras in the gym were there to monitor him because he was the only Black male teacher in the school: “I am the only Black male in here and I’m the person on the camera. Just by the statistics alone, makes that something.” Sharpton was assertive when he acknowledged a desire to have the cameras removed. He believed the principal monitored his behavior from a closed circuit television screen in her office. One day during the start of the academic year, Sharpton confronted the principal, a White female, and asked her if the cameras were on. He went on to assert to the principal, “The cameras that you have on there are making me physically sick.” The principal responded by “turning her back and walking away and still to that point she hadn’t acknowledged that there were cameras in my room.” In “walking away” the principal appeared to disregard Sharpton’s concern, or voice. Sharpton believed that he was constantly under surveillance, which appeared to take a physical toll on him. Finally, after sending the principal an email regarding the cameras, she agreed to meet with him. During the meeting, the principal denied that the cameras were on and insisted that the gymnasium was a ‘public space’ and therefore the cameras could not be removed. Sharpton associated the commonplace cameras in the gymnasium as a tool that the school’s administrator used to uniquely target his class. This targeting, Sharpton believed, was because of his race and gender; he noted, “Black males are so stigmatized.” One result of believing the school’s principal was watching his class appeared to be not only becoming “physically sick,” but an increased sense of paranoia.

Sharpton suggested an increased sensitivity to any changes in the principal's behavior when it came to his class. He related one unannounced observation by the school's principal to the cameras in the gymnasium. Under the new teacher evaluation system, administrators can observe one's class without notice. And such, it would be reasonable to conclude that the principal's observation was similar to other unannounced observations in the school. However, Sharpton believed otherwise. "It was unannounced visit but I honestly think in my true heart of hearts, I think she's looking at these cameras," he suggested. The reason, in Sharpton's mind, the principal may have wanted to observe his class was because, "She saw a down time in my class and said, now I'm going to go review him." According to Sharpton, her visit did not result in a negative evaluation, but he cited her visit as "unfair."

I could not verify if the cameras were turned on or not. And, I do not believe Sharpton was *actually* paranoid. But, I do believe, similar to Achebe who believes his colleagues are "always talking about him" and Sangister who wonders if "he is saying something crazy," that being in social isolation in an organization can create a sense of paranoia. What appeared to be a commonplace device, a camera in a gymnasium, served as a way for examining how Loners experience social isolation in the organization. The cameras, for Sharpton, made him hyper-aware about how school administrators perceived his work. Sharpton recognized and attributed his surveillance to being Black and male and, more importantly, to being the only Black male teacher in the organization. Sharpton described his protests of inquiry to the principal around the cameras as going unheard. And, the longer the cameras remain, the more sick he became. Sharpton appeared to

become more adamant that, indeed, the cameras were on and continued to withdrawing into a narrative that positioned him as constantly under the principal's watchful eye.

Summary: Social Isolation in Organizations

In responding to how it felt to be a member of the faculty, most Groupers suggested a positive attachment to the organization because of amicable relationships with colleagues. Participants in schools with numerous Black male teachers were keen to describe how their colleagues acknowledged their voices and included them in social events. In comparison, many Loners appeared ambivalent when describing how it felt to be on the faculty. One potential reason for this ambivalence may be the increased social isolation experienced by those participants who were the only Black male teacher on their faculty. Not having one's voice heard in informal (e.g. around the teacher lunchroom table) or formal (e.g. grade team meetings) settings appeared to contribute to the mixed feelings of being a member in the organization and, more importantly, the sense of social isolation. This disaggregation of the differing experiences of workers in the numerical minority in skewed groups is particularly crucial given Kanter's (1977) singular exploration of how persons in the numerical minority navigate the organization when compared to the numerical majority. And, more importantly, it begins to inform theory of how workers in the extreme numerical minority experience social isolation in the organization.

Loners, such as Achebe and Washington, were more likely to describe a memorable experience with a colleague when that interaction involved a form of public praise. Both for Achebe and Washington this public praise might well serve as a

validation, to them and their colleagues, that their skills and competencies are important for the school's functioning. Groupers, however, were more likely to report that when a memorable interaction occurred with a colleague, the experience happened one-on-one with that colleague.

Data from this dissertation highlight one missing facet from Kanter's (1977) framework on the theory of numbers and group composition. Kanter (1977) acknowledges that there are distinct experiences for individuals as a consequence of being in a skewed group. However, what is clear from participants in this study is that one's experience in the skewed group varies depending on organizational characteristics. One such organizational characteristic appears to be the number of other individuals who identify as belonging to the same race and gender group. In the end, I find that Loners, or teachers working in schools employing just one Black male teacher, experience schools in distinct ways when compared to Groupers, or schools with larger numbers of Black male teachers.

Chapter VII

Performance Pressure, Boundary Heightening, and Role Encapsulation

This chapter attempts to answer one of the study's research questions – What are Black male teachers' experiences with organizational dynamics of performance pressures, boundary heightening, and role encapsulation? To do this, I analyze participants' experiences with each dynamic and explore variations in responses by Loners and Groupers.

Performance Pressure

Kanter (1977) characterized the interactions in which individuals in the numerical minority performed their work as negative, or a “performance pressure” that is different than that experienced by their colleagues in the numerical majority. Kanter (1977) noted that the performance pressure faced by tokens was performing “their jobs under symbolic conditions different from those of dominants” (p.212). Workers in the numerical minority enact tasks with the added burden of believing that their social group identity influences both their interactions with colleagues and the product derived from the work. For example, the lone Black teacher may be hyper-aware of how his students perform on a particular test when compared to the students of a White colleague.

Those in the numerical minority, according to Kanter (1977), responded in three distinct ways: over-achieving, acting in a way that appeared less threatening to those in the numerical minority, or becoming invisible, socially. For Kanter (1977), these performance expectations occurred vis-à-vis interactions with a peer or a superior, but not with someone that they supervised. However, Kelly (2007) begins to fill this gap around the worker's responded to a performance expectation in relationship to a subordinate.

Specifically, he discussed “performance enhancers” or the attempts by Black teachers to improve the schooling experiences of Black students in predominately White schools.

Building on frameworks from Kanter (1977) and Kelly (2007), data from this study suggest that participants across each of the 14 schools experienced performance pressures. But, participants responded to these performance pressures by designing new roles for themselves in the organization – a process Wrzesniewski and Dutton (2001) term *job crafting*. Specifically, Wrzesniewski and Dutton (2001) define job crafting as “the physical and cognitive changes individuals make in the task or relational boundaries of their work” (p.179). In addition to following the edicts from supervisors as a guide to enacting their work, workers also redefine their work in ways that are suitable and meaningful to them (Wrzesniewski, LoBuglio, Dutton, & Berg, 2013). The nascent literature around job crafting (Berg, Grant, & Johnson, 2010; Dutton, Roberts, & Bednar, 2010; Ko, 2012) discusses how workers redesign tasks to increase their engagement with the organization.

Job Crafting as a Response to Performance Pressures

In this study, I observe that participants experienced performance pressures. Unlike the women in Indesco (Kanter, 1977), the pressures for participants to perform did not come from colleagues inside of the organization. Instead, the pressures were inherent to why these Black men joined the teaching profession – to improve the social and academic outcomes for students of color. Participants responded to performance pressures by engaging in job crafting. Specifically, the Black teachers in this study crafted jobs that were designed to increase their engagement with the organization. Black male teachers, in this study, performed in strategic and distinct ways to improve the

experiences and learning outcomes of students, specifically students of color. For participants, improving the learning outcomes of students – particularly those of color - made the work more meaningful. Moreover, I observe that the degree to which participants were successful in engaging with the organization was related to key organizational characteristics – namely the number of other Black men on the faculty.

Job Crafting at Clarke High

For Black male teachers at Clarke, the performance expectations did not come from colleagues in the organization. Instead, these expectations appeared to come from intrinsic beliefs around how a Black male teacher should perform to increase Black students' learning outcomes. The performance expectations then influenced how Black male teachers crafted their jobs to raise achievement for their Black students.

One example of job crafting that occurred with the four participants in this school, Slaughter Gibson, Samuel Soyinka, Kendall Robeson, and Leroy Jackson, was the development of a specific initiative aimed at improving achievement among Black students. Participants described creating and participating in a teacher work group, comprised exclusively of the school's Black teachers, which focused on addressing Black students' social and academic challenges at Clarke. Study participants, along with their Black female colleagues, believed their fellow teachers and school administrators were not doing enough to increase promotion rates and decrease suspension rates for the school's Black students. As a response, they created a group to address these issues.

Slaughter Gibson, the school's former union leader and a social studies teacher, initiated the teacher work group. "So I proposed last year that we establish a Black caucus to deal with these issues [the negative academic outcomes evidenced by Clarke's

Black students].” Participants were thus explicit about the type of role they crafted and the outcome they intended to see. According to Samuel Soyinka, a physics teacher “the intent of that [teacher workgroup] was to see how we help Black kids because many of them seem to have behavior issues, and not only that, academically, they were not doing very well. We are concerned because many of them get suspended.” Kendall Robeson, a Spanish teacher, noted that invitations were spread through informal channels - word of mouth. “We just see each other, we speak. ‘Hey, we were thinking about doing this today or tomorrow. Would you be able to do it?’ ‘So we’ll meet in such and such’s room.’” According to Robeson, the group “met maybe twice...trying to bounce ideas off each other and maybe vent to each other a little bit to see if we can come up with some conclusions or ways to help one another.”

Leroy Jackson, a physical education teacher at Clarke, provided some insight about the impetus for Black teachers’ crafting these new jobs and what Robeson may have meant about the need to “vent.” Responding to how much teachers expressed concern for male students of color, Jackson noted: “I don’t hear this too much from the White teachers.” Moreover, Jackson appeared most frustrated when describing his interactions with his White colleagues with regards to redirecting students of color. “I’ve spoken to some White teachers about certain kids because there’s only a group of them. It’s not all of them. They [White teachers] feel like if they just let them [students of color] just do what they want then they [students of color] won’t give them [White teachers] no hard time.” Jackson described taking another approach when interacting with students of color. “I will speak to them and I keep trying to tell them, say, ‘Look here, how long you think this is gonna go on. If this is the way you gonna do your life so

where it's gonna get you. It's already affecting your performance.” For Jackson, as well as his Black and female colleagues, the urgency around crafting this new job appeared to be related to their disappointment with school officials actions, and in particular their colleagues’ inaction around addressing Black students’ socio-emotional and academic challenges. As Jackson’s colleague, Samuel Soyinka, noted: “we feel at some point, the best people to reach them would be the Black teachers... the White teachers don’t even get that [Black students’ social challenges] to some extent.

Black teachers at Clarke believed that the most effective medium for improving Black students’ outcomes was to meet amongst themselves to brainstorm solutions – thereby excluding their White colleagues. When examining the organization’s context as it relates to demographics, one observes that Clarke had the highest percentage of White teachers, approximately seventy percent, when compared to Black teachers, ten percent, for all Grouper schools. Latinos represented sixty percent of Clarke’s students; an equal number, 15 percent, were Black and White. The presence of White teachers, coupled with the similar percentage of Black and White students, may have ignited racial tension among Clarke’s teachers. Consequently, the Black teachers may have believed it was more conducive to meet amongst themselves, given their goal of improving Black students’ academic and social challenges did not seem to be a school wide focus. Kendall Robeson underscored this point by stating that he believed that the only way to help Black students was with the input from Black teachers. “Well, the African-American student population is numbers wise, about on par with the Caucasian numbers...So I don’t know if it [Black teachers talking only about Black students] would be perceived as maybe a slight. I don’t know if people would have a problem with it either.” Robeson

initially suggested that teachers might feel greater concern for same raced students, but, in the same breath, revised this claim to suggest that teachers were more likely to care for a student if both groups were from the same locale. “People tend to care about the people that look like them, people that come from the same area. Excuse me.” He goes on to describe that “Mr. Gibson lives in Dorchester and Sister³ Florence in Roxbury and I’m from Roxbury.” Robeson ends by affirming an expectation that he believed was central to his work as an educator. “We have a responsibility for all kids, but especially the kids that come from our community.”

Given the disproportionate number of White teachers, relative to Black teachers, one might expect an organizational environment that was unsupportive of improving the schooling outcomes of one sub-group - either through formal channels such as a staff or department meeting or more informal ones similar to the teacher work group discussed above. One enabling factor that might have emboldened Black teachers to actively pursue an unpopular agenda of creating a workgroup to improve the academic and social outcomes for the school’s minority Black student population may have been the presence of many more same race and gender colleagues. For participants at Clarke, there appeared to be a sense that they were not isolated in their feelings about how the school’s Black students performed. And, recognizing that this sentiment was shared among other Black colleagues, participants were able to engage in job crafting without being rebuffed by other colleagues or administrators.

Job Crafting at Crossroads K -8

Similar patterns hold in another Grouper school where a Black male study participant may have been emboldened to perform functions that he believed would

³ The term “sister” is commonly used as a term of endearment when referring to a Black woman.

improve students' learning outcomes. For example, Jacob Collins taught a third grade all-boys class at Crossroads K – 8 School. Collins believed that he was “called to do it,” or teach male students of color. Collins’s calling, a spiritual calling, to the teaching profession in order to improve the learning outcomes for boys of color is one that comes from outside of the organization. This calling for Collins appeared to be in response to Black boys’ social condition, such as high rates of living in female-headed households (Snyder, McLaughlin, & Finders, 2006). “Many times the kids we serve don’t have males in their lives or, they don’t have males who are like us,” suggested Collins.

Based on his belief about how Black males can influence the learning outcomes for Black boys, Collins decided to leave his previous BPS school and teach at Crossroads. In his first year at Crossroads, Collins asserted, “I came because I wanted to teach in an all boys classrooms. That’s what drew me here otherwise I would not have come to this school.” Moreover, Collins saw the expectations around enacting his work as particularly crucial because he was “able to empower, educate, and elevate boys of color to greater heights academically and behaviorally.” Moreover, affirmed Collins, “I’m going to help them [the boys of color in his class] transform their way of perceiving the world and the things that they can do.”

In recognizing his calling to increase the achievement of male students of color, Collins seemed aware of the need to craft a job based on his concern about the learning environments his colleagues created for these students. Collins suggested, “Some of them are polarized by a male image of being Black or Latino... Some teachers here spend more time yelling at males of color than they do really trying to get to know them.” Collins went on to add “And because of that, the end results is there are male students of

color who are not academically achieving because we have people who are either lowering the standard or you're engaging with them as if they are an enemy in the building in an academic institution." As a result of his perception that male students of color "are [treated as] an enemy in the building," Collins has set out to make "the community better." In fact, he believed that through his work with male students of color, the organization and his colleagues in particular, became more responsive to students' needs. In talking about his colleagues, Collins noted "Because they've gotten that experience from me, and they've seen the benefit or they've seen—the kids respond and the community itself has been better because of it."

Although Collins crafted a job based on his beliefs about his role and his desire to engage with his job, his actions placed him at odds with his colleagues, even those who were Black. Amilcar Depina, a physical education teacher who is in his fourth year at Crossroads and 20th in the profession, described one instance in which Collins shared his vision for Black male teachers in the lives of male students of color in a way that offended a number of other teachers. This action negatively influenced, according to Depina, how he and his colleagues interacted with Collins. Depina recounted, it "was like one month after the school year started" that there was an article placed in all members of the school community's mailbox. Because Collins had verbally supported many of the ideas in the article, most people seemed to believe that he had distributed it. Depina noted, "I don't know if he [Collins] put it in everybody's mailbox or somebody else put in everybody's mailbox," he did find the article's content disturbing. The piece, according to Depina, was "about his experience here [at Crossroads]. How for a lot of these Black males, he would be their first Black [male] teacher that was not a coach."

Depina, a physical education teacher, may have personalized Collins's suggestion that students only had Black teachers who were "coaches."

The letter that Depina ascribed to Collins appeared to highlight his (Collins) belief that Black male teachers could serve as an elixir for improving Black boys' learning. However, this belief excluded the work of other teachers. Depina described the ways in which Collins discounted the work of female teachers – "so a female teacher who taught these kids in the first grade or second grade he [Collins] said they weren't qualified." Choosing not to refer to Collins, but by the pronouns "him" and "he" might begin to explain Depina's sentiments about the letter and his feelings about the way that Collins crafted his job - "That was not a good way to introduce yourself. So a lot of folks were really turned off by that article."

Eddie Rock, a theatre arts teacher at Crossroads recalled another early encounter that may have strained Collins's relationship with colleagues.

He came in. He had a name for his classroom. They are called the young engineers. He had or has had a few, you know, open house breakfasts for parents but they have been contained to just to his name... He has had some events that have gone on with his students that I think other teachers didn't really know about until they were already upon us. So, you know, I think some of these things that he's been doing, you know, he has been doing them in isolation.

Why might a teacher who is new to an organization, in his first month, feel enabled to share publicly his belief that males of color learn best when they have a Black male teacher who is not a coach? Why would Collins feel emboldened to invite parents into the building or create events and not alert his colleagues? Kanter (1977) suggested that one consequence of performance pressures is the need for the worker in the numerical minority to overachieve. While Collins may be overachieving, it could also be

the case that his decision to spread the gospel about the learning conditions that can improve Black boys' success and design programs exclusively for his students were influenced by particular organizational conditions at Crossroads. He might have felt emboldened to take on these roles because of the presence of other Black teachers and Crossroad's current professional development focus on increasing learning for Black boys.

Like the participants at Clarke, Collins is in an organization with many more Black male teachers. Moreover, Crossroads has, as an overall percentage, many more Black teachers and Black male teachers than Clarke: 40 percent and 11 percent compared to five percent and 10 percent, respectively. Collins may have perceived that the relatively large number of Black teachers would endorse the job he crafted given the school's focus on improving learning outcomes for males. Perceiving that teachers, particularly White teachers, viewed males of color as "an enemy in an academic institution," Collins may have believed that his Black colleagues shared his "calling" and would support his gospel message. Moreover, Collins may have been further enabled to share his article and continued activities exclusively for the boys in his class and not invite other teachers, as a consequence of the school's decision to focus its professional development (PD) on creating strategies to improving Black boys' learning outcomes. As Eddie Rock, a Theatre Arts teacher at Crossroads noted, "one of our main focuses of all our professional developments here" was on male students of color. Rock added, "we've been using Alfred Tatum's book, literacy in young Black males as sort of a go to text...So every teacher in the school it's on our radar for at least two hours you know a month in PD." Collins entered an organizational environment where school

administrators sanctioned, publicly, the type of job Collins crafted - a focus on improving Black boys' learning. As such, school administrators' decision around PD may have further enabled Collins to craft this new job of sharing the gospel around how to improve the learning outcomes for Black boys without the fear of being rebuffed by either administrators or other colleagues. Collins's expectations to perform in a way that he perceived as improving Black boys' learning outcomes may have been facilitated by particular organizational conditions – namely the article that other teachers believed he distributed on the role for Black male teachers in the lives of Black boys and the social opportunities he designed for the young men in his class without including his colleagues. These conditions may well include the presences of same race and gender colleagues, as well as a publicly articulated philosophy from administrators that aligns with one's own job crafting.

Job Crafting at Roseville Pilot

While all teachers in the study described a form of performance expectation, the degree to which participants were able to actualize that expectation varied based on the numerical composition of Black men on the faculty. Moreover, Loners described feeling rebuffed by colleagues in their attempt to craft new jobs that focused on addressing the racial or gender dynamics in their schools.

Josiah Washington, a Loner and middle school teacher at Roseville Pilot School, suggested that he volunteered for his school hiring committee during the previous academic year. He noted that one reason he joined the hiring committee was an attempt to increase the number of male teachers, as well as male teachers of color, believing that students have little opportunity to have male teachers in grades K – 8. Washington noted,

“I was the only male of color, I wanted to see, if there was a way to have more males, whether they be of color or not...we have basically a K-8 model where students very rarely have a male teacher.” Washington added, “That was really my big push to have males.” Washington, like study participants at Clarke and Crossroads, expressed a sentiment that a more diverse workforce provided a benefit to students of color’s schooling experiences. Recognizing that he was the only Black male teacher on the school’s faculty, Washington wanted to increase the number of male faculty of color. However, Washington did not merely join the hiring committee to fill vacancies; he crafted a job that included advocating for male teachers and male teachers of color in an attempt to diversify the faculty.

While on the hiring committee, Washington realized that his colleagues, all of whom were White and female, did not share the objectives associated with his job crafting. Roseville is plagued by high teacher turnover; Washington and the committee were charged with filling vacancies for five of the nine member teaching team. Washington believed that for the committee his opinion was important to be “had,” but “it was not valued.” Out of the five interviews, Washington suggested that only in “one or two” cases was his opinion considered. Consequently, he began to ask himself, “so why am I here, if it’s not going to be considered, then I have some other things I could be doing other than that.” Washington appeared to believe that he was only asked to join the hiring committee because he was Black and male. It could be that the hiring committee, by asking Washington to join, wanted to present, both to current staff and applicants, an inclusive racial environment. However, Washington felt that his effort to engage with his job by joining the committee was not viewed as valuable. Instead, he felt like he was used

as a token or symbol of diversity, rather than being able to make his work more meaningful.

All teachers in this study experienced performance pressures and crafted jobs that would address these pressures. However, participants in schools where they were the only Black male teacher felt unable to craft their job in meaningful ways because their colleagues, many of whom were not of the same race or gender, rebuffed their efforts. For Washington, the only Black male teacher at Roseville, this became evident through the hiring committee's decision not to hire any of the male teacher applicants. Two male teachers, one White and one of color, applied and were interviewed. Both of these teachers taught with Washington at his former school. Both, however, were not extended offers to join the school's faculty – a decision that troubled Washington. Referring to these teachers, Washington suggested, “both of whom would have been great teachers.” The White male teacher, according to Washington, was not hired because members of the hiring committee believed the applicant offered perverse incentives to increase student learning. During this candidate's deliberation, Washington recalled his colleagues taking issue with the incentives. “He has incentives to help kids do well. And some of them included things like buying lunch...– they thought that it was too much.”

Washington was able to gather some information from committee members about how his colleagues did not value the objectives of his crafted job – increasing the number of male teachers and male teachers of color. Because of a scheduling conflict, Washington was not at the interview with a male of color. He noted, “I didn't actually interview him, which was interesting. I ended up having to be out of town...And I missed that and so it was really interesting. I think that may have had something to do

with it, but, anyway.” Here, Washington intimated that his inability to be present at the candidate’s interview may have encouraged his colleagues to find a reason not to extend an offer to the male applicant of color.

According to Washington, members of the hiring committee did not believe that the male candidate of color was tolerant toward gays. In trying to ascertain why the candidate was not hired, Washington learned that the decision was based on a specific response to a question asked by a female colleague.

A female asked that question around tolerance or something of that nature. And I think he gave a story around a personal story of him, I think a cousin or something like that. And how he was tolerant of some of that situation and I think in some of the language he was using, they were not – they seemed like it gave, it rubbed them the wrong way.

This response, from his colleagues, deeply troubled Washington particularly since the candidate was an observant Muslim. Washington presumed that this candidate’s religious association made him more likely to encounter discrimination given America’s heightened surveillance of Muslims post-9/11. In sharing his disappointment with colleagues, Washington recalled “And I was like, oh, okay, which is interesting, because he is also Muslim, so it’s kind of like...Speaking of tolerance, you know this is really interesting.” More generally, Washington did share his frustration with colleagues about two candidates who were “proven teachers and have shown what they can do.” His colleagues, in turn, “weren’t agreeing; they understood it and they were like okay.” The hiring committee filled the four vacancies, hiring three White women and one Mexican American woman.

In the end, Washington lamented – “after we finished doing all the hiring, you know I really felt as though my opinion wasn’t garnered, because we ended up having...

you know my push was males.” Recognizing the school’s need for more male teachers, particularly in the K- 8 continuum, as a Loner, Washington tried to perform his job in a way that would ameliorate the school’s lack of gender and racial diversity. Specifically, Washington tried to create diversity in the school’s faculty by joining the school’s hiring committee and potentially even encouraging former male colleagues to apply. In the end, Washington’s disagreement with the committee’s hiring preferences and his belief that he was unable to engage effectively influenced his decision not to participate again.

Like Clarke and Crossroads, an exploration of the organizational conditions at Roseville might begin to explain why Washington had difficulty enacting his performance expectations. Washington acknowledged a pattern of under-representation of male teachers and male teachers of color in U.S. public schools. This pattern held at Roseville where he was the only Black male teacher on the faculty. Further, on the hiring committee, Washington was the only person of color and the only male. The absence of same race and gender colleagues on the hiring committee, persons who may have shared Washington’s belief around diversifying the school’s faculty, could have influenced the fact that the majority of hires were White women. As the desired outcomes from his job crafting were unsuccessful, Washington responded in similar ways to other persons in the numerical minority – he refused to take part in future hiring decisions (Kanter, 1977).

Job Crafting at Marcus Garvey K - 8

Dennis Sangister, a Loner, is in his third year at Marcus Garvey and seventh in the profession. Like Washington, Sangister described similar frustrations around how his colleagues rebuffed the objectives of his job crafting. Sangister keenly felt the need to help his students academically and socially, given the economic challenges of Garvey’s

students: “their parents work, you know, eight, nine-ten-hour jobs. Some of them are working two to three jobs just to be poor, so the TV raises them. The neighborhood raises them.” In response to the socio-economic realities that Sangister’s students bring with them to the organization, Sangister crafted a job in which he is explicit about how students might become socially mobile. Specifically he “model[s] it for them” or, as he suggested, “I literally meet the kids where they're at.”

For Sangister, who is in his late twenties, this job crafting manifested itself in the way he chooses to dress. “I wear Jordan's on Fridays. When I come to school I have on a fitted hat. Sometimes when I take the train in, I have on the popular headphones,” according to Sangister. At other times, Sangister wanted his students “to see [him] in a different light. Yesterday it was my teacher hat. I had my shirt and my tie and my blazer on.” In fact, as this interview took place over the course of two days - this was one noted observation: he wore a shirt and tie on one day; baggy jeans and sneakers the next. Sangister attempted to convey to his students that being successful did not mean one would be unable to wear “Jordan’s” or “a fitted hat;” and, that part of social mobility means, sometimes, putting on “a shirt, tie, and blazer.”

With great intentionality, Sangister used his apparel, moving between urban and white-collar wear, as a way to model for students what and how being a successful person of color might look. Through his changing apparel, Sangister engaged in job crafting with the intended outcome of increasing students’ engagement with school. Sangister’s students, in turn, began to draw closer to him. “It would be easier to see themselves in me versus some of my other colleagues,” he noted. Sangister suggested that as a result of his decision to wear urban apparel, students were more likely to identify with him when

compared to the school's White teachers who accounted for approximately 50 percent of the faculty. Black teachers were about 25 percent of the school's faculty.

During the spring interview, as previously mentioned, Sangister wore his jeans and sneakers to school, thus engaging in job crafting. However, Sangister's colleagues critiqued his job crafting. He recalled a colleague saying, "You're acting like the kids." Sangister confessed, "That one comment really messed me up - as a professional, for someone to say to me [to change my attire]." He added, "It's just like 'no I'm an adult who's very conscious of what I'm doing and I'm strategic about the way I do it.'" As Sangister crafted and enacted his job, he also appeared to be attuned to other organizational conditions – namely the scrutiny from his colleagues.

Like the other day I said to one of my colleagues, 'I'm trying to rack up on those brownie points with the kids.' I had on these little glasses that the kids wear. They're not prescription glasses. I try to make sure that they [my colleagues] understand that I'm not just being an immature adult. I'm strategically doing these things because I'm trying to sell something to these kids.

This dual-consciousness, of having to be attentive to crafting a job and then needing to rationalize that job to one's colleagues, might begin to explain why Sangister asserted - "It sucks to be in this place." For Sangister, as well as other Loners, the lack of same race and gender colleagues may begin to explain why their colleagues misunderstood and consequently blocked attempts at enacting crafted jobs. And, similar to Kanter's (1977) workers in the numerical minority, Sangister suggested he intends to leave Garvey because of his relationships with colleagues.

Summary

Groupers were able to respond to performance pressures by successfully crafting a job. At Clarke and Crossroads, teachers were able to actively address the learning of

students of color through brainstorming sessions with other teachers of color and participation in PD sessions around helping Black boys that reinforced their crafted roles. However, the Loners had a different experience. Loners attempted to craft roles that would allow them to engage more meaningfully with students. However, they were not able to do so. In response, they became socially invisible as theorized by Kanter (1977).

Boundary Heightening

For Kanter (1977) boundary heightening was a result of workers in the numerical minority being attuned to their differences when compared to members in the organization who were in the numerical majority. According to Kanter (1977), persons in the numerical minority attempted to assimilate with colleagues, at times begrudgingly. Or, they would keep to themselves, thus remaining in isolation. Kelly (2007) found that in addition to experiencing boundary heightening, Black teachers described border crossing, or choosing to interact and integrate with White colleagues.

Black male teachers in this study intimated that of the three organizational dynamics, social boundaries had the greatest influence on their relationship with members in the organization and their sense of attachment or detachment to the organization. For Black male teachers, the self-imposed organizational pressures around performance expectations and job crafting were greatest with respect to improving students' outcomes. Expectations of role encapsulation, however, were most pronounced from colleagues, as was a sense of social boundary. Study participants described social boundaries being erected in varying ways. For example, participants' colleagues expressed doubt about their Black male colleagues' content knowledge or their fit for the profession; either participants were under qualified or over qualified to teach. Such

perceptions by their colleagues resulted in Black male teachers feeling like the other in the organization. Loners often felt the most isolated in the face of boundary heightening. However, participants in schools with many more Black male teachers, at times, used other Black male teachers in the building to make sense of their boundary heightening experience.

Content Knowledge

Kendall Robeson, a Spanish teacher at Clarke High School, a Grouper school, described his colleague's skepticism around his ability to speak Spanish. "I think people doubted me...by looking at a book before you open it up...people were like okay who is this Black guy, trying to speak Spanish." Robeson noted feeling the greatest distance between him and the chair of the Spanish department, Ms. Flores. He suggested that Ms. Flores may have been "unsure of [him], she was unsure that [he] would be able to do the job." Ms. Flores's lack of confidence may have been a result of her not knowing "that I could really speak Spanish well or whatever," according to Robeson.

In addition to Ms. Flores, Robeson believed that his other colleagues were also skeptical about his ability to speak Spanish. For Robeson, this skepticism was a consequence of his race and gender. Robeson added - "I think Black men always have to prove themselves. We are used to it, we do it." And, for Robeson, one way that he has gone about proving himself to colleagues is "to translate for somebody or speak on the phone or talk to this parent." In so doing, suggested Robeson, for his colleagues who have "never heard me then I think that it proves that I can," or speak Spanish and is qualified to teach the language to students. For Robeson, however, the subtle ways in which his colleagues intimated that he may not have been qualified to teach Spanish,

because he was a native born Black American, erected boundaries between him and other members in the organization.

While Kendall Robeson stated that his colleagues believed he lacked the qualifications to be a teacher on the faculty, Hugh Ferguson, a teacher at Ralph Emerson, an exam school, noted that his co-workers thought he was overqualified for the position. Ferguson, who teaches calculus, has an undergraduate degree in engineering from one of the country's most prestigious technical universities. He submitted that his pedigree "created barriers for people...it tends to alienate you." In his second year, he described one teacher, Mr. O'Connor, a White male, in his department finally "warming" up to him. According to Ferguson, Mr. O'Connor, initially believed he was a spy "for BPS administration. He thought I was spying on teachers, so he thought I was a plant in the school. That was his impression of me. He thought I was too polished, too well rounded, that, you know, he couldn't understand why I was into teaching." Ferguson, however, did not appear taken aback by Mr. O'Connor's admission. "I graduated from [an elite institution], many people actually have a tough time understanding Blacks who have graduated from [an elite institution] because they know that [an elite institution] means you are intelligent," noted Ferguson. Ferguson went on to add, "They still struggle to accept that that is actually true and...how do they treat you when they still feel they're superior." At 49, Ferguson appeared well attuned to the potential root causes (e.g. an inferiority complex) of the challenges that arise when working with White individuals in the organization. And, he believed that White colleagues fell into two categories:

Either they accept that you really did accomplish quite a bit or they're forever jealous and you'll never move past that... the ones that can accept it, you are able to work with them, the ones who remain jealous you're never really going to be able to work with them successfully.

With the recognition that there might be some teachers with whom he might not be able to work well, Ferguson derived strategies for lowering the boundaries with these teachers. One such barrier that was erected came in his first year of teaching in what Ferguson described as a “slight altercation” with his White female colleague who taught honors calculus in the classroom next to him. When planning the unit on functions, Ferguson disagreed with how his colleague described the mathematical relationship between concepts. In explaining how the situation played out, Ferguson recalled, “she just told me I was wrong...I was just – a little blown away by that ’cause I wasn’t wrong, first of all. And she just felt like I didn’t know what I was talking about, so she wanted me to shut up.” In response to what he believed may have been his colleague’s inferiority complex, Robeson started “popping in and just saying hi for no reason, just, you know, how are you doing, how is the class going, what are you up to this weekend, you know what are you up to this weekend, nothing intimidating.” In “popping in,” Ferguson realized that these interactions “build some kind of a relationship” and that his colleague has “definitely lowered her guard and is more receptive now.” As such, Ferguson has, at the end of his second year at Emerson, created strategies that he believes can decrease the social boundaries between himself and his White female colleague.

Ultimately, Ferguson, trained at two of the country’s most elite institutions, appeared unable to employ coping strategies that would make his colleagues no longer believe he was different from them. Ferguson was forced to leave Emerson at the end of the school year. The reason provided by administrators was that “the school lost federal funding, so his position had to be cut.” Since Ferguson does not have tenure, the school,

per collective bargaining agreements, can dismiss teachers at will. When pressed if he thought his tension with his colleagues was related to not returning to the school, he replied, “As a provisional teacher [untenured] you have no guarantees, I mean, it is nothing about fairness. They can let you go whenever they feel like it.” It also seemed that Ferguson might have been asked to leave after his first year. He described his most memorable experience at the school when “students signed a petition to make sure the school kept me, so they actually put together a whole petition and gave it to the headmaster to let her know that they were supportive of me.” In the end, Ferguson did not return to Emerson the following year. Roger Manley, Ferguson’s former colleague at Emerson, seemed to cast doubt on the school’s initial claim about having to cut a math position due to a loss of funding. Manley noted that the school had hired another math teacher. Ferguson’s dismissal seemed to underscore his belief that when White workers believed themselves to be academically inferior to Black workers, “the ones who remain jealous you’re never really going to be able to work with them successfully.” Ferguson’s dismissal appears strikingly similar to one woman in Kanter’s (1977) study who was fired for being “too aggressive” (p.217). Kanter (1977) suggested that a culture of retaliation can characterize workers in the numerical majority when threatened by the perceived higher skills of workers in the numerical minority.

Developing Coping Strategies

This pattern of creating coping strategies in the organization to decrease the differences between Black male teachers in this study and their colleagues continued to hold across other participants. Wole Achebe, a Loner and the English department chair, during the first interview noted feeling “paranoid” (Cacioppo & Hawley, 2009). He

added, “I think that people get the impression that I’m conceited, and I feel like I’m better than everyone else.” Between the first and second interview, a female colleague confirmed Achebe’s suspicions to him. A female colleague mentioned that she heard another colleague - all hearsay - describe Achebe as “pompous.” This characterization about Achebe, who was born in Nigeria, but educated in England, was based on “the way I dress...I’m always wearing a suit and a tie... [and] the way I speak.” In the same breath, Achebe suggested that one of his colleagues, a White male, did not believe he “should be the English teacher or chair of the English department” because “I’m from Nigeria.” Achebe described an “air of racism that circulates when he’s (his English colleague) around” as his colleague thinks, “he is more qualified [to be the English chair] because he actually grew up speaking English.” For Achebe, these sentiments are based, primarily, on perceptions – “I could just be making this up in my mind, but this is basically what I strongly think.” In the end, Achebe, a Loner, conceded, “I’m not part of the group. There is this community and I’m an outsider.”

Despite his feeling of being an “outsider,” which may be a consequence of Achebe’s colleagues believing him to be “pompous” or not qualified to assume the position of English department chair, Achebe appeared strategic in his attempt to lower the social divide between himself and colleagues. Despite acknowledging that he does not “like being around them...they’re just not people that I would hang out with,” he goes out drinking with his colleagues every other Friday. Here, Achebe resembled some of the women in Kanter’s (1977) study who, in their attempt to decrease the social boundaries in the organization would socialize with men, by going out to drink. These women “wanted to feel like one of the guys” (p.226). The women at Indesco began to detest these

social encounters because of the crude sexual jokes their male colleagues told, “I didn’t want them to stop on my account, but I wish I had an alternative conversation” (p.226).

Unlike Kanter’s (1977) participants, Achebe’s Friday night interactions were always brief. “I will show up just to make sure that they’ve seen me, but I spend no more than 30 minutes, and I always use kids as an excuse. I need to go home to the kids. Things like that,” he noted. For the women at Indesco to use an excuse such as needing “to go home to the kids” may have reified the boundaries (e.g. maternity) they were attempting to dismantle. Like Hugh Ferguson’s decisions to “pop in” on his colleague to say hello, Achebe goes out drinking because he wants his colleagues to “see that I’m there and not think – not to fortify those beliefs that they’re building that I feel like I’m better than them.”

There were times, however, when a participant attempted to lower the barriers between him and colleagues, but was rebuffed. A Grouper, Okonkwo Sutton and first year teacher at Explorations Charter School, described his White female colleagues as being the most uncomfortable around him. He believed these teachers would exhibit their discomfort by “mov[ing] around a little bit too much or back[ing] off a little bit, or maybe if I sit out at a table where people are already convening, they tend to start talking less.” Sutton provided one such example of when teachers started “talking less” during an interaction in the cafeteria. Okonkwo typically ate at 11:00 a.m. with Lawrence Graham, another study participant, and the school’s dean of students, a White male.

But the other day I had lunch around 12:30, which is a pretty popular time for people to have their lunch, and so I joined a table of 2 white women, and I can just tell one of them or actually I could tell both of them were a little uncomfortable, maybe I had halted a conversation they were trying to have and so they couldn’t have it because I was there. I stuck around until

people started throwing stuff in the thrash and then I said, see you guys later.

In the end, Sutton submitted that such an occurrence has “happened to me so often, I don’t know if it’s my presence but I’m used to it.”

As an outsider, I cannot verify whether Sutton’s experience of individuals “talking less” because of his “presence” is based on perception or reality. However, after observing one faculty meeting, I noted that the faculty sat in racially homogenous groups, which might suggest that teachers at Explorations erected boundaries along racial lines. During the faculty meeting, teachers mostly sat next to same race colleagues, or colleagues who shared the same phenotype. Seated in a semi-circle, the teachers sat as follows - four White women, one Black woman, four White women, one White man, one Asian man, three Black women, Okonkwo Sutton, one White man, two Black women, Lawrence Graham, and one White man. Moreover, during the discussion facilitated by the school’s Black male principal on an article related to education, a routine at each staff meeting – only White teachers contributed. During the discussion of a *New York Times* article that explored the role of charter schools in improving the learning outcomes for economically disenfranchised Latino and Black students, a White female teacher highlighted a tension she believed some of Exploration’s students faced – “can I go to college and still be Black?”

Sutton described below why he erected a wall of silence, or chose not to talk during faculty meetings. He extrapolated this to other faculty members of color who chose not to enter into a conversation about the experiences of poor Black and Latino students with their White colleagues.

I don't know. I just think a lot of it is like we already know the stuff, you know what I mean. Some of us have already lived it and it is nothing new, but for – I think more so for our white counterparts it's like, oh, you know, I'm still trying to understand this. I'm still trying to wrestle with what's going on, what's happening. So I have seen in all these things, you know, tracking, reading levels being subpar, I have seen that, almost my whole life with friends who were in private schools, who were going to what we consider lower grade high schools. I saw that.

At the whole school faculty meeting, the space set aside to discuss issues pertaining to Exploration's students, Sutton voluntarily remained silent. Not only did he choose not to talk, so too did all of the school's Black staff. For Sutton, these conversations are nothing "new." And, when his White colleague asked, what may be a rhetorical question to Black college educated members on staff – "can I go to college and still be Black?" – he may be correct that they are still "wrestling with what's going on." It stands to reason, according to Sutton, that some of his White colleagues erected social boundaries between themselves and him through mannerisms, which suggested their discomfort, but also through what and how these individuals talked about Black students.

Finally, two Loners, Dennis Sangister and Kurt Sharpton, described instances when sentiments shared by a colleague only heightened their sense of other. In a faculty meeting, Sangister, a middle school teacher at the Marcus Garvey K – 8, and his colleagues were discussing some of the behavioral challenges they faced with students. One colleague, a White woman, lamented: "I just don't understand. I feel like the kids are just crazy and I can't control them. I don't understand why every time Jose comes to my room, he is always like you effin' niggers is acting crazy in here!" After his colleague used the epithet, "nigger," Sangister chose not to respond – waiting to see if anyone on the faculty would rebuke the teacher. "Nothing, nothing, not even like damn,

you should chill. Don't say that like nothing," he noted with anger. Because no one addressed the incident at the time, Sangister sent his colleague a text expressing that he was most bothered by her "bleeping of fuck but then you said nigger." He described her response as "classic." She replied by email that it was against her religion to swear. Perplexed, Sangister thought, "'Wait, what?'" You can't swear but you can call niggers all day." This incident reminded Sangister that his colleagues viewed him as other. His colleague felt comfortable using a historically charged racist term with little regard to the offense it might cause. Further, she did not equate the use of this word to cursing. In her mind, violating her own moral code was unacceptable but violating the dignity of another person was permissible because it did not infringe on her rights in this space where she was in the majority. In the end, Sangister acknowledged that his main reason for joining the school's hiring committee was to increase the number of teachers of color because, "I felt like I was alone."

And, finally, like Sangister, Kurt Sharpton, a Loner at South High Pilot School, described learning of a colleague's use of an epithet to describe misbehaving students. One of the school's paraprofessionals, a Black man, mentioned to Sharpton that when walking down the stairwell, he heard a teacher say, "The kids were running around all crazy...like monkeys out of a cage." Sharpton went on to add that he had a "serious problem with a teacher who looks at Black kids and calls them monkeys because that's a racist term... I have a real problem knowing that some teacher in here is referring to these kids as monkeys." Sharpton's "problem" with what he believed to be his colleague's statement is one of many reasons why he decided to take legal action against the school.

In South High School, a school known for having a hostile environment for

teachers of color, Sharpton, a Loner, experienced overt acts of hostility from his colleagues. Sharpton states that South High School has “a reputation of being unfriendly towards Blacks” in the city. Among Sharpton’s complaints are being sprayed with a bottle of perfume by a colleague who attempted to mask his urinary incontinence - a result of his surgery to stop the spread of prostate cancer. While it was not widely known that he had cancer, he was out for an extended period of time for a health leave. After his bout with prostate cancer, Sharpton described being visibly depressed. A colleague, whom he refused to name, intentionally filled out a staff survey and pretended to be him. The school’s librarian called this to his attention; “Somebody filled one out saying it was the health teacher. I just didn’t think it was you,” he recalled her saying. When he looked at the survey, he saw that his colleagues wrote the name “Shirley Depressed.” The use of the name Shirley, a woman’s name, may have served as an attempt to emasculate Sharpton, or to exaggerate what his colleague may believe to have been unwarranted lethargy.

Role Encapsulation

Kanter (1977) described role encapsulation as workers in the numerical minority who were trapped in stereotypical roles based on societal perceptions. Consequently, one response for those in the numerical minority was to engage in minimal risk, which meant rarely confronting colleagues in the numerical majority. Kelly (2007), however, suggested that Black teachers in his study experienced both role encapsulation and role integration. By role integration, Kelly (2007) noted that the Black teachers in his study were able to move beyond the stereotypical roles expected by colleagues to assume positions occupied by members in the numerical majority.

Participants in this study suggested that their colleagues, mostly White females, encapsulated them in a couple of roles, namely being responsible for managing student behavior. On average, participants' colleagues were more likely to reach out to Black men in the study for help with redirecting students' misbehavior, as opposed to support with teaching content. As a result, Black male teachers often felt like they served as disciplinarians, or police officers, rather than teachers (Brockenbrough, 2009).

Embracing Role of Behavior Manager

On average, teachers across both school types (e.g. Loners and Groupers) described situations where their colleagues called on them to assist with redirecting a student. There were several study participants who embraced the role of being uniquely responsible for addressing the challenging behavior of some students. For these teachers, this role appeared to bolster their stature in the school. Having their colleagues turn to them for assistance seemed to be evidence of participants' value-added in the organization.

Benjamin Young, a Loner at the Alberto Shomburg Dual Language School, noted that while his colleagues do call on him to address disciplinary issues, it may be a consequence of having "influence in the school now." This influence, according to Young, was a result of students "known[ing] me a long time now so I have a presence in their life. They've seen me interact with bullies – the bullies of the school. They know that I don't back down." As such, Young's "you want to get tough with me I'll just stand right there and let you get tough with me," approach to dealing with behavior may well have precipitated his colleagues' decision to call on him to assist with redirecting challenging students.

Similar patterns hold with Okonkwo Sutton, a first year Grouper and teacher at Explorations Charter School. Sutton also did not mind being called on to address student misbehavior. Sutton described his colleagues “looking to me, being a Black male figure of authority to kind of step in. I tend to have a little more pull with the kids in that area.” Like Young, Sutton did not appear to be bothered by serving in a role that required him to be consistently responsible for managing student misbehavior. “I don't mind it. I understand it because I know how to speak the kids' language. And at the same time I've had a very similar childhood and background as many of them,” Sutton noted. Sutton described one instance when a teacher emailed him and asked, “‘Hey this student is giving me a hard time. Maybe you can talk to him.’ I've done so and been able to mediate whatever issue there was.” While his colleagues asked Sutton to speak mostly with young men, there are occasions when he redirects young women. Sutton, in his first year, embraced the responsibility of stepping in to support his colleagues when addressing student misbehavior.

And, like Sutton, Wole Achebe, a Loner at Grand Case Pilot School, seemed to accept having colleagues ask him to watch over students. For Achebe, such an occurrence appeared to be part of his everyday work. “Sometimes, a colleague would say, ‘Do you mind if I keep the student here in this classroom, in your class for a while?’ Or, ‘Can you...’ Yeah, sometimes they'll tell me to talk to students that I have a close relationship with.” But, Achebe has not always been able to manage students' behavior. In fact, Achebe was fired after his first year of teaching because he was unable to manage student behavior. Over the years, through “reflection,” he has learned that the “students that we service in Boston come from very difficult backgrounds and upbringings.” In response to

this, Achebe noted that he has “forge [d] relationships with [his] children (students) before [he] actually enacts any disciplinary action.” Achebe also realized that his expectations for how students behaved in school should not be based on his own schooling experiences in Nigeria or private schools in the United Kingdom. Achebe’s role around supporting teachers to manage misbehavior suggests that merely being Black and male does not allow one to manage behavior effectively. Instead, as Achebe submitted, he developed skills that increased his ability to manage students’ behavior.

Resisting Role of Behavior Manager

While a few teachers noted little reservation about serving in a role that required them to be responsible for student misbehavior, many more Black male participants suggested ambivalence and reservation about being cast in this stereotypical role. Unlike workers in Kanter (1977) and Kelley (2007), who accepted the role encapsulation, numerous Black male teachers resisted the idea that they were effective behavior managers as a consequence of being Black and men. Kanter (1977) referred to the women in her study as responding to role encapsulation by favoring “low-responses” and “minimizing change” (p.236). Gender differences between study participants here, men, compared to Kanter’s (1977), women, may begin to explain the differing responses. As Williams (1992) suggested through his glass escalator metaphor, men who are in the numerical minority in organizations derive particular benefits not afforded to women in a similar situations. The benefits for men come from their higher social status in society that they bring with them to the organization. Consequently, the Black male teachers in this study might have felt emboldened to resist the requests of their White female colleagues because of their male privilege that operated outside of the organization. In

resisting their colleagues' presumption that they were *naturally* able to handle the misbehaving students, participants highlighted the idea that there were particular skills and competencies that facilitated their ability to redirect students, particularly their decisions to get to know students.

One such teacher, Christopher Brooks, a third year math teacher at Thomas Jefferson High School, a turnaround school, described his classroom as the “time out room” during his preparation periods. For example, he stated that his colleagues, most of whom were “Caucasian females” would ask, “Can I leave Shawn in here? He can’t seem to sit still.” Or “Can you just talk to so-and-so because he’s not giving up his phone.” While Brooks was not formally assigned this role, he conceded – “It’s just the role I play on the floor right now.” Brooks appeared ambivalent about serving in this capacity. While he noted, “I can see most people would feel enthused that they’re helping out their colleagues and more so like they picked me because they respect me. I can see the sense of entitlement you get,” Brooks also described being encumbered with having to watch over students, particularly during his free period: “it’s also becoming a burden now because it’s more so like I have other things to do. I have to plan. I have to get my kids or plan for my kids to be on a specific track, plan my scope and sequence, and correct papers. Just the regular things daily things that teachers do.” Moreover, it appeared that Brooks’s colleagues were more likely to send him the male students with whom they were having challenges on a regular basis. Brooks added, “I know fifth period I’m gonna get him or sixth period I know I have to hurry up and finish eating lunch because I know there’s going to be a problem that arises.”

While having less time to plan lessons and eat his lunch, a potential constraint to doing his job well, Brooks also appeared to use these one-on-one interactions with the young men to understand why their teachers might have perceived them as misbehaving. When one colleague mentioned, “this is just how he [a student] acts,” Brooks responded, “What do you mean that’s just how he acts?” And, during that time out session, Brooks described the young man as “one of the most reflective students on his behavior.” The young man described misbehaving in the teacher’s class because “he can get away with it.” Brooks concluded, “If there’s no limitations or you’re not consistent on your limitations, he’ll play you for a fool and that’s what he’s doin’ right now and he’s getting away with it.” While Brooks felt valued by his colleagues, many of whom were White and female, for being viewed as capable of redirecting male students, this role also became burdensome because it interfered with his teaching responsibilities such as planning lessons for his students and eating lunch.

George Little, a fifth year teacher at Jefferson, confirmed Brooks’s sentiments about the role Black male teachers played in the organization. He suggested, “teachers of color have been tapped to have certain jobs or duties based on their being a male or also being a male and person of color.” The school’s principal assigned Little the administrative task of monitoring the front door. A position he seemed suspicious of being assigned. Little also described how administrators targeted Black male teachers for particular roles. “Mr. Kane, he and another African American men had outdoor duty, to just kind of monitor and police the front of the building at dismissal times just to usher students away from the building and make sure there is no issues outside the building,” Little noted. For Little, “it was clear and evident why they were chosen for those roles.”

They were Black. They were men. And, only because of these characteristics were they assigned to police the school's front door.

And, like Christopher Brooks, and George Little, Peter Baldwin, a first-year teacher and Loner at Apple Pilot Elementary School, expressed some reservations about his unofficial role of managing the behavior of challenging students, but pointed to his decision to get to know students. Baldwin described that among the three teachers in his special needs classroom, it's a "one man show" when it comes to managing student behavior. In particular, Baldwin suggested having to be uniquely responsible for one Black boy – despite this student having a one-to-one teacher. In addition to the one-to-one teacher and a co-teacher, both White women, Baldwin noted, "When things escalate, I am the one that addresses it. I am the one." One example provided was at the end of one class session when the male student started "kicking things and so I was supposed to go lunch, but then I stayed behind to make sure that she [the one-on-one teacher] was able to figure it out. But then he got too –so I ended up corralling him." In physically restraining this student, Baldwin submitted, "I don't like restraining and I don't – it doesn't feel comfortable, so when I cannot, I try to not."

While Baldwin acknowledged that this student received fewer suspensions this year than the previous and that the male student is on track not to repeat the grade, he appeared annoyed by his colleagues' underlying assumption around why he should be responsible for managing behavior. Baldwin recounted his co-teacher saying, "you should be able to talk to him about XYZ man to man or you should be able to blah, blah, blah." Baldwin, over time, developed a "bond" with his Black male student, but not for the assumptions made by his colleagues. One of Baldwin's challenges around accepting

his colleague's belief about why he was equipped to fulfill the role of working with this male student may be because he identified as a "a young Black gay male." As such, he appeared to reject hetero-normative (Alexander, 2006; Boykin, 1996; Connell & Messerschmidt, 2005; Hasse, 2010) assumptions about the role of Black male teachers. Baldwin states, "[Based on] my personal life just because someone else is male does not mean that I am going to have some magical connection with them." Instead, Baldwin credited his ability to get to know this student. "I don't think he was just gonna respond to me better than others because I'm me, or because I'm a male or because I'm Black, I think because I sort of invested time...we've built a relationship." Here, Baldwin redefined the requisites needed to manage challenging students' outside of race and gender to focus on the importance of building relationships with students.

One Grouper at Crispus Attucks Elementary, Adebayo Adjayi, actively resisted being responsible for managing student misbehavior. Adjayi eventually refused to watch over misbehaving students. He recalled, "When I was downstairs teaching they [colleagues] used to bring 5th grade students to my classroom to keep them...because of their bad behavior." Adjayi, who continues to teach children with mild to severe autism in a pre-kindergarten classroom, went on to describe his discontent with his colleagues' decision to send disruptive students to his class, "At a point, I told them this is not working because these students should be taking MCAS [state assessment] and keeping them with three-year-olds is wasting their time." Furthermore, according to Adjayi, his paraprofessional would complain that given her primary responsibility to the pre-kindergartners entrusted to her, it became challenging to watch over the 5th graders who would "wander and make noise" in the class. Finally, Adjayi approached the school's

principal to share his discontent and the practice of sending misbehaving students to his class ended.

Summary

The majority of study participants described that one role assigned to them by colleagues in the organization was to be responsible for misbehaving students - who were often males. There were no observable differences in schools with Loners and Groupers. I posit here that the some of the Black men in this study, unlike the women in Kanter's (1977) study, were emboldened to resist role encapsulation because of their gender privilege that existed outside of the organization. While some teachers embraced this opportunity to redirect students, others expressed frustration because of the time taken away from planning, teaching their own students, or even eating lunch. In articulating the challenge of being encumbered with managing student behavior, the Black male teachers in this study were keen to point out the requisite skills and competencies needed to improve student behavior. In so doing, participants posited that it was not their social location that made them effective managers of student behavior, but their ability to build relationships with their male students.

Summary: Responses to Performance Pressures, Role Encapsulation, and Boundary Heightening

Performance Pressures

I found that study participants experienced performance pressures. However, the pressures for participants to perform were derived from intrinsic beliefs around how a Black male teacher should perform to increase the learning outcomes for students of color. Participants responded to these performance pressures by crafting jobs that were

designed to increase their engagement with the organization. The crafted roles took various forms and the degree to which participants were able to engage with the organization varied by the number of other Black men on the faculty. For example, at Clarke, a school with many more Black male teachers, teachers created a work group to address the challenges facing the school's Black students. Black teachers shared invitations with other Black teachers about the work group through word of mouth. In relying on oral invitations, rather than virtual invitations that would require using the school's email, participants appeared to signal the desire to work outside of the organization's formal structure. In the end, participants found these work sessions cathartic as it provided a place for them to "vent" and problem solve about how to improve the learning outcomes for the school's Black students.

Loners were less successful in the outcomes they desired from engaging in job crafting. For example, Josiah Washington at Roseville believed it important for his school, in particular his students, to increase the number of male teachers and male teachers of color. As such, he joined the hiring committee with the goal of diversifying the school's faculty. To this end, it appeared that he encouraged two former male colleagues, one White and one Black, to apply for five open positions. The hiring committee, all comprised of White women and Washington, chose not to hire either candidate. For the White male candidate, the committee cited his belief in perverse incentives (e.g. buying students lunch) for improving student learning and for the Black male candidate his lack of tolerance around sexual preferences. Instead, according to Washington, the committee hired five female teachers – four White and one Latina.

Based on the challenges Washington experienced around engaging in job crafting, he decided not to participate in future hiring decisions.

Boundary Heightening

Social boundaries had the greatest influence on participants' relationship with members in the organization and their sense of attachment or detachment to the organization. Black male teachers noted that social boundaries were created in a variety of ways. For example, participants described how their colleagues believed they were either under-qualified or over-qualified to teach. For Kendall Robeson, a Spanish teacher, his colleagues questioned his ability to speak Spanish. For Hugh Ferguson, who was trained at two of the country's most prestigious institutions, his colleagues believed he was overqualified. Such beliefs by their colleagues influenced a sense of being the other in the organization.

Participants in schools with many more Black male teachers, at times, used other Black male teachers in the building to make sense of their boundary heightening experience. For example, Hugh Ferguson shared his challenges around boundary heightening with Roger Manley. However, Loners often felt the most isolated in the face of boundary heightening. Dennis Sangister expressed great frustration with a colleague who used the word "nigger" during a faculty meeting. And, Kurt Sharpton asserted, "I have a serious problem with a teacher who looks at Black kids and calls them monkeys because that's a racist term."

Role Encapsulation

Black male teachers described how their colleagues, mostly White females, encapsulated them in roles such as being responsible for managing student behavior.

Participants believed that their colleagues were more likely to ask them to assist with issues related to discipline rather than content. Loners and Groupers shared this sentiment. While some participants embraced the role of disciplinarian and others resisted, I did not observe any distinct differences between Loners and Groupers. There were some teachers who embraced the role of school disciplinarian, namely Benjamin Young, Wole Achebe, and Okonkwo Sutton. For these teachers, serving in this role appeared empowering as it validated their presence in the organization. Sutton believed his colleagues called on him because he knew “how to speak the kids' language” and, presumably they did not.

However, many more Black male teachers resisted the requests by their colleagues to be responsible for policing misbehaving students, who tended to be boys of color. Drawing on Williams (1992) metaphor of the glass escalator, I posit that the Black male teachers in this study might have felt emboldened to resist the requests of their White female colleagues because of their male privilege that operated outside of the organization. Specifically, benefits for participants come from their higher gender social status in society that they bring with them to the organization. Some participants resisted, such as Adebayo Adjayi, by telling teachers to stop bringing misbehaving students to their classes. Others, such as Christopher Brooks, resisted by describing that their ability to engage students was not a consequence of being Black and male, but rather a result of the skills and competencies (e.g. getting to know students outside of the content) that they employed when redirecting students.

Chapter VIII

Reasons for Loners Staying and Groupers Leaving

Ingersoll and May (2011) found that male teachers of color in their study, most of whom were Black, had the highest rate of turnover when compared to their colleagues. They go on to suggest that while government and non-government organizations continue to spend millions of dollars to increase the number of teachers of color, such institutions should also pay attention to turnover. In the end, Ingersoll and May (2011) submit that understanding and improving organizational conditions has the potential to lower the rates of turnover for teachers of color – and by extension male teachers of color.

In this dissertation, specifically in this chapter, I attempt to understand the organizational conditions that influence teacher turnover among Black men. In Chapters Six and Seven, I observed that the number of Black male teachers on a school's faculty influences the ways in which those teachers experience the organization. I also found a relationship between the reasons Black male teachers suggested they would leave their schools and the schools' organizational characteristics (see Table 8.1). Moreover, there was also a relationship between the reasons participants cited for leaving, participants' actual decisions to stay or leave, and organizational characteristics. Loners stayed in their schools. Groupers moved and left their schools. Moreover, as it relates to retention in this chapter, I am describing how the organizational context, or school, influenced Loners' and Groupers' decisions to stay or leave their schools.

Loners, or those teachers who were the only Black men on their faculty, suggested a desire to leave based on challenges with a colleague (n=3), administrative leadership (n=3) or lack of curricular support (n=1). Four of the seven Loners actively looked for jobs. Three teachers from this group suggested they would leave the

organization because of challenges with colleagues, while the other three noted difficulties with administrative leadership. In the end, however, all Loners returned to their schools in the fall.

Compared to Loners, Groupers, or those teachers in schools with many more Black male teachers, suggested challenges with administrative leadership (n=6) and a desire for increased professional opportunities (n=5). Ten Groupers noted that they were actively looking for new positions in the fall. Groupers who were actively looking for positions in other schools tended to cite administrative leadership (n=5) and professional opportunities (n=4). However, unlike all of the Loners who returned to their schools in the fall, almost half, or nine out of 20, of the Groupers did not return to their schools in the fall.

Table 8.1: Participant’s Name, School Type, School Composition, Organizational Conditions Influencing Decisions to Stay/Leave, and Choice to Engage in Job Search and Return to School the Following Academic Year

Participant	School Name	School Type	School Composition	Why I Might Leave	Actively Looked for Jobs	Returned in Fall 2014
Wole Achebe	Grand Case Pilot	Pilot	Loner	Relationship with Colleagues	Yes	Yes
Dennis Sangister	Marcus Garvey K- 8	Regular District	Loner	Relationship with Colleagues	Yes	Yes
Josiah Washington	Roseville Elementary	Pilot	Loner	Administrative Leadership	Yes	Yes
Kurt Sharpton	South High	Pilot	Loner	Administrative Leadership	Yes	Yes
James Price	Race to the Top Elementary	Innovation	Loner	Administrative Leadership	No	Yes
Benjamin Young	Alberto Schomburg K -8	Dual Language	Loner	Relationship with Colleagues	No	Yes

Peter Baldwin	Apple Elementary	Pilot	Loner	Lack of curricular support	No	Yes
Eddie Rock	Cross Roads Elementary K – 8	Regular District	Grouper	Lack of Student Progress	No	Yes
Amilcar Depina	Cross Roads Elementary K – 8	Regular District	Grouper	Lack of Student Progress	No	Yes
Jacob Collins	Cross Roads Elementary K – 8	Regular District	Grouper	Professional Opportunities	Yes	No
Joseph Nkrumah	Crispus Attucks Elementary	Converting to Turnaround	Grouper	Administrative Leadership	Yes	No
Adebayo Adjayi	Crispus Attucks Elementary	Converting to Turnaround	Grouper	Administrative Leadership	Yes	No
Henry Groover	Crispus Attucks Elementary	Converting to Turnaround	Grouper	Administrative Leadership	Yes	Yes
Slaughter Gibson	Clarke High	Regular District	Grouper	Administrative Leadership	Yes	No
Leroy Jackson	Clarke High	Regular District	Grouper	A Change in Administrative Leadership	No	Yes
Kendall Robeson	Clarke High	Regular District	Grouper	A Change in Administrative Leadership	No	Yes
Samuel Soyinka	Clarke High	Regular District	Grouper	Lack of Student Progress	No	Yes
Roger Manley	Ralph Emerson High	Exam	Grouper	Administrative Leadership	No	Yes
Hugh Ferguson	Ralph Emerson High	Exam	Grouper	Exceeded	Yes	No
Matthew Morial	Washington Irving High School	Turnaround	Grouper	A Change in Administrative Leadership	No	Yes
Kanye Carter	Washington Irving High School	Turnaround	Grouper	Professional Opportunities	Yes	No

Pierce Bond	Explorations High	Charter	Grouper	Professional Opportunities	Yes	No
Okonkwo Sutton	Explorations High	Charter	Grouper	A Change in Administrative Leadership	No	Yes
Lawrence Graham	Explorations High	Charter	Grouper	Professional Opportunities	No	Yes
George Little	Thomas Jefferson High	Turnaround	Grouper	Lack of Shared Values	No	Yes
Christopher Brook	Thomas Jefferson High	Turnaround	Grouper	Professional Opportunities	Yes	No
Dante Smith	Thomas Jefferson High	Turnaround	Grouper	Administrative Leadership	Yes	No

Previous research suggests a relationship between teacher of color turnover and student characteristics (e.g. SES), as well as working conditions (Achinstein, Ogawa, Sexton, & Freitas, 2010; Ingersoll & May, 2011). According to participants, I, too, find that such an association exists in this study –Black men working in schools with challenging working conditions were more likely to leave. In this study, the men most likely to be in lower performing schools were Groupers. Below, I share the reasons that these teachers, Groupers, cited for leaving their schools and/or the profession and contrast this with the fact that Loners, even after expressing discontent, stay in their schools.

Why Loners Stay

During the data collection period, 14 out of the 27 participants in this study noted that they were actively looking for a different position the following academic year: four Loners (out of a total of 7) and 10 Groupers (out of a total of 20.) The following school year, however, the four Loners stayed in their schools; nine of the 10 Groupers left their

schools. All Loners returned to their schools in the same position held the previous year. In Chapters Seven and Eight, I discussed how Loners experienced greater organizational challenges when compared to Groupers. Given the difficulties, one might expect that they would leave, when given the chance. So, why, then, did the Loners remain when the majority of Groupers left? Loners highlighted two factors that influenced their decisions to remain – the positive school environment and students (see Table 8.2).

Status Quo Bias

For Loners, staying in an organization that they described as challenging might appear counterintuitive. However, I posit that participants resort to, what behavioral economists term, status quo bias (Samuelson & Zeckhauser, 1998). Samuelson and Zeckhauser (1998) found that when individuals were given the choice of keeping an entity they possessed, status quo, or trading it in for another option, persons demonstrated a bias for the status quo. There is trepidation in choosing an alternative that is unknown in the face of remaining with what is known, the status quo. According to the researchers, when persons are presented with many choices, they are even more likely to choose the status quo: “The more options that were included in the choice set, the stronger was the relative bias for the status quo” (p.8). Having increased options appeared to paralyze individuals from making a decision and increased the likelihood for remaining, or choosing, the status quo.

The majority of participants said that they received multiple job offers. In a school district that continues to be under federal court order to diversify its faculty, one potential reason for participants’ multiple job offers may be the demand for Black male teachers. Contributing to this demand is the limited supply of college educated Black men (Harper

& Harris, 2012), when compared to their peers, and local and national campaigns to increase the number of Black male teachers. Loners were presented with multiple job offers. The increased offers begin to explain why Loners demonstrated a preference for the status quo.

In addition to having more options in the “choice set,” the organizational conditions in the school may have also influenced Loners’ decisions to stay in their school despite not being content. As highlighted in Chapter Four, Loners taught in more favorable working conditions (e.g. screened students, smaller school and class enrollment) than Groupers (e.g. either recently or were in the process of having at least half of the staff and administrators replaced due to poor performance). Loners citing the positive school environment as their primary reason for remaining indicate that participants made their decisions based on a comparison between their current organization and other schools in the district. Thus, for Loners, their schools were familiar spaces with favorable working conditions when compared to other district schools. The unknown appeared to dissuade participants from entering new organizations. As a result, Loners stayed in their schools.

Moreover, it would appear that positive working conditions were able to reduce the effect of administrative leadership’s influence on a Loner’s decision to leave his school. Specifically, Josiah Washington and Kurt Sharpton (see Table 8.2) noted that they were actively looking for a position because of administrative leadership. But, both teachers decided to stay because of the school environment. Below, I focus my analysis on how a status quo bias factored into the decisions of Wole Achebe, Josiah Washington,

and Kurt Sharpton to return to their respective schools, as each described actively looking for a job.

Table 8.2: Loners’ Name, School Type, Factors Influencing Decisions to Leave and Reasons for Staying

Participant	School Name	School Type	Why I Might Leave	Actively Looked for Jobs	Decided to Stay because of Students	Decided to Stay because of the School Environment
Josiah Washington	Roseville Elementary	Pilot	Administrative Leadership	Yes		X
Kurt Sharpton	South High	Pilot	Administrative Leadership	Yes		X
James Price	Race to the Top Elementary	Innovation	Administrative Leadership	No	X	X
Benjamin Young	Alberto Schomburg K-8	Dual Language	Relationship with Colleagues	No	X	
Peter Baldwin	Apple Elementary	Pilot	Lack of curricular support	No	X	X
Wole Achebe	Grand Case Pilot	Pilot	Relationship with Colleagues	Yes	X	X
Dennis Sangister	Marcus Garvey K-8	Regular District	Relationship with Colleagues	Yes	X	

School Environment

Wole Achebe, a sixth year veteran at Grand Case Pilot, considered another position in which he would support pre-service teachers at an alternative certification organization in the district. Achebe received his teacher certification from the organization and remains an active participant in alumni affairs. The alternative certification program actively recruited Achebe and extended a conditional offer. He described his decision to stay at Grand Case based on being “familiar with the environment...it’s just a lot easier to continue with the familiar than proceeding with

the unknown.” Achebe’s bias to remain at his school appeared to be predicated on having a clear sense of the challenges in his organization, as well as the strategies to navigate the environment. As discussed in Chapter 7, Achebe attempts to decrease the social boundaries between him and his colleagues. To do this, he strategically goes out drinking for 30 minutes and then suggests he has to go home to take care of his kids. However, the uncertainty of moving to a new organization appeared to influence his decision to remain with the status quo or at Grand Case.

Similarly, Josiah Washington, a fourth year math teacher at Roseville received two separate job offers from a charter school in a neighboring school district. While presenting at a conference, the school’s executive director approached Washington. She asked him to consider applying for either a math position or a director of technology position. Washington declined the offer and remained at Roseville. “I really do like my team and so part of what I have been preaching and pushing is all about building culture and this will actually be one of the first years where we will have 80 to 90% of our school faculty in terms of middle school returning, so we have an opportunity to build a culture,” noted Washington. The relationships and familiarity with his colleagues seemed to influence Washington’s decision to stay.

Finally, Kurt Sharpton, a physical education teacher at South Pilot High, noted “I enjoy my job; it’s a good job.” When compared to other participants, Sharpton described some of the greatest challenges when interacting with his peers; for example, while suffering urinary incontinence from a bout with prostate cancer, a colleague sprayed perfume on him during a faculty meeting or a colleague filling out an anonymous survey and referring to him as “Shirley Depressed.”

Despite these experiences, Sharpton asserted, “I suspect I’m going to have some sort of challenges no matter where I go because I’m a Black male.” Sharpton, who mentioned he was “looking into other places [to teach], appeared to remain at South, the status quo, because he is aware that the experiences of Black males might not be that different in another school. Sharpton asked, rhetorically, “Do I change universes or what?” Sharpton recognizes that the dynamics at his school might not change regardless of the organization he is in. Beyond a status quo bias, Sharpton appeared resolved to stay at his school to fight the injustices he experienced. Leaving, Sharpton believed, would only empower his adversaries.

Why did our people [Blacks] stay in this country and stay doing what they’re doing? Because that’s what we do. We fight for that. You’re not just going to let people run you away, right? When you run, it’s just the same trap for the next person because nobody speaks out on it. So it’s a couple of ways to look at it; once you start running man, you run forever. Why do I have to run? Why do I have to run?

In the end, Loners in this study who suggested that they were actively looking for a job exhibit status quo bias. They remain in their positions because of their familiarity with the organizations they are in and hesitation to join a faculty about which they know little.

Why Groupers Leave

Approximately half, or 45%, of Groupers in this study did not return to their school or the previous position held during the data collection period (see Table D). Of the nine teachers who left their schools, two, Joseph Nkrumah and Adebayo Adjayi moved to other district schools. Kayne Carter, Hugh Ferguson, and Jacob Collins moved

to other positions, but remained in the district. And, Slaughter Gibson, Pierce Bond, Christopher Brooks and Dante Smith left the teaching profession.

Status quo bias might also inform why Groupers leave their schools at a disproportionate rate than Loners (Samuelson & Zeckhauser, 1998). Like Loners, Groupers are also presented with numerous job opportunities. However, the increased rate at which Groupers leave might be more influenced by the challenging working conditions they are in. Samuelson and Zeckhauser (1998) suggest that when an individual's preference is for a selected alternative, he is more likely to select that alternative. I suggest that the working conditions in Grouper schools in my study (e.g. either recently or were in the process of having at least half of the staff and administrators replaced due to poor student performance; under increased scrutiny by the district and the state to improve student learning) push participants to select an alternative because of the uncertainty of their current situation. The conditions that Groupers cited as pushing them to consider an alternative were administrative leadership or a desire for different professional opportunities.

Below, I draw attention to how administrative leadership and professional opportunities influenced Groupers' decisions to move schools and leave the profession (see Table 8.3).

Administrative Leadership

Among the nine teachers who did not return to their school the following academic year, four cited administrative leadership as influencing their decisions. Of the four, three taught in a turnaround school, while the other was at one of the district's largest high schools. Joseph Nkrumah and Adebayo Adjayi, both at Crispus Attucks

Elementary School, spoke with much disdain for the current school’s leadership. And, in particular, these teachers highlighted the increased scrutiny of their classroom practice that they experienced as a consequence of Attucks’s new turnaround status. It is important to note that Attucks was initially selected because it was one of the few district schools with a large concentration of Black male teachers that was not a turnaround school. Due to chronic student underperformance on MCAS, the state’s standardized exam, the district labeled Attucks a turnaround school during the data collection period. Specifically, for Attucks, this meant replacing the principal and requiring all teachers to reapply for their jobs.

Table 8.3: Grouper Movers and Leavers by School, School Type and Reported Reasons for Moving Schools and Leaving the Profession

Participant	School	School Type	Reason for Leaving	Moved to a Different District School	Education Related Position in BPS	Left the Teaching Profession
Joseph Nkrumah	Crispus Attucks Elementary	Converted to Turnaround	Administrative Leadership	Yes	Yes	No
Adebayo Adjayi	Crispus Attucks Elementary	Converted to Turnaround	Administrative Leadership	Yes	Yes	No
Kanye Carter	Washington Irving High School	Turnaround	Professional Opportunities	No	Yes	No
Christopher Brooks	Thomas Jefferson High	Turnaround	Professional Opportunities	No	No	Yes
Dante Smith	Thomas Jefferson High	Turnaround	Administrative Leadership	No	No	Yes
Slaughter Gibson	Clarke High	Regular District	Administrative Leadership	No	No	Yes

Jacob Collins	Cross Roads Elementary K – 8	Regular District	Professional Opportunities	No	Yes	No
Hugh Ferguson	Ralph Emerson High	Exam	Exceeded	No	Yes	No
Pierce Bond	Explorations High	Charter	Professional Opportunities	No	No	Yes

Attucks is the only school in which Nkrumah, a fourth year teacher, has taught. In describing why he decided not to reapply for his position, Nkrumah noted – “administrative things have changed this year...it could be in terms of the turnaround and the way the administration has handled it. That was making me say, there are other schools that I could go.” Instead of leaving the profession, Nkrumah is considering another school in the district: “This is my first Boston Public School, so I thought how about I go check another school and see if I could be within the same district...let me go check another one and see if the administration is the same.” Nkrumah’s greatest frustration appears to be with what he perceives to be an administrator’s purposeful withholding of information related to school and staffing decisions, “the administration hasn’t told us how next year is going to be like in terms of how the school day is going to be like, you know, who is coming,.” When pressed to consider what would keep him at the school, Nkrumah laughed “I am not staying stay here.”

Like Nkrumah, Adjayi chose not to reapply for his position. Adjayi taught in Nigeria, his place of birth, for thirteen years. In his nineteenth year at Attucks, it is the only school in which he has taught in the United States. Having observed principals come and go, with a great deal of indignation, he described the current state of the school this way: “So, there is a difference between when the school was not a turnaround school

and now...there is a lack of appreciation of work and [administrators] come in and look at you only to find faults.” Adjayi believed that when administrators conduct observations they should have two foci “What is happening that is good, what is happening that needs correction, so, you present them in the same report.” However, according to Adjayi, Attucks’s administrators “just write one side of the whole story, negatives, it’s demoralizing and that’s inappropriate, so that’s what’s going on here. If you talk to somebody who is sincere, he will tell you the same thing.” He goes on to add that “I don’t believe that you run a school blaming teachers and putting one side of the story on the paper because you’re dealing with humans who have accumulated or done something to keep their career. I never had a lower evaluation in my life.” Adjayi captured his discontent with what he considered administrators’ attempt to use the teacher evaluation system as a way to fire teachers rather than improve their practice through the proverb, “They say that you get a million bees by a drop of honey than by many drops of vinegar.” At 50, Adjayi plans to “teach as long as [he is] effective.” He did not return to Attucks in fall 2014.

Like Nkrumah and Adjayi, Dante Smith at Thomas Jefferson, a turnaround school, expressed similar sentiments, particularly as it related to the school’s hyper-surveillance of its students. Smith described one specific example of when a school administrator, a Black woman, interrupted students who were taking the state’s annual standardized exam, MCAS, to search for cellular phones. He recounted the grade level administrator asking him, “Mr. Smith, did you take all of the cell phones?” After responding in the affirmative and showing the administrator the three phones he had collected, she noted – “that’s unacceptable” and immediately summoned students to

“stand up, open your bags.” She then proceeded, according to Smith, “patting [students’ bag] up and down searching the bags.” Reflecting on this experience, Smith lamented, “that is a microcosm of what it’s like to go to school here. It’s, like you can’t do anything, like even if you are trying to do the right thing, you’re going to be harassed and treated like a criminal for no reason.” Smith shared his frustrations with the school’s principal: “this isn’t a prison. We can’t, we can’t run it like a prison. We can’t treat our kids like they are criminals they are not, they are not doing – especially they are not doing anything wrong... it creates tension nobody really wants to be here.” In the end, Smith submitted “I’m just like done with it; personally I’m over it [teaching here at Jefferson].” Currently, Smith is not teaching at Jefferson; he is pursuing his passion for studio arts.

Among all of the teachers who cited administrative leadership as their primary reason for leaving the school, Slaughter Gibson’s relationship appeared the most acrimonious. Gibson, a twenty-year veteran in his ninth year at Clarke High School, described the school’s Black male principal as a “bulldog” and suffering from the “head Negro in charge syndrome,” or when a Black-American, whose has been given a token leadership position, systematically undermines the work of his Black subordinates. Gibson, who served as the school’s chapter leader for the Boston Teachers Union, recounted one story of his attempt to create a structure whereby teachers would be able to raise their concerns, anonymously, about school administrators. Specifically, Gibson asked the school’s custodian to drill two holes in the teachers’ room for a comment box. Excited about the suggestion box, Gibson recalled, “I told everybody [colleagues], I want a suggestion in that box. I don't wanna hear anymore bitchin'. Put it in the box.”

The next day, however, when Gibson went down to retrieve comments from the box he was surprised to find the box missing. Upset, Gibson decided to go to the principal's office to alert him of the missing comment box. "I walk into the principal's office. My box is sitting on the table on his desk. Then he [the school's principal] sitting over there said 'Who told you to drill holes in my wall? I'm in charge of construction here and these are my walls and before you can do anything to my walls you gotta come through me.'" Such altercations appeared to characterize the relationships between these two Black men.

On another occasion, Gibson recalled publicly denouncing the principal's lockout policy - "if you came 20 minutes late to school you would not be admitted to school." According to Gibson, this policy affected the school's Black students: "The vast majority of those students that were sent home were African-American students coming from Hyde Park, Mattapan, Roxbury, and longer distances. I had a problem with that." Gibson suggested that he continued to "oppose" the principal and telling him "You cannot deny anybody education for any reason under the age of 16. It's illegal...you can't send these kids home." Finally, according to Gibson, the principal responded, "I'm in charge. Don't oppose me. I'll cut your balls off." The principal's supposed language around castration and, more specifically, emasculation appeared to undergird the hyper-masculine interactions, or even tension, between these two Black men. About Gibson, Leroy Jackson noted, "he is very opinionated...here [at Clarke] he's a threat because he does not bite his tongue with any of them [administrators]. And I kind of feel that, when he put that new system in [teacher evaluation], I think they used this against him..." During the first wave of interviews in December 2012, Gibson suggested that he was looking for

another position, as a result of his challenges with the principal. Before the second wave of interviews, early March 2013, the principal had placed Gibson on administrative leave. As such, I was unable to conduct a second round interview. He was terminated at the end of the school year.

Professional Opportunities

Four out of the nine Groupers who did not return to their schools noted that this decision was a consequence of professional opportunities, both inside and outside of a K – 12 setting. Two teachers, Pierce Bond and Christopher Brooks, exited the profession. Jacob Collins became a principal at another district school and Kayne Carter transitioned to a student support position at his current school – both remained in the district.

Another teacher with whom I was unable to conduct a second round interview was Pierce Bond at Explorations Charter School. Bond, 25, who recently served in the Peace Corps, and was a first-year math teacher, resigned in March 2013 to work in Central Africa. During the first wave of interviews, Bond described feeling that he was “at the bottom of the totem pole.” At Explorations, only teachers with a Masters operated in the role of lead teacher. Bond acknowledged that his “credentials [were] lacking” and he was “working [his] way up.” He also described how challenging it was to understand his students’ everyday experiences. Bond, whose father is African and mother White American, is an “African-American in the true sense of the word,” he noted. As discussed in Chapter 5, Bond comes from a socio-economically privileged background. He described his schooling experience as “A diverse and yet very affluent sort of old school money type environment where it's [academically] competitive.” In the end, Bond admitted, “I thought just given the fact I was African American – I grew up in the D.C.

area – I could do it. But the environment of schools in urban education is totally different from that of a college preparatory. I don't think I was prepared for that.” When Bond announced his departure, Lawrence Graham, a colleague at Explorations, did not seem surprised because “Pierce had always wanted to return to Africa and work.” It was not entirely clear what Bond was doing in Africa. The school’s principal intimated that Bond may be working for the intelligence community. I attempted, on several occasions, to contact him to conduct the second wave interview to no avail. In our last email correspondence Bond wrote “I do have Skype. Due to the nature of my work and location (Cameroon, Congo Basin, Central Africa) Internet connectivity isn't the most reliable however, I usually make my weekly trek into town in search of a connection on weekends.”

Christopher Brooks, 25, a third year teacher at Jefferson left to pursue a doctoral degree in education. He suggested that “personal progression” was his main reason for leaving. Brooks described wrestling with how to improve urban schools, “I was confused on whether I wanted to become an administrator or what my next steps of effectively changing this culture might be...” He noted that assuming a leadership position in the school might have prevented him from leaving. In fact, Jefferson’s Black male principal, during the 2012 – 2013 school year and before the principal announced his decision to leave, had preliminary conversations with Brooks about becoming the school’s math director, “I’d be teaching two math classes and then I’d be like the math class director.” However, with a new school principal this academic year, Brooks remained in his current position. Brooks believed he could “do other jobs” that involved “affecting students’ math curriculum.” Brooks went on to note that students were leaving Jefferson with “pure

skills” around solving math, but with little sense of how to apply those skills to different contexts. As such, his decision to enter a math education doctoral program will allow him to “change that [students’ mathematical thinking] from a different level,” such as a district administrator.

Finally, both Jacob Collins and Kayne Carter transitioned into different roles, but remained in the district. Collins assumed a principal position at an elementary school. In describing what it would take to keep him longer at Crossroads, he noted, simply, “If I were the school administrator here at this building.” Collins, who teaches an all-boys classroom, described his life calling as improving males of color learning outcomes. And, Collins’s decision to become a principal moves him closer to his professional goal, “being a leader of an all boys’ school,” because such a leadership position will “broaden my experiences as a school administrator to understand what the job will entail.”

Kayne Carter, an English teacher at Washington Irving, intended to rejoin the school’s student support team as a student engagement counselor. In 2010, after seven years of teaching English at two different Boston Public Schools and failing to acquire state certification because he did not pass the teacher examination exams, Carter applied for a student support position at Irving. In 2013, when an English position became available, the school’s principal encouraged him to fill it. However, at the end of the year, during the second wave of interviews, Carter lamented, “I am not in love with teaching. I am just in a wrong pocket. I am in a wrong space.” Even though transitioning into the student engagement counselor role required a pay cut, Carter acknowledged that such a position is “what I think I am really good at and what I am passing over.” Currently, Carter serves, full-time, as a student engagement counselor.

Summary: On Staying and Leaving

Data from this study suggest that Groupers left their schools as a result of administrative leadership and opportunities for professional growth. While other Groupers cited lack of shared values with colleagues or a change in administrative leadership, these sentiments were not enough to make them leave. Despite acknowledging that they would consider leaving if there were a change in administrators, Kendall Robeson and Leroy Jackson chose to remain in their schools even after the school principal retired.

In this study, Loners on the other hand, expressed a desire to leave but not did so. In fact, more than half, four out of the seven, indicated that they would like to leave. I posit that although Loners cited administration as one of the drivers of their discontent, this was outweighed by the positive working conditions. In contrast to Groupers who stated their intention to leave and actually did so because they faced challenges with the administration *and* less than ideal working conditions, Loners demonstrated a much higher level of status quo bias in not leaving their current positions. It is important to note, as I do in Chapter Four, that the organizational conditions differ in Grouper and Loner schools. According to participants, the working conditions in Grouper schools are less favorable when compared to Loners. Similar to previous research, teachers of color are more likely to work in challenging schools, as measured by students underperforming on state exams, and larger schools (Ingersoll & May, 2011; Research Alliance for New York City Schools, 2013). This pattern holds here and is extended to Black male teachers – particularly to Grouper schools. Simply put, in this study, Black male teacher turnover is greatest in those schools with many more Black men on the faculty. One influence,

then, for this high rate of turnover, which in this study was approximately 45% of Groupers, may be the challenging working conditions in which Black men work.

Chapter IX

Significance and Implications

In response to Secretary Duncan's ongoing efforts to recruit the next generation of teachers, specifically Black males, this dissertation posits that recruitment efforts might be better informed by understanding how Black males experience schools and why they stay or leave their schools. By shifting the conversation to an exploration of the in school experiences of this sub-population, my dissertation creates a new body of literature that explores how the organizational conditions, characteristics, and dynamics affect the recruitment, experiences, and retention of Black male teachers.

The existing research has focused on understanding why Black men enter the profession, how these teachers perceive and enact their work, and trends, from national and state data sets, around turnover. However, the literature does not address the relationship between the conditions in schools and the experiences of Black male teachers. Moreover, there have been no empirical studies, to this point, investigating how a school's organizational characteristic influences Black male teachers' pathways to a school, their experiences at the school and decisions to stay or leave that school.

Summary of Findings

To fill this empirical gap, I, first, designed a survey specifically to capture how Black male teachers experience their schools. Previous research made claims about the experiences of Black male teachers as a sub-group by disaggregating findings from a larger survey (Ingersoll & May, 2011; Lewis, 2006). To date, there has been no empirical work attempting to capture the experiences of Black male teachers. With this in mind, I designed and administered the 2012 Black Male Teacher Environment Survey (BMTES)

in Boston Public Schools. My findings were based on a based on a small non-representative sample. In this survey, I observed that the number of Black men in the building shaped their experiences. Based on these results, I designed a qualitative study.

In this study I attempted to answer four research questions.

1) What organizational conditions and dynamics affect Black male teachers' pathways into teaching?

The twenty-seven Black male teacher participants in this study described many influences on their decisions to become teachers. However, more than half suggested that an early experience teaching while in high school, college or after graduating from college influenced their choice to enter the profession. Participants noted being surprised by how effective they were, as measured by student engagement and learning, in these early teaching experiences. At least partly as a result of these successes, they entered the teaching profession. Thirteen participants discussed how the imprints in their careers and their own schooling experiences prior to entering the classroom appeared to influence their decisions to become teachers. Some of the careers that Black male teachers in this study had before entering the profession were with students in similar age groups to their current students. This encouraged them to seek out work that would allow them to continue working with this age group. And, approximately six participants discussed the positive effect of having Black male teachers, during their schooling, which influenced them to enter the profession. These participants appeared to assess their effectiveness in relation to their former Black male teachers. For the Black male teachers in this study, their former teachers served as a mental model around what and how one should teach.

2) Are there differences for teachers working in schools employing just one Black male teacher versus schools with larger numbers of Black male teachers?

Kanter (1977) presents a framework for examining the representation of social categories across four distinct group types – uniform, skewed, tilted, and balanced. Missing from such a framework is an exploration of how workers’ experiences vary who belong to a skewed group. After analyzing the responses of teachers working in schools employing just one Black male teacher, Loners, and those responses from schools with three or more Black male teachers, I found that individuals who are in a skewed group have different experiences. Moreover, I find that the presence of one or two same race and gender colleagues appear to off-set some of the organizational challenges of being in the numerical minority when compared to those who are in the absolute numerical minority (i.e. the Lone Black male teacher).

Moreover, in this chapter, I expand on Kanter’s (1977) theory of numbers and group composition to explore the experiences of workers in the absolute numerical minority (e.g. the lone Black male teacher). To do this, I introduce an analytical framework – *social isolation in organizations*. A theory of social isolation in organizations characterizes the experiences of workers in the absolute numerical minority - the lone Black male teacher in the organization, for example. Drawing on social distance (Simmel, 1950), the biological consequences of isolation (Cacioppo & Hawkey, 2009), and work alienation (Erickson, 1986), I posit that workers in the absolute numerical minority navigate organizations with a hyper-awareness around how other members of the organization perceive their work. In organizations where there are two or three members in the numerical minority, these workers have the advantage of building relationships with each other and normalizing problematic peer-to-peer interactions.

However those in the absolute numerical minority are at a disadvantage because they are the only such member of their social group in the organization.

3) What are Black male teachers' experiences with organizational dynamics of performance pressures, boundary heightening, and role encapsulation?

Kanter's (1977) theory of numbers and group composition provided a helpful framework for exploring Black male teachers' organizational experiences. Similar to the "tokens" in Kanter's (1977) study, participants in this dissertation experienced performance pressures, role encapsulation, and social boundaries. These three dynamics had a negative experience on participants as they navigated the organization. But, as Kelly (2007) found with the Black teachers in his study, there were some benefits to being a racial token. These benefits included performance enhancers or the attempts by Black teachers to improve the schooling experiences of Black students in predominately White schools; role integration where Black teachers were able to move beyond the stereotypical roles expected by colleagues to assume positions occupied by members in the numerical majority; and, border crossing, or choosing to interact and integrate with White colleagues in order to improve their working environment. Similar to the participants in Kelly's (2007) study, Black male teachers here attempted to counter these challenging working conditions by employing strategies to ameliorate their experiences, as well as their students'.

There were some places where my findings diverged with those of Kanter (1977) and Kelly (2007). Study participants experienced performance pressures. The workers in the numerical minority in Kanter (1977) experienced performance pressures from inside of the organization or through interacting with colleagues in the numerical majority.

However, the pressures for participants to perform in this study came from intrinsic beliefs about how a Black male teacher should improve the learning outcomes for students of color. In response to these performance pressures, participants engaged in job crafting, or redesigning tasks to increase their engagement with the organization (Wrzesniewski & Dutton, 2001). Missing from Kelly's (2007) discussion is the degree to which his participants were successful in performance enhancers. Black male teachers crafted jobs to engage with the organization. And, the degree to which participants were able to achieve the desired outcomes of the crafted job was dependent on the number of Black men on the faculty. For example, in one Grouper school, participants became frustrated by the school's attempts to improve Black students' learning outcomes. Participants designed a teacher workgroup, along with other Black faculty members, to devise strategies to address students' social and academic challenges. The presence of other same race and same gender teachers increased the likelihood that participants persons in the organization who shared their beliefs. Participants described these meetings as cathartic. In contrast, Loners were less successful in achieving their outcomes because their attempts to enact the crafted job were rebuffed by their White colleagues. One Loner joined the hiring committee for the explicit purpose of increasing the number of male teachers and male teachers of color in the organization. He became frustrated at his colleagues' rationale not to extend job offers to two male candidates, one White and one Black, whom he believed were highly qualified. In the end, this Loner refused to serve on future hiring committees.

As it related to role encapsulation, I did find some convergence with Kanter (1977). Participants experienced and were troubled by role encapsulation. However, like

in Kelly (2007), participants attempted to enact other roles than the ones prescribed by their colleagues. In this study, Black male teachers resisted the requests by their colleagues to be responsible for policing misbehaving students, who tended to be boys of color. Black male teachers in this study appeared emboldened to resist the requests of their White female colleagues. This stance may have been a result of the male privilege that participants drew on from outside of the organization (Williams, 1992). In resisting, some participants told teachers to stop bringing misbehaving students to their classes. Others, however, resisted by noting that their ability to engage students was not a consequence of their social location, Black and male, but rather a result of the skills and competencies (e.g. developing personal relationships with students) that they employed when redirecting students. However, a minority of study participants embraced the role of disciplinarian, as they believed that it indicated the value that participants added to the organization.

And, finally, social boundaries had the greatest influence on participants' relationship with members in the school and their sense of attachment or detachment to the organization. Similar to Kanter (1977), Black male teachers described that social boundaries were created in a variety of ways. Participants noted how their colleagues believed they were under-qualified or over-qualified to teach. They believed that these assessments were primarily based on their race and gender. Such perceptions by their colleagues thus influenced a sense of being the other in the organization. However, having other Black men in the school seemed to ameliorate the effects of these perceptions. Participants in schools with many more Black male teachers, at times, used other Black male teachers in the building to make sense of their boundary heightening

experience. This sense making occurred as Groupers in the same school recounted their boundary heightening experience to gauge if their perceptions actually reflect the experience. In one example, a Grouper felt secure in his assertion that his White colleague's criticism of his teaching methods were related to his students' improve learning after another Grouper shared with a similar experience. And, like Kelly (2007), participants, both Loners and Groupers, in this study also attempted to lower these boundaries by interacting socially with White colleagues. What is missing from Kelly's (2007) analysis is the methodical ways in which workers attempted to bring down those barriers. Their attempts at socializing were purely strategic – to make their colleagues see them in a more amicable light so as to improve the working environment.

Moreover, missing from both Kanter (1977) and Kelly (2007) is the degree to which workers in the numerical minority experienced social boundaries. When compared to Groupers, I observed that Loners described feeling the most isolated in the face of heightened boundaries.

4) How do these organizational contexts and experiences affect teachers' plans to stay in their schools or in teaching?

Outside of Ingersoll and May (2011) and Achinstein, Ogawa, Sexton, and Freitas, (2010), the empirical literature is relatively silent on Black male teacher retention. These studies only highlight the phenomenon: Black male teachers have higher rates of turnover than their peers. However, these studies have been unable to provide insight into why Black male teachers have higher rates of turnover. Consequently, this study adds to the burgeoning research on why Black male teachers stay, move, and leave the profession.

I observed a relationship between the reasons Black male teachers noted they would leave their schools and the schools' organizational characteristics. Loners were more likely to cite administrative leadership and challenges with colleagues; Groupers were more likely to suggest administrative leadership and professional opportunities. Moreover, there was also a relationship between the reasons participants cited for leaving, participants' actual decisions to stay or leave, and organizational characteristics. Loners stayed. Groupers moved to other schools and some left teaching altogether.

Loners, or those teachers who were the only Black men on their faculty, were more likely to describe a desire to leave based on challenges with a colleague or administrative leadership. For the Loners who suggested they were actively looking for a job, the positive school environment appeared to mediate the challenges they experienced in the organization and influenced their decisions to remain at their school. Compared to Loners, Groupers, or those teachers in schools with many more Black male teachers, were likely to suggest challenges with administrative leadership and a desire for increased professional opportunities. However, unlike all of the Loners who returned to their schools in the fall, almost half, or nine out of 20, of the Groupers did not return to their schools in the fall. Two moved to other teaching positions in the district. One moved to a student support role in the school building, while another transitioned to a technology position in another school and another became a principal. Three left the profession: one was fired, another entered graduate school, while another decided to pursue an art career.

In the end, this dissertation, the largest qualitative study on Black male teachers to date, adds to the burgeoning literature on Black male teachers. This study also contributes to the literature of how workers in the numerical minority experience organizations.

Moreover, this dissertation introduces a theoretical framework, social isolation in organizations, to explore how workers in the absolute numerical minority experience the organization. Finally, this study affirms, anew, the importance of understanding teachers' experiences within organizations and how teachers make decisions to stay and leave the profession, as a way to expand the teacher pipeline.

Limitations

There were many limitations to this study. One limitation is that by solely interviewing Black male teachers, I am basing findings on their perceptions of the environment. Black male teachers describe an organizational environment where White female teachers do not provide them with instructional support or require them to police Black boys. I do not have interview data from White female teachers to support, qualify, or refute Black male teachers' claims. However, my research attempts to understand the perceptions Black male teachers have on the organization and the decisions they make based on those perceptions.

While there are variations to the types of schools in the district included in the overall study (e.g. exam, turnaround, pilot, traditional, dual language), the distribution of these school types in this study are not representative of the distribution found in district. There are three turnaround schools employing one Black male teacher in the district, but there are no Loner turnaround schools in my study. Similarly, there are seven schools in the district with three or more Black male teachers on the faculty. There are no Grouper pilot schools in my study. This difference may influence my finding of no turnover in Loner schools and high turnover in Grouper schools. Moreover, I am unable to make claims about the *full* experiences of Loners and Groupers in BPS. Instead, my analysis is

based on the twenty-seven Black male teachers, across fourteen schools that I interviewed.

Another limitation was that, for most participants, I have one data point – semi-structured interviews. While it was in this study's original design to conduct observations, many school administrators and even participants, expressed some reservations. I was not surprised, however, by administrators' reservations. In BPS there is a heightened sense of fear attached to any observations, particularly in Grouper schools. One potential influence may be a result of both state and district officials' constant evaluation to determine if schools should enter or leave turnaround status.

Observing participants provided an important data point, as it did when I attended a faculty meeting at Explorations Charter School and found that Black teachers and specifically the two study participants did not participate. One participant described his reason for not participating was based on understanding and living the travails of being Black and attending poor schools. Thus, he did not feel the need to explore these experiences during a faculty meeting. His failure to participate could also signal, potentially, a lack of confidence in sharing his ideas among the school's predominantly White faculty. This lack of confidence, then, would reveal a different facet of his character, in comparison to the assertive person I encountered during our two interviews. That said, having two data points from which to draw across twenty-seven participants allowed me to identify patterns and then make claims about how Black male teachers in my study experienced organizations.

Moreover another limitation as it relates to my analysis is that the framework I used focused solely on numbers (e.g. the number of Black male teachers on a school's

faculty). Kanter's (1977) framework did not allow for an exploration of other attributes within the school that might influence participants' experiences. One such example is age. In this study, younger participants were disproportionately concentrated in pilot or turnaround schools; whereas older participants were more likely to teach in traditional district schools. It may be the case that, in addition to the numbers of Black men on the faculty, participants' age, school size, and school type (e.g. pilot, turnaround, traditional district) could influence the ways in which they navigate the organization, as well as their decisions to stay or leave.

And, finally, another limitation is related to my positionality. As a former Black male teacher interviewing Black male teachers, participants may have been more inclined to share a narrative around racial oppression believing that I might be better able to relate to them. There were numerous instances when participants used phrases such as "you know" or "you know what it's like" when answering a question. I typically responded by asking participants to elaborate on their answers. Additionally, as a doctoral student at an Ivy League school, there was a sense that some participants highlighted aspects of their pedigrees when discussing their personal and professional experiences. For example, one participant made it clear that despite graduating from a state university, he attended its honors college.

Given these limitations, my findings are confined to participants in my study; claims made about the reports Black male teachers shared about their schools, specifically the influences that enabled and constrained their decisions to enter teaching or particular schools, positive and negative experiences in the organization and their desires to stay or remain in spaces cannot be generalized to all Black male teachers in the

district or, for that matter, in the United States. However, if patterns, such as social isolation, exist in other settings, findings here could have impact for research, policy, and practice.

Implications

Previous qualitative studies on Black male teachers have focused on relatively small sample sizes [e.g. n=12 (Bridges, 2011); n= 7 (Brockenbrough, 2009); n= 1 (Lynn, 2006); n= 1 (Rezai & Martino, 2010)]; to address this, my sample includes more Black male teachers (n=27). In filling this empirical gap, like Kanter's (1977) *Men and Women of the Corporation*, findings from my dissertation, *Black Men of the Classroom*, can have implications for researchers, policy makers, and practitioners.

Researchers

One avenue of research could examine how, and to what degree, experiences change if there are two subgroup members in a particular organization. In this study, I examine the experiences of Black men, who are either alone or in groups of at least three. However, perhaps simply having one other male of color in the organization might lead to some of the phenomenon that I observed in the Grouper schools.

Another implication for research might be to compare the experiences of Black Loners and Groupers to other racial and ethnic minorities, such as Latinos and Asians. In this dissertation, I observe that Loners and Groupers experience the organization in distinct ways. Might this be true of other racial and ethnic groups? Could such a finding apply to Loner and Grouper women in an organization? Such questions should inform future research in the field of organizational theory.

Policy makers

For policy makers looking to increase the pipeline of Black male teachers, it might be important, to create opportunities for students in this sub-group to have early experiences with teaching. Many participants described the influence of an early teaching opportunity on their decisions to enter the profession. Policy makers, or district officials, could create opportunities for high school Black males to teach or tutor younger students. Similarly, state and national policy makers could provide funding for Black males in college to tutor students in elementary and secondary schools.

For policy makers, findings might reframe the current approach to recruit Black men to the profession and focus on how school districts could retain these teachers. In this study, I observed that Black male teacher turnover is greatest in schools with challenging working conditions. These schools also have many more Black men on the faculty. One lever for policy makers may be to encourage schools, particularly Loner schools, to conduct cluster hiring, or to actively recruit persons who share a particular interest and who may also belong to a similar social group. Most notably employed in the higher education setting, administrators use cluster hiring as an attempt to create diversity. In the K – 12 public-school setting, schools might, then, be encouraged to advertise core academic positions that include a specialty that would be attractive to a Black male teacher.

Also, policy makers may consider mandating racial/gender awareness training for new administrators and on-going training for current administrators. Akin to cultural diversity training for teachers, such sessions could take place during principal orientation. Part of the training could give attention to findings in this study, particularly the encapsulated roles and social boundaries that create challenges for Black men as they

navigate the workplace. An outcome for these trainings might be for administrators to create conditions whereby Black male teachers are not serving in stereotypical roles. A second goal for an orientation could be the creation of strategies to decrease the social boundaries between Black male teachers and their colleagues.

Practitioners

Lastly, for practitioners, within this district, the data might offer ways to better support Black male teachers. While the degree and the types of challenges varied by the number of Black men on the faculty, on average, most respondents agreed that being both Black and male constrained their relationships with other members of the organization, namely colleagues and administrators. As such, district officials should consider designing “differentiated professional development” opportunities for this sub-group, as well as male teachers of color. A mission for such a group, directed by the district, could be to provide socio-emotional support to male teachers of color and a space to reflect on practice - in service of student learning.

I began this dissertation with my experience as a teacher in a New York City public school where I described the challenges of participating in a Black male teacher recruitment campaign. The intent was to increase the number of Black men to boost learning for Black boys; however, what we found was that after increasing the number of Black male teachers, Black boys still under-performed relative to the girls. What was missing from our discussion then, but might be important now is focusing on teachers’ practice.

To that end, such a differentiated professional development opportunity would design meetings in two ways to support Black male teachers. One objective may focus

on creating conditions that would attend to the socio-emotional challenges faced by being a male teacher of color, or specifically a Black male teacher. These challenges could include being the only male teacher of color on the faculty, attempting to find ways to respond to the stereotypical roles colleagues asked participants to play (e.g. policing Black and Latino boys), or feeling ill-equipped to create conditions that would support learning for male students of color.

While it will be important for group members to talk about the socio-emotional challenges, what should remain as the focus is that each member is a teacher. And, in order to become better teachers, participants will need tools to improve their practice. As such, one purpose of another meeting could be to have group members present a dilemma in his practice on which he desired feedback. The presenter should meet with one of the group's organizer before the meeting to decide on a focus question. Next, the presenter might choose artifacts that would help the group to address his dilemma of practice.

In the end, the joys and challenges of navigating school organizations may be the same for Black male students as they are for Black male teachers. It is my hope, then, that the experiences of these 27 Black men may serve as canaries in the coalmine – inciting researchers, policy makers and practitioners to devise solutions to improve the debilitating condition facing Black boys across our nation's schools.

References

- Achinstein, B., Ogawa, R. T., Sexton, D., & Freitas, C. (2010). Retaining teachers of color: A pressing problem and a potential strategy for "hard-to-staff schools." *Review of Educational Research, 80*(1), 71–107.
- Alexander, M. (2010). *The new jim crow: Mass incarceration in the age of colorblindness*. New York: The New Press
- Alliance for Excellent Education. (2009). Reinventing the federal role in education: Supporting the goal of college and career readiness for all students. Washington D.C.: Author.
- Archbold, C. A. & Schulz, D. M. (2008). Making rank: The lingering effects of tokenism on female police officer' promotion aspirations. *Police Quarterly, 11*, 50 - 73.
- Bobbitt, S. A., Faupel, E., and Burns, S. (1991). *Stayers, movers, and leavers: Results of the 1988–89 teacher followup Survey*, 1991. Washington, D.C.: National Center for Education Statistics (NCES 91–128).
- Bogdan, R.C., & Biklen, S.K. (2007). *Qualitative research for education: An introduction to theories and methods* [5th ed.]. Boston: Pearson.
- Brockenbrough III, E. A. (2008). Black men teaching: The identities and pedagogies of black male teachers. (unpublished dissertation).
- Brockenbrough III, E. A. (2012). Emasculation blues: Black male teachers' perspectives on gender and power in the teaching profession. *Teachers College Record, 114*, (5), 1 - 43.
- Bridges, T. L. (2009). Peace, love, unity & having fun: Storying the life histories and pedagogical beliefs of african american male teachers from the hip hop generation. (unpublihsed doctoral dissertation). University of Maryland, College Park.
- Bridges, T. L. (2011). Towards a pedagogy of hip hop in urban teacher education. *Journal of Negro Education, 80*, 325-338.
- Bristol, T. J. (2012). Policing and teaching: The role of organizational factors in the retention and attrition of male teachers of color. Paper presented at the 2012 American Educational Research Association Annual Meeting, Vancouver, B.C.
- Brown v. Board of Education, 347 U.S. 483 (1954).
- Brown, A L. (2009). "Brothers gonna work it out:" Understanding the pedagogic performance of african american male teachers working with african american male students. *Urban Rev, 41*, 416-435.

Browne, J. Z. (2002) More black men sent to jail than in college. *New York Amsterdam News*, 93, 34.

Cacioppo, J. T. & Hawkley, L. C. (2009). Perceived social isolation and cognition. *Trends in Cognitive Sciences*, 13,10, 447-54.

Casanova, U. (1990). Rashomon in the classroom: Multiple perspectives of teachers, parents, and students. In *Children at risk: Poverty, minority status, and other issues in educational equity*, ed. Andres Barona and Eugene E. Garcia, 135-49. Washington, D.C.: National Association of School Psychologists.

Catalyst Chicago (September 2010). Catalyst in brief: Reaching black boys.

Chmelynski, C. (2006). Getting more blacks and men into teaching. *Educational Digest*, 71(5), 40-42.

Chiaburu, D. S, Thundiyil, T., Wang, J. (2014). Alienation and its correlates: A meta-analysis. *European Management Journal*, 32, 1, 24-36.

Cognard-Black, A. J. (2004). Will the stay, or will they go? Sex-atypical work among token men who teach. *The Sociological Quarterly*, 45,1, 113-139.

Cohen, D., & Ball, D. L. (1999). *Instruction, capacity, and improvement* (No. CPRE Research Report No. RR-043). Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania, Consortium for Policy Research in Education.

Creswell, J. W. (1998). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five traditions*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Creswell, J. W. (2009). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches*. 3rd Edition. Los Angeles: Sage Publications, Inc..

Crothers, C. (2009). Black Male: Why the mid-south cannot afford to ignore the disparities facing its black men and boys. Jackson, MS: *Foundation for the mid-south*.

Davis, J. E. (2006). Research at the margins: dropping out of high school and mobility among African American males. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education*, 19, 289-304.

Darling-Hammond, L. (2010). *The flat world and education: How america's commitment to equity will determine our future*. NY: Teachers College Press.

Dee, T. S. (2004). Teachers, race and student achievement in a randomized experiment. *The Review of Economics and Statistics*, 86 (1).

Dee, T. S (2005). "A teacher like me: Does race, ethnicity, or gender matter? *Economic*

Review, 95(2).

Denzin, N. K., & Lincoln, Y. S. (2005). *The sage handbook of qualitative research* (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, Ca: Sage publications.

Detweiler, J. (1967). The Negro teacher and the Fourteenth Amendment. *The Journal of Negro Education*, 36(4), 403-409.

Dey, E. L. (1997). Working with low survey response rates: The efficacy of weighting adjustments. *Research in Higher Education*, 38 (2), 215-227.

Diamond, J. B., Randolph, A., Spillane, J. (2004). Teachers' expectations and sense of responsibility for student learning: The Importance of race, class, and organizational habitus. *Anthropology & Education Quarterly* v. 35 no. 1 p. 75-98

Douglas, B., Lewis, C. W., Douglas, A., Scott, M. E., & Garrison-Wade, D. (2008). "The impact of white teachers on the academic achievement of black students: An exploratory qualitative analysis" *Journal of Educational Foundations*, Winter/Spring, 47-62.

Duncan, A. (2011). Leading a life of consequence. Speech presented at Fayetteville State University, Fayetteville, NC.

Dworkin, A. G., Dworkin, R. J., & Chafetz, J. S. (1986). The effects of tokenism on work alienation among urban public school teachers. *Work and Occupations*, 13, 399-420.

Eckholm, E. (2006, March 20). "The plight deepens for black men," *Studies Warn*. The New York Times, p. A1

Edelman, P., Holzer, H. J., Offner, P. (Eds.). (2006). *Reconnecting disadvantaged young Men*. Washington DC: Urban Institute Press.

Eisenhardt, K.M. (1989). Building theories from case study research. *Academy of Management Review*, 14, 532-551.

Eisner, A. (2004). *Gates of injustice: The crisis in America's prisons*. New Jersey: Prentice Hall.

Epps, E. (1999). Race and school desegregation: Contemporary legal and educational issues. Retrieved June 2, 2012 from <http://www.urbanedjournal.org/articles/article0003.pdf>.

Erikson, E. H. (1959). Identity and the life cycle. Part One. *Psychological issues*. New York: International Universities Press.

Erikson, K. (1986). On work and alienation. *American Sociological Review*, 51, 1, 1-8

Fairchild, S., Tobias, R., Corcoran, S., Djukic, M., Kovner, C. & Noguera, P. (2012).

- White and Black Teachers' Job Satisfaction: Does Relational Demography Matter? *Urban Education*, 47, 170-197.
- Fairhurst, G., & Snavely, B. K. (1983). A test of the social isolation of male tokens. *Academy of Management Journal*, 26, 353-361.
- Ferguson, A. A. (2000). *Bad boys: public schools in the making of black masculinity*. Ann Arbor, MI: The University of Michigan Press.
- Ferguson, R. F. (2007). *Toward excellence with equity: An emerging vision for closing the achievement gap*. Harvard Education Press.
- Ferri, B. A. & Connor, D. J. (2005). Tools of exclusion: Race, disability, and (re)segregated education. *Teachers College Record*, 107 (3), p. 453-474
- Floge, L. & Merrill, D. (1986). Tokenism reconsidered: Male nurses and female physicians in a hospital setting. *Social Forces*, 64, 925-947.
- Flores, G. M. (2011). Racialized tokens: Latina teachers negotiating, surviving and thriving in a white woman's profession. *Qualitative Sociology*, 34, 313-335.
- Flyvbjerg, B. (2006). Five misunderstandings about case-study research. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 12, 2.
- Fordham, S. & Ogbu, J. (1986). Black students' school success: Coping with the burden of acting white. *The Urban Review*, 18, 3, 176-206.
- Foucault, M. (1979). "Docile bodies" and "panopticism." In *discipline & punish: The birth of the prison*. New York: Vintage.
- Franklin, V.P., (2009). "They rose or fell together": African American educators and community leadership, 1795-1954. In L. C. Tillman (Ed.), *The Sage handbook of African American Education*. Thousand Oaks, C.A.: Sage Publications.
- Fultz, M. (1995). African-american teachers in the south, 1890-1940: Growth, feminization, and salary discrimination. *Teachers College Record*, 96(3):544-568.
- Fultz, M. (2004). The displacement of Black educators post-Brown: An overview and analysis. *History of Education Quarterly*, 44(1), 11-45.
- Gardner, H. (1983). *Frames of mind: the theory of multiple intelligences*. New York: Basic.
- George, P. (1985). Teacher testing and the historically black college. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 36, 6, 54-57.

- Giddens, A. (1984) *The Constitution of Society*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Gilliam, W. S. (2005). Pre-kindergarteners left behind: Expulsion rates in state prekindergarten systems. New Haven, CT: Yale University Child Study Center.
- Gold, R. (1958). Roles in sociological field observation. *Social Forces*, 36, 217-223.
- Gordon, M. M. (1964). *Assimilation in american life*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Graham, J. (2011). Secretary calls black men to the blackboard. Retrieved February 4th, 2011, from <http://www.ed.gov/blog/2011/02/secretary-calls-black-men-to-the-blackboard/>
- Grant, P. (1992). Using special education to destroy black boys. *The Negro Educational Review*, 63, 17-21.
- Green v. County School Board of New Kent County, 391 U.S. 430 (1968)
- Green, M.W. (1999). The appropriate and effective use of security technologies in u.s. schools: A guide for schools and law enforcement agencies. U.S. Department of Justice Office of Justice Programs: Washington D.C.
- Griffiths, M. (2006). The feminization of teaching and the practice of teaching: Threat or opportunity? *Educational Theory*, 56(4), 387- 405
- Hale, J. E. (2001). *Learning while black: Creating educational excellence for african american children* . Baltimore, MD: The Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Haley, H., & Sidanius, J. (2005). Person-organization Congruence and the Maintenance of Group-Based Social Hierarchy: A Social Dominance Perspective. *Group Processes and Intergroup Relations*, 8, 187-203.
- Haase, M. (2008). 'I don't do the mothering role that lots of female teachers do': male teachers, gender, power and social organisation. *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, 29 6, 597-608.
- Haase, M. (2010). Fearfully powerful: male teachers, social power and the primary school. *Pedagogy, Culture and Society*, 18, 2,173-190.
- Haney, J. (1978). The effects of the brown decision on black educators. *The Journal of Negro Education*, 47, 88-95.
- Harper, S. R., & Harris, III. F. (2012). A role for policymakers in improving the status of Black male students in U.S. higher education. Washington, DC: Institute for Higher Education Policy.

Hill, P. T. (2000). The federal role in education. In D. Ravitch (Ed.), *Brookings papers on education policy 2000* (pp. 11-40). Washington, DC: Brookings Institution Press

Husserl E. (2001). *Logical investigations I – II* (trans: Findlay JN). Routledge, London.

Holland, S. H. (1991). Positive role models for primary-grade black inner-city males. *Equity and Excellence*, 25(1), 40-44.

Holmes & Procaccino. (2009). Preschool children's outdoor play area preferences. *Early Child Development and Care*, 179(8), 1103-1112.

Holt-Lunstad, J., Smith T.B. & Layton, J.B. (2010). Social relationships and mortality risk: a meta-analytic review. *PLoS Med.* 7, 7

Hoover, M. R. (1984). Teacher competency tests as educational genocide for blacks: The florida teacher certification examination. *Negro Educational Review*, 35, 2, 70-77.

Howard University School of Education. (1999). Annual report. Washington, DC: Author.

Hyland, N. (2009). Opening and closing communicative space with teachers investigating race and racism in their own practice. *Action Research*, 7(3), 335-354.

Ingersoll, R. & May, H. (2011). Recruitment, retention, and the minority teacher shortage. Philadelphia, PA: Consortium for Policy Research in Education, University of Pennsylvania and Center for Educational Research in the Interest of Underserved Students, University of California, Santa Cruz.

Johnson, E.P. (2005). "Quare" studies, or (almost) everything I know about queer studies I learned from my grandmother. In E.P. Johnson & M.G. Henderson (Eds.), *Black queer studies: A critical anthology* (pp. 124-157). Durham: Duke University Press.

Johnson, S.M., Berg, J.H., & Donaldson, M.L. (2005). *Who stays in teaching and why: A review of the literature on teacher retention*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard Graduate School of Education. Retrieved October 1, 2013 from http://assets.aarp.org/www.aarp.org/articles/NRTA/Harvard_report.pdf

Justice Policy Institute (2009). DOJ report on prisoners in 2008: Prisons are still growing and racial disparities persist, despite availability of cost-effective alternatives. Washington, D.C.

Kanter, R. M. (1977). *Men and women of the corporation*. New York: Basic Books, Inc., Publishers.

Kauchak, D. (1984). Testing teachers in Louisiana: A closer look. *Phi Delta Kappan*, 65,9, 626-628.

Kearns, J. M. (1984). State competency testing for teacher certification. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 35,2, 58-61.

Keddie, A. & Mills, M. (2007). *Teaching boys: developing classroom strategies that work*. Crows Nest, Allen & Urwin.

Kelly, H. (2007). Racial tokenism in the school workplace: An exploratory study of black teachers in overwhelmingly white schools. *Educational Studies*,41, 230 — 254.

Keyes, v. School District #1, Denver CO, 413 U.S. 189 (1973).

King, S. H. (1993). The limited presence of African-American teachers. *Review of Educational Research*, 63, 2, 115-149.

Kirby S.N., Berends M., Naftel S.(1999). Supply and demand of minority teachers in Texas: Problems and prospects. *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis*, 21(1),47–66.

Kohl, R., Hoover, H., McDonald, S., Solomon, A. (2008). *Massachusetts recidivism study: A closer look at releases and returns to prison*. Washington, D.C.: Urban Institute Justice Policy Center.

Krimmel, J. T. & Gormley, P. E. (2003). Tokenism and job satisfaction for policewomen. *American Journal of Criminal Justice*, 1, 73-88.

Kunjufu, J. (2005). *Countering the conspiracy to destroy Black boys*. Chicago: African American Images.

Kunjufu, J. (2010). Black boys and special education – change is needed! *Teachers of color magazine*. Retrieved from <http://www.teachersofcolor.com/2009/04/black-boys-and-special-education-change-is-needed/>

Ladson-Billings, G.J. (1995). Toward a theory of culturally relevant pedagogy. *American Education Research Journal*, 35, 465-491.

Lareau, A. (2003). *Unequal childhoods: Class, race, and family life*. Berkeley: University of California Press

Lee, V. E., Loeb, S. & Marks, H. M. (1995). Gender differences in secondary school teachers' control over classroom and school policy. *American Journal of Education*, 103 (3), 259-301.

Lee, V. E. & Smith, J. B. (1993). Effects of school restructuring on the achievement and engagement of middle-grade students. *Sociology of Education*, 66, 164-187.

- Lett, J. (1990). Emics and etics: Notes on the epistemology of anthropology. In T.N. Headland, K.L. Pike, & M. Harris (Eds.). *Emics and etics: The insider/outsider debate*. Frontiers of anthropology, v. 7. Newbury Park, Calif: Sage Publications.
- Lewis, C. W. (2006). African American male teachers in public schools: An examination of three urban school districts. *Teachers College Record*, 108, 224-245.
- Lewis, C.W. & Toldson, I. A. (2013), Black male teachers: Diversifying the united states' teacher workforce, in Chance W. Lewis, Ivory A. Toldson (ed.) *Black male teachers advances in race and ethnicity in education, 1*. Emerald Group Publishing
- Lichtman, M. (2006). *Qualitative research in education: A user's guide*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.
- Little, P. S., & Miller, S. K. (2007). Hiring the best teachers: Rural values and person-organization fit theory. *Journal of School Leadership*, 17, 118-158.
- Lincoln, Y. S., & Guba, E. G. (1985). *Naturalistic inquiry*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage.
- Liu, E. & Moore Johnson, S (2006). New teachers' experiences of hiring: Late, rushed, and information-poor. *Educational Administration Quarterly*, 42, 3, 324-360.
- Little, P. S. & Miller, S, K. (2007). Hiring the best teachers? Rural values and person-organization fit theory. *Journal of School Leadership*, 17, 2, 118-158.
- Losen, D. J. & Orfield, G. (2002) *Racial inequity in special education*. Cambridge: Harvard Education Publishing Group.
- Luttrell, W. (2010). *Qualitative educational research: Readings in reflexive methodology and transformative practice*. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Lynn, M. (2006). Dancing between two worlds: A portrait of the life of a black male teacher in South Central L.A. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education*, 19(2), 221-242.
- Lyön, M., Johnson, C, & Hassan, K. (1999). Raising the critical consciousness of african american students in baldwin hills: A portrait of an exemplary African American male teacher. *Journal of Negro Education*, 68(1), 42-51.
- Mac an Ghaill, M. (1994). *The making of men: masculinities, sexualities and schooling*. Buckingham & Philadelphia: Open University Press.
- Martino, W., Kehler, M. D., & Weaver-Hightower, M. (eds.). 2009. *The problem with boys' education: beyond the backlash*. New York: Routledge.
- Marx, K. (1959). *Economic and philosophic manuscripts of 1844*. London: Lawrence &

Wishart

Maxwell, J. A. (1996). *Qualitative research design: An interactive approach*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Maxwell, J.A. (2005). *Qualitative research design*. Sage Publications, 2nd edition.

McNeil, L. M. (1988). *Contradictions of Control: School Structure and School Knowledge*. New York: Routledge.

Meece, J. L., Glienke, B. B., Burg, S. (2006). Gender and motivation. *Journal of School Psychology*. 44(5), 351-373.

Metropolitan Center for Urban Education. (2009). Examining the pre-high school roots of the black and latino male dropout crisis in new york city.

Miles, M. B. & Huberman, A. M. (1994). *Qualitative data analysis* (2nd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Milner, H.R. (2006). But good intentions are not enough: Theoretical and philosophical relevance in teaching students of color. In J. Landsman & C.W. Lewis (Eds.), *White teachers/diverse classrooms: A guide to building inclusive schools, promoting high expectations and eliminating racism* (pp.79-90). Sterling, VA: Stylus Publishers.

Mincy, R. B., Lewis, Jr., C. E., & Han, W-J. (2006). Young less-educated black men in the economic boom of the 1990s. In R. B. Mincy (Ed.), *Black Males Left Behind*. Washington, D.C.: The Urban Institute Press.

Miron, G., Urschel, J. L., Saxton, N. (2011). "What makes kipp?: A study of student characteristics, attrition, and school finance." *The national center for the study of privatization in education & the Study group on educational management*.

Moore Johnson, S., Harrison Berg, J., & Donaldson, M. L. (2005). *Who stays in teaching and why: A review of the literature on teacher retention*. Washington, DC:AARP.

Morgan v. Hennigan, 379 F. Supp. 410 (D.C. Mass., June 21, 1974).

Morley, M. J. (2007). Person-organization Fit. *Journal of Managerial Psychology*, 22(2), 109-117.

Murr, A. (2007). "The trouble with boys." Newsweek 15 Oct. 2007.

Nicholson, L. (1997). *The second wave: A reader in feminist theory*. Routledge: New York.

Noguera, P. (2003). The trouble with black boys: The role and influence of environmental and cultural factors on the academic performance of african-american males. *Urban Education*. 38(4). p. 431-459

Ontario Ministry of Education (2004) *Me read? no way!: A practical guide to improving boys' literacy skills*. Queens Printing: Ontario.

Osborne, J. W. (1999) Unraveling underachievement among african-american boys from an identification with academics perspective, *The Journal of Negro Education*, 68 (4), p.555-565

Pager, D. (2005). The mark of a criminal record. *The American Journal of Sociology*, 108, 5, 937-975.

Pallas, A. M. & Buckley, C. K. (2012). Thoughts of leaving: An exploration of why new york city middle school teachers consider leaving their classrooms. New York: Research Alliance for New York City Schools.

Parks, R. E. (1924) "The concept of social distance as applied to the study of racial attitudes and racial relations." *Journal of Applied Sociology*, 8, 339-344

Patton, M. Q. (1990). *Qualitative evaluation and research methods* (2nd ed.). Newbury Park, CA: Sage.

Peshkin, A. (1988). In search of subjectivity – one's own. *Educational Researcher*, 17,17-21.

Pew Center for Research on the States. (2008). One in 100. Washington, D.C.

Polite, V. C., (1994). The method in the madness: African american males, avoidance schooling, and chaos theory. *Journal of Negro Education*; 63(4).

Randolph, A. W. (2009). To gain and to lose: The loving school and the african american struggle for education in columbus, ohio, 1831-1882. In L. C. Tillman (Ed.), *The Sage handbook of African American Education*. Thousand Oaks, C.A.: Sage Publications.

Reschly, D. (2007). Briefing before the U.S. commission on civil rights, minorities in special education, Washington, DC, Dec. 3, 2007, transcript, p. 86

Rezai-Rashti, G. & Martino, W. (2010). Black male teachers as role models: Resisting the homogenizing impulse of gender and racial affiliation, *American Educational Research Journal*, 47(1), pp. 37-64.

Riehl, C., & Byrd, M. A. (1997). Gender differences among new recruits to school administration: Cautionary footnotes to an optimistic tale. *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis*, 19(1), 45–64.

Royster, D. (2003). *Race and the invisible hand: How white networks exclude black men from blue-collar jobs*. University of California Press.

Russell, Jenna, Stephanie Ebbert. 2011. The high price of school assignment. *The Boston Globe* (12 Jun. 2011).

Schneider, B., Smith, D.B., Taylor, S., & Fleenor, J. (1998). Personality and organizations: A test of the homogeneity of personality hypothesis. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 83, 462-470.

Schott Foundation for Public Education. (2008). Teachers as leaders fund. Retrieved February 4th, 2011, from <http://www.schottfoundation.org/funds/teachers-as-leaders>

Schott Foundation for Public Education. (2010). Given half a chance: the schott 50 state report on public education and black males. Cambridge, MA: Schott Foundation for Public Education.

Schott Foundation for Public Education. (2012). The urgency of now: The schott 50 state report on public education and black males. Cambridge, MA: Schott Foundation for Public Education.

Schuman, D. (1982). *Policy analysis, education, and everyday life: An empirical reevaluation of higher education in america*. Lexington, MA: D.C. Heath

Sealey-Ruiz, Y & Greene, P.E. (2011). Embracing urban youth culture in the context of education. *The Urban Review*, 43, 339-357.

Sealey-Ruiz, Y. & Lewis, C. (2011). Transforming the field of education to serve the needs of the black community: Implications for critical stakeholders. *Journal of Negro Education*, 80, 3, 187-193.

Seidman, I. (2006). *Interviewing as qualitative research: A guide for researchers in education and the social sciences*, Third Edition. New York: Teachers College Press.

Seymour, A. (2011). Education secretary urges morehouse students to serve their country by becoming teachers. Retrieved June 1st, 2012 from <http://www.morehouse.edu/news/archives/002347.html>

Simmel, G. (1950). *The Sociology of Georg Simmel*, Compiled and translated by Kurt Wolff, Glencoe, IL: Free Press.

Simpson, R. (2005). Men in non-traditional occupations: Career entry, career orientation and experience of role strain. *Gender, Work & Organization*, 12, 4, 363-380.

Smith, A. (1776). *An inquiry into the nature and causes of the wealth of nations*, edited by E. CANNAN. London: Methuen

Smith, W., Yosso, T., & Solorzano, D. (2007). "Racial primes and black misandry on historically white campuses: Toward critical race accountability in educational administration." *Educational Administration Quarterly*, 43, 559-585.

Snyder, A. R., McLaughlin, D. K., and Findeis, J. 2006. "Household composition and poverty among female-headed households with children: Differences by race and residence." *Rural Sociology*, 71 (4), 597-624.

Stake, R. E. (1995). *The art of case study research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Sum, A., Khatiwada, J., & Palma, S. (2009). *The consequences of dropping out of high school*. Boston, Massachusetts.: Center for Labor Market Studies Northeastern University.

Tilman, L. C. (2009). African american principals and the legacy of brown. In L. C. Tillman (Ed.), *The Sage handbook of African American Education*. Thousand Oaks, C.A.: Sage Publications.

The State of Washington Sentencing Guideline Commission (2005). *Recidivism of adult felons*. Olympia, Washington.: Sentencing Guideline Commission.

The U.S. Department of Justice (2007). Bureau of justice statistics: the national crime victimization survey. Washington D.C.

Tyre, P. (2006, January 30). The trouble with boys. *Newsweek*, 147(5), 44-52.

Tyson, K. Darity, W. & Castellino, D. (2005). It's not 'a black thing': Understanding the burden of acting white and other dilemmas of high achievement, *American Sociological Review*, 70, 582 – 605.

Vroom, V.H. (1966). Organizational choice: A study of pre- and post-decision making processes. *Organizational Behavior and Human Performance*, 1, (2), 212-225

Wacquant, L. (2002). From slavery to mass incarceration: Rethinking the race question in the united states. *New Left Review*, 13, 41—60.

Weaver-Hightower, M. (2003). The "boy turn" in research on gender and education. *Review of Educational Research*. 73 (4).

Western, B. (2007). *Punishment and inequality in america*. New York: Russell Sage Foundation.

Williams, C.L. (1992). The glass escalator: Hidden advantages for men in the "female" professions. *Social Problems*, 39, 253-267.

Wood, D., Kaplan, R., & McLoyd, V. C., (2007). Gender differences in the educational expectations of urban, low-income african-american youth: The role of parents and the school. *Journal of Youth and Adolescence*, 77(2), 417-427.

Wrzesniewski, A., LoBuglio, N., Dutton, J. E., & Berg, J. M. (2013). Job crafting and cultivating positive meaning and identity in work. In A. Bakker (Ed.), *Advances in Positive Organizational Psychology*. London: Emerald.

Yin, R.K.(2009). *Case study research: Design and methods*. Fourth Edition. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications Inc.

Yin. R.K. (1981). The case study crisis: Some answers. *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 26, 58-65.

Young, J. L. & James, E. H. (2001). Token majority: The work attitudes of male flight attendants. *Sex Roles*, 45, 6, 299-319.

Appendix A

Exploring the in School Experiences of Black Male Teachers

As a Black man who previously taught E/la in two secondary schools in New York City and who currently trains E/la candidates for BPS, I am interested in studying why Black male teachers stay or leave the classroom. This interest is the focus of my dissertation research.

At a college commencement ceremony in December, 2011, U.S. Secretary of Education Arne Duncan asserted: “less than 15 percent of our teachers are black or Latino. It is especially troubling that less than two percent of our nation's teachers are African-American males. Less than one in 50! It's unacceptable.”

Last spring, Superintendent Johnson sent a survey that I designed to all Black male teachers in BPS. Because of the district’s on-going efforts to increase the number of Black male teachers, I am going to interview Black male teachers at 8 schools in the district. Four schools will be elementary and four schools will be secondary.

I have given all schools and teachers a pseudonym. **All interviews will be confidential.** I would like to interview teachers once in the fall and once in the spring.

If you have any additional questions or concerns, please feel free to email me at tjb2124@columbia.edu.

Appendix B

Teacher Interview Protocol #1

Thank you for your willingness to participate in this research.

A. Introduction

- 1) What kind of school did you attend growing up? [**probe public or private?**]
- 2) Who were some of the teachers that inspired you the most? [**probe female/male; teachers' race/ethnicity**]
- 3) How did you decide to become a teacher?

B. Job Placement

- 1) Have you taught in any other schools? If so, how many?
- 2) How did it happen that you came to teach at (insert names of schools over time)?

C. School as an Organization

- 1) What subject/grade do you teach?
- 2) How does it feel to be a teacher on the faculty?
- 3) Who do you go to for curricular support?
- 4) Do you have any out of classroom responsibilities?
- 5) Describe your most memorable experience at this school? [**probe: why was this experience memorable?**]
- 6) What about this school keeps you engaged?
- 7) What about this school makes it an appealing/unappealing place to come?
 - 8) What was this school like when you began here? Is it different now?
- 9) [If applicable] As a new teacher, is your teaching assignment similar to other more experienced teachers?

D. Interactions with Colleagues

- 1) Let's talk about how your colleagues perceive your work as a teacher. Are there teachers in this school who you think really respect you? [**probe: Who are they and how do you know what they think? What do they say to you, or what**

things do they do to suggest that they respect you? Then, are there other teachers who seem to have a different opinion? How do you know that?]

2) How do you think your colleagues perceive your work around managing student behavior? *If applicable, how does it compare to your previous school?*

3) How easy or challenging is it to be yourself around colleagues? **Probe:** If you do certain things, do you think you might be perceived differently by other staff members? *If applicable, how does it compare to your previous school?*

4) Who were some of the teachers you interact with when you are not teaching? **[probe: teachers with whom you eat lunch? Teachers with whom you discuss issues not related to school?]**

E. Interactions with the Administration

1) How do you think school administrators perceive your work as a teacher? *If applicable, how does it compare to your previous school?*

2) How do you think your principal perceives your work around managing student behavior? *If applicable, how does it compare to your previous school?*

3) Do you feel comfortable going to school administrators (i.e. principals, AP, department chair) for help? **Probe:** Why/Why not? *If applicable, how does it compare to your previous school?*

F. Interactions with Students/Male Students of Color

1) What is your interaction like with your students?

2) Is student discipline an issue at your school?

3) What ways, if any, are you responsible for handling student discipline? **Probe:** How does it feel to be involved with handling issues around student discipline?

4) Do other teachers at your school express concern about the academic performance of Black & Latino male students? **[Probe:** Why do you think your colleagues' concern is less/greater than yours?]

5) How much do other teachers at your school express concern about the problematic behavior by Black & Latino male students? **[Probe:** Why do you think your colleagues' concern is less/greater than yours?]

6) How much do other teachers at your school take responsibility for talking with Black & Latino male students to help them solve personal problems? **[Probe:** Why do you think your colleagues' concern is less/greater than yours?]

G. School Demographics

- 1) What is the gender make-up of teachers at this school? *If applicable, how does it compare to your previous school?*
- 2) What is the racial make-up of teachers at this school? *If applicable, how does it compare to your previous school?*
- 3) What is the principal's gender and race? *If applicable, what was your principal's race and gender at your previous school?*

H. Retention

- 1) What were some of the factors that contributed to your decision to leave your previous school? [If applicable]
- 2) Do you intend to stay at this school next year?
- 3) What factors are influencing your decision to stay/leave?
- 4) If you had an opportunity to teach at another school in BPS, would you do so?
Probe: Why/why not?

I. Demographic Questions

- 1) I need to ask a few quick background questions before ending.
 - a. How would you describe your socio-economic status growing up? [probe: working class? Middle class? Upper-middle class?]
 - b. What is your age?
 - c. Part of my study relies upon demographic data, and so I would like to know how you would identify yourself racially. [If you would prefer, I can suggest some categories, and you can tell me which one or several apply to you.]
 - White or Caucasian
 - Black or African-American (Caribbean American...
 - Latino or Hispanic (Puerto Rican, Dominican...
 - Asian or Pacific Islander
 - American Indian or Native American
 - Bi-Racial
 - Other
 - d. what undergraduate institution did you attend?
 - e. What state certification do you hold?
- 2) How do you identify in terms of gender?
- 3) Is there anything else you wanted to share?

Appendix C Teacher Protocol #2

A. Pathway/Preparation

1. What was your major in college?
2. Would you consider yourself an above-average, average, below-average student in college? **(probe: why did you evaluate yourself this way? what factors were relevant to how you did in college?)**
3. Through what program or school did you do your teacher preparation? In what way, if at all, did it help prepare you to teach?
4. What did you find most helpful from your preparation in shaping how you teach? And, what did you find least helpful? **(probe: what were these helpful? What were they helpful for?)**
- .5. How did you learn the skills for this position?

B. Hiring

1. During your initial job search after completing your teacher training, to how many schools did you apply?
2. Of those schools where you applied and were interviewed, how many had a White principal? **(probe: how many had a principal of color? What was the race/ethnicity for those principals of color?)**
3. Which schools extended a job offer? **(probe: for those schools that did not extend a job offer, did they give a reason why?)**
4. How did you learn about the job opening at this school? **(probe: what relationship, if any, did the person who shared the announcement have with individuals at this school? What was the person's race/gender?)**
5. Why do you think your current principal hired you? **(probe: in what ways, did issues of race and gender come up during the interviewing process?)**
6. Did you visit this current school, before you started working, while school was in session? **(probe: if so, have your impressions changed of the school from then?)**

C. School as an Organization

1. Who are some of the people you trust in this school? (**probe: what do they say/do that make you trust them?**)
2. How are hiring decisions made in this school? (**probe: what role, if any, do you have in school hiring decisions? Do you interview candidates? Are you asked to speak with candidates after offers are extended?**)
- 3.
4. If you had an idea for something you think should be changed at the school, what would you do with that idea?
PROBE AS NECESSARY:
 - a. Who would you talk to about the idea?
 - b. How would you expect your idea to be received?
 - c. Can you give me an example of a time when an idea of yours was implemented beyond your own classroom?
5. How many other male teachers of color are there on the faculty? (**probe: What's their race/ethnicity? What is your relationship like with them?**)
6. How many male paraprofessionals of color are there in this school? (**probe: What's their race/ethnicity? What is your relationship like with them?**)

D. Interactions with Colleagues

1. During the last interview we spoke about your relationship with your colleagues. I want to ask you some additional information about them. What percentage of your colleagues in your department/small learning community respect your curricular expertise? [**probe: Who are they and how do you know what they think? What do they say to you, or what things do they do to suggest that they respect you? Then, are there other teachers who seem to have a different opinion? How do you know that?]**]
2. Are there teachers at this school who seem uncomfortable or just not themselves around you? (**probe: stature and/or content knowledge. Who are they and how do you know what they think? What do they say to you, or what things do they do to suggest that they are intimidated by you?**)
3. Similarly, are there teachers who you feel uncomfortable around? (**probe: who are they and what do they do to make you feel uncomfortable?**)

E. Interactions with the Administration

1. During the last interview we spoke about your relationship with administrators. I want to ask you some additional questions about them. Are there administrators in this school who inspire you (or you look up to)? (**probe: who are they? what do they do/say that you find inspiring?**)

2. Do you feel like school administrators target you to serve on committees or assume leadership positions because of your gender and/or race? (**probe: for what committees/ leadership positions have you been targeted?**) is leading... a different way of “targeted” why do you think you were chosen for that

3. Have school administrators asked you to lead any whole-school or department professional development? (**probe: If so, what was the topic for the professional development?**)

F. Small Learning Community Demographics (do you work in a team? Does it matter?)

- 1) Can you describe the SLC in which you work?
- 2) What is the gender make-up of teachers in your SLC
- 3) What is the racial make-up of teachers in your SLC?

G. Grouper Schools (Classification Specific)

1. Beyond race and gender, how are you similar to other Black male teachers at this school? (**probe: how are you different?**)
2. What have you learned from working with Black men who are from different regions of the country or the world? (**probe: What difference, if any, does it make ... is there anything challenging about that?**)
3. What have you found challenging about working with Black men who are from different regions of the country or the world?
4. Why do you think this school has been able to attract many Black male teachers? (**probe: if responsible for hiring decisions, are job offers extended to Black male teachers at the same rate for teachers in other sub-groups?**)

Is this a place that is attractive to perspective blk male teachers? Why? Does this school recruit blk male teachers?

5. How does it feel to have other Black men on the faculty? (**probe: what has it enabled you to do? What has it constrained you from doing?**) what has it allowed you to do? Are you able to do something does it stand you away?

H. Loner Schools

Has this school tried to attract more blk male teachers?

1. Why do you think this school has been unable to attract many more Black male teachers? (**probe: if responsible for hiring decisions, are job offers extended to Black male teachers at the same rate for teachers in other sub-groups?**)
2. What is it like for you to be the only blk male teacher? How does it feel to be the only Black male teacher on the faculty? (**probe: what has it enabled you to do? What has it constrained you from doing?**)

I. Experience of being a Black Male Teacher

1) How, if at all, has being [BLACK] and [MALE] influenced your:

- A) relationships & interactions with colleagues
- B) relationship with your principal
- C) relationships & interactions with students
- D) relationships & interactions with parents

2) How does being bi-racial influence your: (if applicable)

- A) relationships & interactions with colleagues
- B) relationships with your principal
- C) relationships & interactions with students
- D) relationships & interactions with parents

J. Retention

FOR #15-16 USE TABLE TENT LISTING:

<u>Students</u>	<u>Colleagues</u>	<u>Administrators</u>	<u>The Work Itself</u>
*Student progress *Student behavior *Relationships with students	*Relationships w/ colleagues * Shared values with colleagues (or lack thereof)	*Administrative leadership	*Teaching assignments *Required curriculum or instructional techniques * Opportunities (or lack of opportunities) for learning and professional growth * Instructional and

			curricular support * Opportunities (or lack of opportunities) for leadership * School-wide vision and goals, and/or action plans
--	--	--	--

1. In what way, if at all, do any of these issues affect your desire to continue working here?
 2. How do these compare to other teachers decisions to leave? How does this compare to other Black male teachers.
2. In what way, if at all, do you think these issues affect Black male teachers' decisions to leave their schools?
3. Previously, I asked you whether you were considering changing schools and you said [insert].
- a. Has that changed?
 - b. What factors are influencing your decision?
 - c. (For teachers planning to leave) What would it take to keep you at this school longer?
3. how long do you think you will be staying in this school? Would you go to another school in Boston? Or would you leave boston
- Are you considering leaving BPS to teach somewhere else?
- a. What factors are influencing your decision?
 PROBE: To what extent do job security or finances factor into your decision?
5. How long do you plan to stay in teaching?
- a. What factors are influencing your decision?
 PROBE: To what extent do job security or finances factor into your decision?
6. Ideally, where would you like to be teaching/working? [If somewhere else: Why would that be preferable to your current position? What is preventing you from making that move?]
7. To what degree, if at all, does being identified as a turnaround school affect you and your career decisions?

8. Are there any other causes for turnover (or stability) at this school that you think we should know about?

K. Bussing

1. What are your thoughts on the current change to student assignment or what many are calling the end to bussing in BPS? (**probe:** What might this do to the school? How might this affect teachers?)

L. Demographic Questions

1. If you remember, would you mind sharing your GPA with me? A, B, C, for example?
2. Did you pass your MTELs on the first try?
4. As you know, this is a study about how Black male teachers experience schools, the reasons why they decide to enter the profession and factors that influence their decision to leave. Is there anything else you wanted to share? Or anything else you think I should be aware of about you or include in this study?

Appendix D
Contact Summary Form

School:

Researcher: Travis Bristol

Contact:

Type (Interview? Observation? Unstructured visit?):

Date:

*What is the best way to reach this contact?

*Where/when did the meeting occur?

Is there any other logistical info we need to know about this contact?

*What were the main issues or themes raised by this fieldwork? Do you have any particular impressions or observations?

Which interview or research questions were addressed most meaningfully and why?

What hypotheses, speculations, or unresolved questions were raised for you?

What (if anything) do we need to ask/look for in round #2?

Appendix E:
Cross-Walk Table Showing the Alignment of Data Points and Concepts to Research Questions

Research Question	Concept	Data collection Instrument
<p>1. What are Black male teachers' pathways into the profession?</p> <p>2. Are there differences for teachers working in schools employing just one Black male teacher versus schools with larger numbers of Black male teachers?</p> <p>3. What are Black male teachers' experiences with organizational dynamics of performance expectations, social boundaries, and role encapsulation?</p>	<p>Gender of School Principal Race of School Principal Performance Pressure Boundary Heightening Role Entrapment.</p>	<p>Interview Protocol questions:</p> <p>A.1 B.1, B.2 H.1, H.2, H.3, H.4 C.2, C.3, C.4, C.5, C.6 D.1, D.2, D.3, D.4 E.1, E.2, E.3 F.1, F.2, F.3, F.4, F.5, F.6</p> <p>Field-notes</p>
<p>2) How do these organizational contexts and experiences affect teachers' plans to stay in their schools or in teaching?</p>	<p>Theory of Numbers and Group Composition * Racial/Ethnic Minorities in the Numerical Minority</p>	<p>Interview Protocol questions:</p> <p>C.3, C.4 E.1, E.2, E.3 F.1, F.2, F.3, F.4, F.5, F.6 G.1, G.2, G.3 I.3</p> <p>Field-notes</p>